

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Friday, July 31, 2020

*An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at*

*<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>*

**This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.**

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Member Dr. Jane Long.

Also Present: None.

### **2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS**

The Council was to recognize Professor Severin Borenstein who resigned after serving for five years on the Council. Professor Borenstein was unable to attend, so Chair Hayes said that this item will be postponed until Professor Borenstein can attend a meeting (virtually) to be recognized.

#### **Public Comments**

No requests received.

#### **Committee Comments**

None.

### 3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY 12, 2020

#### Council Comments

Chair Hayes requested that the following revisions in red be made to the Council Comments section of Item #3 (Particulate Matter Symposium Overview) of the proposed Minutes of May 12, 2020:

*“The Council and staff discussed whether action was needed for this item; the request for an updated schedule~~d~~ as a footnote in the Executive Summary of the document “Advisory Council Meeting Summary: Bay Area Air Quality Management District Update on Current and Emerging Efforts on Particulate Matter,” due to COVID-19 schedule changes; a spelling error on page 27 of the aforementioned document; a disagreement regarding which units~~s~~ should be applied in the first full paragraph in parentheses on page 28 of the aforementioned document...”*

#### Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Ex-Officio member Sinks, to **approve** the Minutes of May 12, 2020 **as amended**; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman Lipman, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Long.

### 4. REGULATED INDUSTRY PERSPECTIVES REGARDING PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) MEASURES

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Frances Keeler, Vice President of the California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance, and Dr. Julie E. Goodman, Principal at Gradient, both of whom represent the regulated industry and gave presentations to help inform discussion on particulate matter reduction strategies.

#### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Janet Johnson, Sunflower Alliance; Ladonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Todd Snyder, San Francisco resident; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; Ken Szutu, Vallejo Citizen Air Monitoring Network; Charles Davidson, Hercules resident; Sharon Shearer, PBF Energy; and Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area.

#### Committee Comments

The Committee and presenters discussed the request for an economic evaluation to determine both the greatest cost-effective PM<sub>2.5</sub> reductions and potential health benefits; causation versus associations/correlations; the pace at which the Advisory Council should finalize its proposed action to the Air District, even while questions remain; whether to weigh the cost of PM-reducing measures on industry against the cost of improved health care benefit for those impacted by PM; how to determine a PM threshold for some members of the population at

various concentrations; outdoor versus indoor PM exposure; differing opinions as to whether PM causes health effects at ambient levels; and the questioning of a presenter's objectiveness as to the interpretation of the data.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

### **5. BAY AREA PARTICULATE MATTER MODELING-BASED ASSESSMENTS AND NEXT STEPS**

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) of Policy, introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling, who gave the staff presentation *Bay Area PM Modeling-Based Assessment and Next Steps*, including: overview; recent PM assessments; West Oakland Community Action Plan; regional-scale and community-scale modeling from 2017; block-by-block; unequal impacts: PM<sub>2.5</sub> across West Oakland; impact zones; targets and source contributions for PM<sub>2.5</sub>; impact per ton: PM<sub>2.5</sub> in West Oakland; scenario tool; large industrial sources; Chevron Richmond Refinery; modeling study; Chevron PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration impacts by area and residents exposed; PM<sub>2.5</sub> exposures by race/ethnicity; next steps; and summary.

#### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Kevin Olson, Chevron; Sharon Shearer, PBF Energy; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Charles Davidson, Hercules resident; Todd Osterberg, Chevron; and Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Clean Air Health Alliance.

#### Committee Comments

The Council and staff discussed which Bay Area neighborhoods are included in the Air District's 2030 and 2025 target levels of PM<sub>2.5</sub>; the feasibility of modeling point source contributions to PM in Richmond; whether the Air District's analyses are weighted for the toxicity of the pollutants from given sources; the comparison of PM impact from passenger and heavy-duty vehicles; and the amount of secondary PM<sub>2.5</sub> generated from all sources at the Chevron refinery.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

### **6. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER STRATEGY AND NEXT STEPS**

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. Cognizant of the Particulate Matter Symposium timeline, which began in October 2019, and the Council's meeting schedule for the remainder of 2020, Council Chairperson, Stan Hayes, displayed a chart of potential strategies to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District's Board of Directors at the end of the year. This chart also included the Council's framework for

evaluating PM reduction strategies and its PM reduction statement. Deliberations will continue at the upcoming Council meeting.

### **Public Comments**

Public comments received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, were submitted by Kimberly Ronen, Valero.

### **Committee Comments**

The Council discussed design values (ug/m3) for each of the 16 different monitoring stations in the Bay Area that are comparable to the concentration level of the standard to assess attainment; the fact that although the frequency of wildfires is unpredictable, PM from wildfire smoke is a serious contributor to health effects; which parts of the Bay Area have attained current federal annual PM<sub>2.5</sub> National Ambient Air Quality Standards; whether the Air District could attain even more stringent levels of PM<sub>2.5</sub>, such as 8 or 10 ug/m3; whether PM localized hot-spot areas may experience PM levels significantly higher than their community-average level; the pace at which the Air District should take maximal feasible action regarding PM reduction strategies; lower-income populations with higher long-term PM exposure who are more susceptible to COVID-19; and whether PM reduction strategies should consider emission reduction measures for both primary PM and secondary PM formed by photochemical processes.

### **Council Action**

None; receive and file.

#### **7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 9)**

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, and Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

#### **8. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT (ITEM 7)**

Chair Hayes reported the following:

- He thanked Brian Bunger, District Counsel, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, Vice Chair Kleinman, and Dr. H. Christopher Frey of North Carolina State University for serving as panelists at the Air and Waste Management Association's 113<sup>th</sup> Annual (virtual) Conference, where they discussed "Developing a Path Forward for PM<sub>2.5</sub> Regulation in the Bay Area".
- He presented "Particulate Matter Symposium Status Report" to the Air District's Board of Directors on July 15, 2020.

#### **9. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO (ITEM 8)**

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. McKay thanked the Council for driving much conversation at the Air District and announced that a recruitment to address the current Council members' two-year terms members will be forthcoming.

**10. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

Ex-Officio member Sinks thanked the Council members and Air District staff who presented at the Air and Waste Management Association's 113<sup>th</sup> Annual (virtual) Conference, which was held at the end of June.

**11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the conclusion of the meeting, it was announced that though the next meeting was tentatively scheduled for Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., the next meeting would be held at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Friday, October 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 1:11 p.m.

*/S/ Marcy Hiratzka*

Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards