

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, July 29, 2019

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. Chair Hayes acknowledged the public's previous request of providing additional opportunities for public comment on agenda items, and said that during this meeting, the public would be able to comment during each item, following staff presentations, rather than save all comments on agenda matters for a single opportunity during the meeting.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, and Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon.

Absent: Members Drs. Tim Lipman and Jane Long.

Also Present: Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 11, 2019

Council Comments

Chair Hayes requested that the following revision (underlined) be made to the Draft March 11, 2019 Minutes:

Item 8 – CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

He will be giving a report on the Council's activities to the Air District's Board of Directors' Executive Committee meeting on March 20, 2019, and the full Board meeting on April 3, 2019.

Council Action

Professor Borenstein made a motion, seconded by Dr. Solomon, to **approve** the Minutes of March 11, 2019 as amended; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Borenstein, Hayes, Rudolph, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Lipman, Long, Kleinman.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments were given by Greg Karras, Communities for a Better Environment.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether there is evidence that pollution trading has moved Particulate Matter (PM) from higher-income, or less-densely populated areas, to lower-income, disadvantaged communities; whether records of trades of particulate emissions credits are publicly-accessible; and the status of the trading program.

NOTED PRESENT: Vice Chair Kleinman was noted present at 10:20 a.m.

4. **DISCUSSION ON ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

Chair Hayes reiterated his desire to see a variety of Councilmembers serve as Officers (Chair and Vice Chair) on the Council and stated that he had requested that Air District staff propose options for a formal Council Officers selection process and term limits.

At this point, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *Discussion on Election of Officers*, containing a proposed policy for the Council to adopt.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed potential responsibilities of the Chair and Vice Chair; the need for a more frequent Council presence at Air District Board meetings, and who should represent the Council when presenting to the Board; the desire for gender equity among Council Officers; length of term limits and potential challenges regarding re-appointments; the possibility of the Council Officers having annual term limits, despite the term limits for general Councilmembers; and the request that no vote be taken until all Councilmembers meet at a future Council meeting.

Council Action

The consensus of the Council was to have an annual election of Council Officers with a three-year term limit (per Officer position). Chair Hayes said that this item will be continued until all seven voting Councilmembers are present.

5. PRESENTATION ON COMMUNITY-SCALE ASSESSMENTS OF AIR POLLUTION IMPACTS TO SUPPORT ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617

Dr. McKay introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling, who gave the staff presentation *Community-Scale Assessments of Air Pollution Impacts to Support Assembly Bill) 617*, including: overview; Bay Area PM_{2.5} trending down; AB 617 communities; why West Oakland; modeling-based technical assessment; West Oakland detailed emissions inventory; community-scale emissions inventory; PM_{2.5} regional modeling - primary and secondary contributions; how much is local (PM_{2.5} and cancer risk); impact zones; plan goals – remove air quality disparities; cancer risk; local impacts; PM_{2.5} source apportionments; risk assessment approach for PM_{2.5} and draft test cases; assessing impacts for large stationary sources; and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed uncertainties in the Air District's community-scale emissions inventory's estimations; whether sources that are not currently included in the inventory will be included in the future; the amount of Diesel PM (DPM) emissions that are sourced from construction activity; anticipated federal assessments of the toxicity of formaldehyde; contributing factors to the generation of road dust and which types of vehicles produce the most road dust; the largest sources of on-road vehicle tailpipe PM_{2.5} emissions; *Federal Research Action Plan on Recycled Tire Crumb Used on Playing Fields and Playgrounds* by the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and the study of synthetic turf's impact on human health by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment; the effectiveness and feasibility of particular dust mitigation strategies; anticipated results from the West Oakland Community Action Plan (emission reduction targets of individual neighborhoods); how the Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program (BenMAP) considers census block population characteristics and the fact that mortality rates vary among different segments of a given population; and the request for a future presentation on the history of emissions trading.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. UPDATE ON WILDFIRE RESPONSE EFFORTS

Dr. McKay introduced Tracy Lee, Compliance and Enforcement Manager, Alan Abbs, Legislative Officer, Lisa Fasano, Communications Officer, and Judy Cutino, Health Officer, who gave the joint staff presentation *Update on Wildfire Response Efforts*, including: overview; local and regional PM from wildfires; 2017 North Bay Fires; 2018 Camp Fire; Wildfire Air Quality Response program; rule development; legislative initiatives; grants and incentives; partnership goals with the American Red Cross; regional partnerships; community information and resources; and health effects of PM and wildfire smoke.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the months during which the Winter Spare the Air program is currently in effect; the proposed 2019 rule amendment-adoption schedule for burning regulations (Rules 5 and 6-3); the need for improvements to/retrofitting of existing hospital ventilation systems; eligible facilities included in AB 836, and whether State funding alone could cover the estimated cost of this bill's implementation; the feasibility of deploying portable filtration units during wildfire smoke impacts to the region; the efficacy of N95 respirators during wildfires; the Air District's opinion of low-cost air quality monitors; the concern that some people may not want to go to shelters during wildfires, especially individuals who may be undocumented; an anticipated increase of backup generator purchases due to Pacific Gas & Electric's power shut downs during wildfire incidents; the suggestion to circulate wildfire education, messaging, and guidance to residents on a continual, year-round basis (as opposed to only during wildfire incidents), especially in vulnerable populations; and the collaboration of air districts, the State, and the Federal government regarding the development of criteria for curtailing outdoor school and university activities.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

The Council recessed at 12:35 p.m., and resumed at 1:15 p.m.

7. DISCUSSION REGARDING PARTICULATE MATTER SYMPOSIUM

Chair Hayes gave a presentation that he presented to the Air District's Board of Directors on April 3, 2019, focusing on the need for public health-focused attainment guidelines more stringent than those that currently exist. Then, Dr. McKay gave the staff presentation *Discussion Regarding Particulate Matter Symposia*, including: goals; meetings; October 2019; December 2019; February 2020; and April 2020.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed how the original concept of a one-day symposium transitioned into a series of four symposia, spread out over eight months, whether this new format may present a challenge for stakeholders who wish to attend, whether the new schedule should be compressed, and which content should be discussed/activities completed on which days; the efficacy of having keynote speakers at the symposia; the request for an overview at each of the four meetings within the symposia, including: data from the EPA's Integrated Science Assessment for PM; targets the Air District would like to set; ways to achieve those goals; gaps in current Air District regulation; how to reduce risk of wildfire exposure; and a framework of what the Air District is currently doing and what else it could be doing; which party (Air District staff or the Council) would be developing PM recommendations at the symposia; the benefits of having a "California PM Standard" and how air districts can encourage the California EPA and California Air Resources Board to design and establish such air quality guidelines; the request

for speakers who can address the benefits of lower standards and how that can be done without imposing burdens on other communities; how the World Health Organization could emphasize the importance of PM beyond just the Bay Area; whether the Air District has an explicit date by which it expects new standards to be set; the importance of quantifying health benefits that may result from reductions in air pollution; the suggestion that the Advisory Council prepares a Statement of Principles on health effects of PM at low levels to be voted on in October; suggestions for speakers, including: Dr. Henry Christopher Frey, former Chairperson of the EPA's recently-disbanded Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee, Dr. Julian Marshall, University of Minnesota, Dr. Maria Neira, World Health Organization Director, Dr. John Balmes, University of California at San Francisco, Janet Currie, Princeton, and Dr. Reed Walker and Wolfram Schlenker, University of California at Berkeley; the significance of PM_{2.5} having been officially designated by the EPA as a causal agent for cardiovascular disease; how the Council members, as an ad-hoc committee, may correspond with one another between Council meetings, without violating the Ralph M. Brown Act; and the request to advance both the Council's actions and Air District regulation development in tandem so that the Board may be as equipped and efficient as possible when considering new or amended regulations.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

8. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Hayes and Vice Chair Kleinman reported on their experience at the Air and Waste Management Conference Association's 112th Annual Conference in Quebec City, Canada, and said that as the 2020 conference will take place in San Francisco, the Council will host a PM discussion there, based on its findings.

9. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, reported the following:

- During this Summer Spare the Air season, seven Spare the alerts were issued.
- Upcoming Air District rulemakings will target reductions in methane and PM emissions.
- One of the Air District's current priorities is to implement Assembly Bill 617 (Community Air Protection Program), to help eliminate health disparities.
- The Air District has also prioritized the mitigation of the impacts of wildfires.
- The Air District has also prioritized its Climate Protection Planning Program.
- The Air District's Proposed Fiscal Year Ending 2020 Budget was adopted (on June 5, 2019.)

10. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

11. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

12. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, October 28, 2019, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

13. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 2:57 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hirtzka

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards