

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Tuesday, May 12, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Member Dr. Gina Solomon.

Also Present: None.

NOTED PRESENT: Ex-Officio Advisory Council member, Rod Sinks, was noted present at 9:02 a.m.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 9, 2019

Council Comments

Prof. Borenstein requested that the minutes reflect that he left at noon.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Prof. Borenstein, to **approve** the Minutes of December 9, 2019 **as amended**; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Borenstein, Hayes, Kleinman Lipman, Sinks.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Long, Rudolph, Solomon.

3. PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) SYMPOSIUM OVERVIEW

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *PM Symposium Overview*, showing a proposed timeline of PM Symposium events.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association, Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether action was needed for this item; the request for an updated schedule as a footnote in the Executive Summary of the document "*Advisory Council Meeting Summary: Bay Area Air Quality Management District Update on Current and Emerging Efforts on Particulate Matter*," due to COVID-19 schedule changes; a spelling error on page 27 of the aforementioned document; a disagreement regarding which units should be applied in the first full paragraph in parentheses on page 28 of the aforementioned document; the suggestion that the Council keeps a working version of the answers to the focus questions originally posed at the October PM Symposium to panelists, concerning PM health effects, exposures, and risks; whether Air District staff has any updates from the Air District's Aclima study regarding source apportionment; and the suggestion of including the sentence, "The best available evidence suggests that reducing from 12 to 8 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ will reduce mortality risk by <value>" in one or more places in the draft discussion questions and answers revised by Chair Hayes and Dr. Solomon.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

4. COMMUNITY PARTICULATE MATTER DISCUSSION OVERVIEW

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, explained that the Air District had intended to host a community-focused meeting in March at which community representatives could discuss PM regulation and strategies with Air District staff. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, that meeting was cancelled. Mr. Nudd explained that a community design team worked with the Air District in preparation for the March meeting, and he introduced two of those team members, Jed Holtzman of 350 Bay Area, and Ladonna Williams of All Positives Possible, who each presented on this item. The other members of the community design team served as panelists during this item.

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Rudolph was noted present at 10:00 am, and Dr. Long was noted present at 10:26 a.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins; and Dr. David Bezanson.

Council Comments

The Council and presenters discussed what the community design team's priorities are and what would the community like to see happen resulting from the team's discussions with the Air District.

Panelist Comments

Dr. Ashley McLure, primary care physician in Oakland, emphasized the mortality rates in hospitals located in communities with high cumulative exposure to PM, and urged the Air District to prioritize the needs of frontline communities, protect the most vulnerable members of the public, and make PM standards and regulations more stringent, while encouraging people to transition to cleaner sources of power.

Mr. Nadel requested that the Air District designs parallel strategies that address both overall (regional) public health, and the health of frontline communities that bear the immediate impacts of local sources. He also said that the Air District's risk assessment model needs to be strengthened, considering not only cumulative health impacts, but impacts from multiple pollutants and sources.

Ken Szutu of the Vallejo Citizen Air Monitoring Network emphasized the need for a stronger Enforcement division at the Air District, to ensure that Air District regulations are being properly implemented and observed. He also inquired about the Air District's protocol during incidents at Air District-permitted facilities that result in fires or explosions.

Katherine Funes from New Voices Are Rising explained that the students who participate in her organization's efforts are primarily of color, whose families live in frontline communities, and that she is concerned that policy makers cannot relate to those families' experiences. She requested more stringent enforcement over and consequences for polluters.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT PARTICULATE MATTER POTENTIAL POLICY STRATEGIES

Dr. McKay introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, & Modeling, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Air District Particulate Matter Potential Policy Strategies*, including: major sources of PM_{2.5} in the Bay Area; major sources of PM_{2.5} in West Oakland; PM_{2.5} in West Oakland versus the Bay Area; current and potential actions; gaps in authority to regulate PM; and reducing health impacts of fine PM.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Steve Rosenblum, 350 Silicon Valley; Dr. David Bezanson, Silicon Valley resident; Dr. Ashley McClure; and Pat Dodson, Vallejo resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the importance of maintaining focus on tailpipe emissions; In addition, whether road dust is as toxic as emissions from vehicle tailpipes; whether the Air District has the authority to set/impose higher fines; the toxicity of (different types of) road dust; the need to identify the most significant solution for reducing PM (regionally and locally) as quickly as possible, and how the Air District and/or Council push the state to make that happen; the importance and difficulties of conducting retrospective analyses of air quality impacts from facilities that re-start operations after having been shut down (due to the COVID-19 pandemic) in order to look for impacts consistent with the Air District's emissions inventories; how sports venues and distribution centers are regulated by the Air District; and interest in approaching PM as a toxin.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

Chair Hayes reported the following:

- The Air District has prepared a panel for the Air and Waste Management Association's 113th Annual conference (which will be virtual) at the end of June 2020. The panel is entitled "Developing a Path Forward for PM_{2.5} Regulation in the Bay Area" and will be moderated by District Counsel (and the Association's current President-Elect), Brian Bunger. Mr. Bunger added that this panel may be live and may be able to take live questions but may have to be pre-recorded, and that he needs to have the names of participating Air District speakers confirmed by May 18th, 2020.
- Air District staff provided the Council with two research papers that were published prior to peer-review. The first, from the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, investigated whether exposure to PM_{2.5} is associated with increased risk of COVID-19 mortality in the US. The second, from the University of Bologna, addresses the preliminary evidence of SARS-CoV-2 RNA genetic matter found on particulate matter filters. The Council requested a date by which comments from the Council are due to Air District staff.

7. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

This item was waived.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments, received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Ms. Buenaflor, were submitted by Martha Hawthorne; Rosario Cervantes; and David Page.

9. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the conclusion of the meeting, it was announced that the next meeting would take place at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Friday, July 31, 2020, at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 12:43 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hirtzka
Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards