

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Thursday, December 3, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 2:02 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: None.

Also Present: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 9, 2020

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Dr. Rudolph made a motion, seconded by Dr. Lipman, to **approve** the Minutes of November 9, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: None.

3. REVIEW DRAFT PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT

The Council concluded its deliberations on reducing fine Particulate Matter in the Bay Area and finalized its recommended measures to further protect public health, which will be presented to the Air District's Board of Directors on December 16, 2020 at a joint Board of Directors and Advisory Council meeting. This included a list of findings, framework for evaluating PM reduction strategies, and recommended actions to reduce Particulate Matter.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; Rhoda Fry, Cupertino resident; and Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident.

The public expressed frustration, claiming that the Council's most recent version of its Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report (Draft Report) did not include public input that had been submitted. The public urged the Council not to recommend the Draft Report be presented to the Board of Directors until public input was added back into the report.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the conversation had by Council members who met to discuss the Draft Report after the November 9, 2020 meeting; a request to ask the members of the environmental justice community to outline the items they had brought forward but believed to be missing from the draft version of the report. The distinction between *PM_{2.5} exposures, emissions, and concentrations*; the Council's decision to suggest that the Air District set a "guideline ambient *PM^{2.5} target*" of 8 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, versus 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, and the suggestion that any strategic action plans that are designed for communities reflect the target. The Council's belief that controlling emissions in local impacted areas is of primary importance; the fact that the Council's believes that an anticipated increase in wildfire PM justifies greater efforts to reduce controllable sources of PM, in order to further mitigate overall health risk; the Council's acknowledgment of ultrafine particles not being adequately monitored; the Council's suggestion for the Air District to focus on racial justice when evaluating PM reduction strategies; the Council's recommendation of designing PM reduction strategies that control the cumulative impact of regional, local, and localized hot-spot sources, including emissions reduction measures for both primary and secondary PM formed in the air; the Council's decision to include the California Air Resources Board to the list of agencies that it intends to urge to establish more stringent air quality standards for PM; the Council's recommendation of evaluating current efforts to prevent "piecemealing" in the Air District's permitting process; the Council's recommendation of identifying and further reducing significant sources of condensable PM from refineries; the Council's recommendation of strengthening rules limiting emissions and trackout of road dust to reduce PM in overburdened communities; the Council's recommendation of considering further restrictions on residential wood burning emissions; and the fact that the annotated bibliography for the reduction statements and framework sections of the Draft Report will be revised by Air District staff before December 16, 2020.

Council Action

Dr. Lipman made a motion, seconded by Dr. Long, to **provisionally approve** the Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report, as modified during the Council’s December 3, 2020 meeting, requiring that Chair Hayes makes a final review of a redlined copy of the Report prior to December 16, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rudolph.

4. REVIEW AND DISCUSSION OF THE PRESENTATION TO AIR DISTRICT’S BOARD OF DIRECTORS AT ITS DECEMBER 16, 2020 MEETING

Chair Hayes gave the presentation *Review and Discussion of the Presentation to Air District’s Board of Directors at its December 16, 2020 Meeting*, including: PM Symposium series timeline, October 28, 2019 event, PM community design team members, February 27, 2020 event, and community and industry presentations to the Council; and overview of *Draft Report* contents: Council Findings, PM Reduction Statements; Framework for Evaluation; Recommended Actions.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council members discussed how they would present the content of the Draft Report to the Board at the Joint Meeting of the Board and Council on December 16, 2020, and the manner in which the Council members would be introduced.

5. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT

Chair Hayes had nothing to report.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for the 18 months they spent deliberating on the content of the Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Bayview Hunter’s Point resident.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

(Ex-Officio member) Board Chair Sinks requested that Air District staff send the Council members links to two videos that document the first year of implementation of the West Oakland Community Action Plan, prior to December 16, 2020.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Wednesday, December 16, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards