



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING

MONDAY
MARCH 11, 2019
10:00 A.M.

1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM
375 BEALE STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. **CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**
PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members. The Council Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 29, 2018**

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of October 29, 2018.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, the public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Council meetings are posted at the Air District, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at least 72 hours before a meeting.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit www.baaqmd.gov/ADVagendas at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain error and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.

4. **DISCUSSION ON ELECTION OF OFFICERS** **J. McKay/4629**
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will discuss and consider the election of Council Chair and Vice Chair.

5. **PRESENTATION OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY (EPA) INTEGRATED SCIENCE ASSESSMENT FOR PARTICULATE MATTER (EXTERNAL REVIEW DRAFT)** **J. McKay/4629**
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will receive a presentation on the draft Integrated Science Assessment for particulate matter from Jason Sacks, Epidemiologist with the US EPA.

6. **PROPOSED PARTICULATE MATTER SYMPOSIUM** **J. McKay/4629**
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

Staff will describe plans for a symposium on the topic of particulate matter.

7. **DELIBERATION ON QUESTIONS RELATED TO PARTICULATE MATTER** **J. McKay/4629**
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will deliberate on questions related to Particulate Matter.

8. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

9. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

10. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, an opportunity is provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are typically limited to three minutes each.

11. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

12. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the Call of the Chair.

13. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Advisory Council” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Council meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Council at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District’s policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District’s Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT ANTICIPATED MEETINGS

MARCH 2019

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	6	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Mtg.	Monday	11	10:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Public Engagement Committee	Thursday	14	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee	Monday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee	Wednesday	20	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Friday	22	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room
Board of Directors Technology Implementation Office Steering Committee	Monday	25	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Wednesday	27	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

APRIL 2019

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	3	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Personnel Committee	Friday	5	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Public Engagement Committee	Thursday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee	Monday	22	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109

APRIL 2019

Board of Directors Legislative Committee

Wednesday

24

10:30 a.m.

**1st Floor, Yerba Buena
Room #109**

**Board of Directors Mobile Source
Committee**

Thursday

25

9:30 a.m.

1st Floor Board Room

VJ – 3/4/19 – 1:55 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: February 27, 2019

Re: Approval of the Minutes of October 29, 2018

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of October 29, 2018.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of October 29, 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of October 29, 2018

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of October 29, 2018

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, October 29, 2018

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:18 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Jane Long, and Dr. Linda Rudolph.

Absent: Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, Dr. Tim Lipman, and Dr. Gina Solomon.

Also Present: Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 19, 2018

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to approve the Minutes of July 19, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Long, and Rudolph.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Borenstein, Lipman, and Solomon.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed complaints from the public regarding the Bay Area Air Quality Management District’s (Air District) current practice of agendizing Public Comment on Agenda Items before staff presents said items, as well as the Air District’s current practice of consolidating the public’s comments regarding multiple agenda items into one opportunity.

4. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT IMPLEMENTATION OF ASSEMBLY BILL 617

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Elizabeth Yura, Community Health Protection Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Assembly Bill (AB) 617: Community Health Protection Program*, including: AB 617 Program components; community identification and prioritization; Richmond Monitoring Plan; West Oakland Action Plan; build capacity; incentives; statewide inventory; control technology; and what’s next.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the public’s desire to be involved with the development of AB 617 processes created and implemented by the Air District, rather than being asked to merely give input on Air District processes that have been finalized internally, the suggestion that the Air District make a concentrated effort to strengthen its relationship with the public as early as the point of assessing the needs of a community, the suggestion that the Air District establish a streamlined relationship-building approach that can be applied to future communities, and the suggestion that Air District staff maintain an inventory of outcomes resulting from collaborations as a learning tool; how the existence of the coal terminal in Richmond could affect the potential coal terminal planned for Oakland, and the need for these two communities to remain in contact with each other regarding how to abate and prevent health impacts and ensure that the best monitoring practices are being implemented; the timelines for Richmond Monitoring Plan, West Oakland Plan, and Best Available Retrofit Control Technology requirement implementation; defining success metrics; whether the Air District tracks census-tract, health-outcome data across all nine Bay Area counties; and the suggestion that Air District staff explore ways in which to provide opportunities for the Council to engage with the public regarding air pollution and health outcomes, as a way to enhance building capacity.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. STRATEGIC TARGETS FOR ASSEMBLY BILL 617 IMPLEMENTATION (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling, who gave the staff presentation overview; metric/goal options: actions

taken, incremental or absolute concentration, concentration, and exposure or health outcomes; air pollution is one of many factors that contribute to health inequities; health departments: indicators to consider; West Oakland approach, technical assessment, and pollutants included in the assessment; identify local sources; add regional contribution; West Oakland options; examples; questions; and resources.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the suggestion of comparing predicted outcomes of each stage of a process with actual results; the US Environmental Protection Agency’s (EPA’s) Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program’s ability to simulate health outcomes, and the lack of information on the effects of black carbon; which health outcomes are anticipated to be immediate versus long-term; whether community capacity building could lead to the increase of youth coming to work at the Air District; ways to encourage polluting facilities to participate in building capacity within their communities and track participation; what defines ‘acceptable Particulate Matter (PM)_{2.5} risk’, whether the Air District is communicating those numbers to the impacted communities in a meaningful way that the public can understand, and the public’s perception of risk; anticipated research on health outcomes that could be quantitated with respect to changes that may result from reductions in emissions; how the disbanding of the EPA’s Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee may prompt the need for an independent review by the State of California in tandem with the National Ambient Air Quality Standards’ five-year review of PM; and the difficulty in defining “health equity”.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

The Council recessed at 12:33 p.m., and resumed at 1:18 p.m.

6. AIR SENSOR INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE UPDATE (ITEM 5)

Dr. McKay introduced Eric Stevenson, Director of Meteorology and Measurement, who gave the staff presentation *Update on the Air Sensor International Conference*, including: statistics; topics covered; adoption challenges; continued challenges; testing; continued growth; vendors and exhibitors; worldwide participation; big takeaways; and next steps.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the suggestion for a routine monthly or quarterly opportunity in which members of the public monitor their local air quality with personal measuring devices and then compare their data to a central reliable source (such as the Air District’s data), to increase awareness of how weather conditions affect their sensors; the Air District’s upcoming collaboration with the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) and California Air Resources Board (CARB) regarding the creation of an inventory of air sensors and their measurement accuracy, and the creation of a publicly-accessible set of application program interfaces in which air sensor manufacturers are involved; the anticipation of inequity issues with the public’s access to emerging sensor technology, and how this technology can help or hinder the Air District’s Community Health Protection Program; how the Air District responds to communities and explains averaging time and health impacts when significant incidents (high

readings) occur; and whether the conference included mobile monitoring of methane emissions, and older versus newer natural gas-detection technologies.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

7. DISCUSSION ON ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Dr. McKay explained that California’s Health and Safety Code lacks guidance regarding the frequency of the election of Council Officers, and that Air District staff welcomed discussion of various policies, but not action, at today’s meeting from the Council members that are present. He added that the current Council Officers were elected three years ago.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether three years is an appropriate amount of time for a Council Officer term; and the request that all Council members be present for the next discussion and subsequent recommendation.

Following the Council’s discussion of this item, Dr. McKay announced that this item will be included on the Council’s next meeting agenda for further discussion.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

8. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT

Chair Hayes discussed an item that had been agendized at the Council’s July 19, 2018 meeting, *Update on the Air District’s Diesel Particulate Matter Emissions Reduction Strategy*. He summarized that the Council had authorized him to draft language for a statement to be presented to the Board of Directors on August 1, 2018, reflecting the Council’s position on the reduction of diesel emissions, and displayed slides that explained the Council’s position on the matter. Chair Hayes said that the Board seemed attentive when receiving his presentation, and that he was pleased to see so many people and jurisdictions sign up for the Air District’s “Diesel-Free by ‘33” pledge.

Chair Hayes and Vice Chair Kleinman gave their reports on the Air & Waste Management Association’s 111th Annual Conference and Exhibition that took place in June in Hartford, Connecticut.

9. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, who was absent, Dr. McKay reported that Air District staff will report back to the Council about the Air District’s affiliate events with the 2018 Global Climate Action Summit in San Francisco in

September, including United Cities Against Greenhouse Gasses: Diesel-Free by '33, and Climate Tech Marketplace.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

11. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

In response to the Air District's request for advisory input on long-term strategic targets for AB 617 implementation, Vice Chair Kleinman said that he would like the Council to create a sub-committee, or at least generate a collective report, to address the issue. He requested that this item be brought back for further consideration at the Council's next meeting. Air District staff said that it welcomes the Council's input, as it will inform the Air District's policies for AB 617 communities.

12. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the call of the Chair.

13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:36 p.m.

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: February 27, 2019

Re: Discussion on Election of Officers

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Per Health and Safety Code Section 40267, the council shall select a chairperson and vice chairperson and such other officers as it deems necessary.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Justine Buenaflor
Reviewed by: Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: February 27, 2019

Re: Presentation of the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Integrated Science
Assessment for Particulate Matter (External Review Draft)

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

The Council will receive a presentation on the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Integrated Science Assessment for Particulate Matter (External Review Draft) from Jason Sacks, Epidemiologist with the United States EPA.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: February 27, 2019

Re: Proposed Particulate Matter Symposium

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Air District staff propose that the Advisory Council (Council) convene a Symposium on the topic of Particulate Matter (PM) for its October meeting. Recent work by the Council has included a focus on the need for health focused attainment guidelines beyond those already in effect.

While a federal review of existing guidelines would be welcome, the need for timely action suggests that the Air District's constituents, and perhaps a broader audience, would be served by the convening of expert and interested parties. Participants would include those who may have been convened at the federal level, local health officials, and community groups.

The Symposium would have goals of educating attendees, reviewing the complexities of PM characterization, reviewing current Air District actions on PM, and setting the stage for possible Air District actions such as establishing guidelines beyond those already in effect at federal, state and local levels.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: February 27, 2019

Re: Deliberation on Questions Related to Particulate Matter

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

The Advisory Council (Council) has considered the need for health focused attainment guidelines beyond those already in effect. The Air District seeks to investigate such possible guidelines with input from the Council. Deliberations in the March 11, 2019, meeting are intended to be followed by further deliberations in the summer meeting, with results providing input to the Particulate Matter (PM) Symposium in October.

Staff invites Council deliberations on the following questions:

- Are current standards sufficiently health protective?
- What health inequities exist relative to PM?
- What metrics can be used to address these questions?
 - Concentration?
 - Exposure?
 - Risk (complexities of PM characterization)?
 - Health Outcomes?
- What are the most important actions that can be taken now? And in the future?

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay