

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, November 9, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: None.

Also Present: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 9, 2020

Council Comments

Dr. Solomon observed that the minutes did not capture the content of the public comments, which she had hoped to see, for context. Chair Hayes requested that the transcript of the October 9, 2020 meeting be sent to all Council members.

Council Action

Dr. Lipman made a motion, seconded by Dr. Long, to **approve** the Minutes of October 9, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rudolph.

3. **DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY**

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. The Council further refined and prioritized a list of findings, framework for evaluating PM reduction strategies, and recommended actions to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District's Board of Directors meeting at the end of the year.

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Rudolph was noted present at 9:39 a.m.

The Council recessed at 11:04 a.m. and resumed at 11:16 a.m.

The Council recessed at 12:24 p.m. and resumed at 12:31 p.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the fact that there is not one, universal reduction strategy that will address multiple PM source categories; the importance of monitoring PM precursors; the importance of addressing both localized and cumulative PM health risks, especially during the Air District's permitting process; the need to encourage building electrification in new and existing construction, especially in disadvantaged communities; evaluating the efficacy of sulfur reduction in refinery fuel gas; the importance of reducing vehicle miles traveled in order to reduce PM from road dust, brake, and tire wear, and vehicle exhaust; consideration of re-establishing a partnership with the US Environmental Protection Agency regarding a lower ambient PM standard; the need to evaluate the technical and economic feasibility of PM regulations before attempting to implement all options for control that exist; whether improving indoor air quality should be a priority of the Air District; whether to rank the Council's recommended actions by priority (to the Board), or just categorize them; the need for improved air monitoring practices and data collection; whether the Air District requires authority to create emission reduction targets (versus standards); the Council's desire that the Air District seeks legislative authority to establish a standard for PM_{2.5} (potentially 8 µg/m³); the fact that more stringent National Ambient Air Quality Standards would be more health protective; the need to remember that exposures vary substantially across communities; and the fact that wildfire smoke increases PM_{2.5} levels substantially above the proposed 8 µg/m³ ambient PM standard.

Chair Hayes said that Council members would be individually sent the revised document that was wordsmithed at the meeting, and that Council members may have one last opportunity to deliberate on it, at another Council meeting to be scheduled prior to December 16, 2020. Chair Hayes also asked Council members to submit comments to him on the full Draft Advisory Council Report to be submitted to the Air District Board of Directors as soon as possible.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

4. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)**

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

5. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT (ITEM 4)**

Chair Hayes reported that he presented on the status of the Council's PM Strategy Report at the Board of Director's Executive Committee on October 21, 2020.

6. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (ITEM 5)**

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for their time and contributions to the ongoing Particulate Matter deliberation.

7. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

(Ex-Officio member) Board Chair Sinks extended the Board's appreciation of the Council's time on its PM Strategy Report that has been under development. He said he hopes to see the Council members at the December 16, 2020 joint meeting of the Board and Council.

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the conclusion of the meeting, Chair Hayes said that there will be a joint Board/Advisory Council meeting on December 16, 2020 at 10:00 a.m. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Thursday, December 3, 2020 at 2:00 p.m. via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newson.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 1:53 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards