



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MAY PARTICIPATE BY
TELECONFERENCE**
- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST
BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA
WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE
FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/98004892609>

888 788 0099 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5247 (Toll Free)

WEBINAR ID: 980 0489 2609

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "*9". IN
ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE
SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**
- **COMMENTS MAY ALSO BE SUBMITTED VIA EMAIL AT**

Comments@baaqmd.gov

**FRIDAY
JULY 31, 2020
9:00 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

***Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda. Email Comments for items on the agenda must be submitted to Comments@baaqmd.gov prior to the Council taking up the particular item and indicate the agenda item to which the comment relates. Emailed comments will be considered as the agenda item is taken up by the Council. Emailed comments containing 250 words or less will be read aloud by staff. Emailed comments exceeding 250 words may be summarized during the meeting, if feasible. Comments may also be made during the teleconference. Instructions will be provided at the start of the meeting.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

The Council will recognize Severin Borenstein for his service, leadership, and dedication to protecting air quality in the Bay Area.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY 12, 2020 **Clerk of the Boards/5073**

The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of May 12, 2020.

4. REGULATED INDUSTRY PERSPECTIVES REGARDING PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) MEASURES

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will receive presentations from regulated industry representatives to help inform discussion on particulate matter reduction strategies.

5. BAY AREA PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) MODELING-BASED ASSESSMENTS AND NEXT STEPS

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide a presentation on recent and in-progress work on modeling-based assessments of fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}).

6. **DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY AND NEXT STEPS**

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will continue discussions on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region.

7. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

8. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

9. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Emailed comments indicating the comment pertains to non-agenda matters will be considered under this item. Emailed comments containing 250 words or less will be read aloud by staff. Emailed comments exceeding 250 words may be summarized during the meeting, if feasible. Comments may also be made during the teleconference. Instructions will be provided at the start of the meeting.

10. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

11. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

12. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

JULY 2020

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee	Wednesday	29	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Executive Committee	Wednesday	29	12:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Advisory Council Meeting	Friday	31	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

AUGUST 2020

NO MEETINGS SCHEDULED

SEPTEMBER 2020

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting -CANCELLED	Wednesday	2	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Community & Public Health Committee	Thursday	3	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	16	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, & Inclusion	Thursday	17	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	24	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee	Wednesday	30	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Wednesday	30	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Wednesday	30	1:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: July 23, 2020

Re: Approval of the Minutes of May 12, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of May 12, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of May 12, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 3A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of May 12, 2020

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of May 12, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Tuesday, May 12, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Member Dr. Gina Solomon.

Also Present: None.

NOTED PRESENT: Ex-Officio Advisory Council member, Rod Sinks, was noted present at 9:02 a.m.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 9, 2019

Council Comments

Prof. Borenstein requested that the minutes reflect that he left at noon.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Prof. Borenstein, to **approve** the Minutes of December 9, 2019 **as amended**; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Borenstein, Hayes, Kleinman Lipman, Sinks.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Long, Rudolph, Solomon.

3. PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) SYMPOSIUM OVERVIEW

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *PM Symposium Overview*, showing a proposed timeline of PM Symposium events.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association, Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether action was needed for this item; the request for an updated scheduled as a footnote in the Executive Summary of the document “*Advisory Council Meeting Summary: Bay Area Air Quality Management District Update on Current and Emerging Efforts on Particulate Matter*,” due to COVID-19 schedule changes; a spelling error on page 27 of the aforementioned document; a disagreement regarding which unit should be applied in the first full paragraph in parentheses on page 28 of the aforementioned document; the suggestion that the Council keeps a working version of the answers to the focus questions originally posed at the October PM Symposium to panelists, concerning PM health effects, exposures, and risks; whether Air District staff has any updates from the Air District’s Aclima study regarding source apportionment; and the suggestion of including the sentence, “The best available evidence suggests that reducing from 12 to 8 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ will reduce mortality risk by <value>” in one or more places in the draft discussion questions and answers revised by Chair Hayes and Dr. Solomon.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

4. COMMUNITY PARTICULATE MATTER DISCUSSION OVERVIEW

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, explained that the Air District had intended to host a community-focused meeting in March at which community representatives could discuss PM regulation and strategies with Air District staff. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, that meeting was cancelled. Mr. Nudd explained that a community design team worked with the Air District in preparation for the March meeting, and he introduced two of those team members, Jed Holtzman of 350 Bay Area, and Ladonna Williams of All Positives

Possible, who each presented on this item. The other members of the community design team served as panelists during this item.

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Rudolph was noted present at 10:00 am, and Dr. Long was noted present at 10:26 a.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins; and Dr. David Bezanson.

Council Comments

The Council and presenters discussed what the community design team's priorities are and what would the community like to see happen resulting from the team's discussions with the Air District.

Panelist Comments

Dr. Ashley McLure, primary care physician in Oakland, emphasized the mortality rates in hospitals located in communities with high cumulative exposure to PM, and urged the Air District to prioritize the needs of frontline communities, protect the most vulnerable members of the public, and make PM standards and regulations more stringent, while encouraging people to transition to cleaner sources of power.

Mr. Nadel requested that the Air District designs parallel strategies that address both overall (regional) public health, and the health of frontline communities that bear the immediate impacts of local sources. He also said that the Air District's risk assessment model needs to be strengthened, considering not only cumulative health impacts, but impacts from multiple pollutants and sources.

Ken Szutu of the Vallejo Citizen Air Monitoring Network emphasized the need for a stronger Enforcement division at the Air District, to ensure that Air District regulations are being properly implemented and observed. He also inquired about the Air District's protocol during incidents at Air District-permitted facilities that result in fires or explosions.

Katherine Funes from New Voices Are Rising explained that the students who participate in her organization's efforts are primarily of color, whose families live in frontline communities, and that she is concerned that policy makers cannot relate to those families' experiences. She requested more stringent enforcement over and consequences for polluters.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT PARTICULATE MATTER POTENTIAL POLICY STRATEGIES

Dr. McKay introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, & Modeling, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Air District Particulate Matter Potential Policy Strategies*, including: major sources of PM_{2.5} in the Bay Area; major sources of PM_{2.5} in West Oakland; PM_{2.5} in West Oakland versus the Bay Area; current and potential actions; gaps in authority to regulate PM; and reducing health impacts of fine PM.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Steve Rosenblum, 350 Silicon Valley; Dr. David Bezanson, Silicon Valley resident; Dr. Ashley McClure; and Pat Dodson, Vallejo resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the importance of maintaining focus on tailpipe emissions; In addition, whether road dust is as toxic as emissions from vehicle tailpipes; whether the Air District has the authority to set/impose higher fines; the toxicity of (different types of) road dust; the need to identify the most significant solution for reducing PM (regionally and locally) as quickly as possible, and how the Air District and/or Council push the state to make that happen; the importance and difficulties of conducting retrospective analyses of air quality impacts from facilities that re-start operations after having been shut down (due to the COVID-19 pandemic) in order to look for impacts consistent with the Air District’s emissions inventories; how sports venues and distribution centers are regulated by the Air District; and interest in approaching PM as a toxin.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT

Chair Hayes reported the following:

- The Air District has prepared a panel for the Air and Waste Management Association’s 113th Annual conference (which will be virtual) at the end of June 2020. The panel is entitled “Developing a Path Forward for PM_{2.5} Regulation in the Bay Area” and will be moderated by District Counsel (and the Association’s current President-Elect), Brian Bunger. Mr. Bunger added that this panel may be live and may be able to take live questions but may have to be pre-recorded, and that he needs to have the names of participating Air District speakers confirmed by May 18th, 2020.
- Air District staff provided the Council with two research papers that were published prior to peer-review. The first, from the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, investigated whether exposure to PM_{2.5} is associated with increased risk of COVID-19 mortality in the US. The second, from the University of Bologna, addresses the preliminary evidence of SARS-CoV-2 RNA genetic matter found on particulate matter filters. The Council requested a date by which comments from the Council are due to Air District staff.

7. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

This item was waived.

8. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments, received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Ms. Buenaflor, were submitted by Martha Hawthorne; Rosario Cervantes; and David Page.

9. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

10. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the conclusion of the meeting, it was announced that the next meeting would take place at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Friday, July 31, 2020, at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 12:43 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: July 23, 2020

Re: Regulated Industry Perspectives Regarding Particulate Matter (PM) Measures

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Representatives will share industry perspectives for consideration as the Advisory Council (Council) evaluates potential strategies to reduce fine particulate matter in the future. Industry presentations, together with community presentations provided at the May 12, 2020, Council meeting, will help further inform deliberations.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul

Reviewed by: Jeffrey McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: July 23, 2020

Re: Bay Area Particulate Matter (PM) Modeling-Based Assessments and Next Steps

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Staff will provide a presentation on recent and in-progress work on modeling-based assessments of fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) for the Bay Area region, for sources within an impacted community, and for sources within a major industrial facility. Topics to be discussed will include:

- Regional- and community-scale PM_{2.5} modeling to support Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Action Plans;
- Modeling directly emitted (primary) PM_{2.5} from a Bay Area petroleum refinery; and
- Next steps, including plans for estimating reductions in adult mortality risk from reductions in PM_{2.5}.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Phil Martien and Gregory Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: July 23, 2020

Re: Deliberation on Particulate Matter (PM) Strategy and Next Steps

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Beginning in late 2019, the Advisory Council (Council) received presentations from nationally recognized scientists, community leaders, regulated industry, and Air District staff to inform discussion on fine particulate matter and potential measures to further protect public health. The Council will continue discussions on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul

Reviewed by: Jeff McKay