



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MAY PARTICIPATE BY
TELECONFERENCE**
- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST
BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA
WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE
FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://zoom.us/j/91425918706>

(669) 900 6833 or (408) 638 0968

WEBINAR ID: 914 2591 8706

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "*9". IN
ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE
SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**
- **COMMENTS MAY ALSO BE SUBMITTED VIA EMAIL AT**

Comments@baaqmd.gov

**FRIDAY
OCTOBER 9, 2020
9:00 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

***Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda. Email Comments for items on the agenda must be submitted to Comments@baaqmd.gov prior to the Council taking up the particular item and indicate the agenda item to which the comment relates. Emailed comments will be considered as the agenda item is taken up by the Council. Emailed comments containing 250 words or less will be read aloud by staff. Emailed comments exceeding 250 words may be summarized during the meeting, if feasible. Comments may also be made during the teleconference. Instructions will be provided at the start of the meeting.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

The Council will recognize Severin Borenstein for his service, leadership, and dedication to protecting air quality in the Bay Area.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 31, 2020 **Clerk of the Boards/5073**

The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of July 31, 2020.

4. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY

J. McKay/4629
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will continue discussions on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region.

5. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Emailed comments indicating the comment pertains to non-agenda matters will be considered under this item. Emailed comments containing 250 words or less will be read aloud by staff. Emailed comments exceeding 250 words may be summarized during the meeting, if feasible. Comments may also be made during the teleconference. Instructions will be provided at the start of the meeting.

8. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

OCTOBER 2020

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | <u>ROOM</u> |
|---|------------|-------------|-------------|--|
| Board of Directors Personnel Committee | Monday | 5 | 9:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Regular Meeting | Wednesday | 7 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Advisory Council Meeting | Friday | 9 | 9:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee | Monday | 19 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Executive Committee | Wednesday | 21 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee – CANCELLED | Thursday | 22 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, OCTOBER 19, 2020 AT 9:30 A.M. | Thursday | 22 | 11:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |

NOVEMBER 2020

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | <u>ROOM</u> |
|--|------------|-------------|-------------|--|
| Board of Directors Nominating Committee - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2020 AT 9:00 A.M. | Wednesday | 4 | 9:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Special Meeting - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2020 AT 10:00 A.M. | Wednesday | 4 | 10:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Community & Public Health Committee | Thursday | 5 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Advisory Council Meeting | Monday | 9 | 9:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Nominating Committee | Wednesday | 18 | 9:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |

NOVEMBER 2020

| <u>TYPE OF MEETING</u> | <u>DAY</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>TIME</u> | ROOM |
|--|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---|
| Board of Directors Special Meeting | Wednesday | 18 | 10:00 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee | Thursday | 19 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee | Thursday | 19 | 11:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |
| Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee | Monday | 23 | 9:30 a.m. | Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 |

HL – 10/2/2020 – 2:50 PM

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 2, 2020

Re: Approval of the Minutes of July 31, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of July 31, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of July 31, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 3A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of July 31, 2020

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of July 31, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Friday, July 31, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Member Dr. Jane Long.

Also Present: None.

2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

The Council was to recognize Professor Severin Borenstein who resigned after serving for five years on the Council. Professor Borenstein was unable to attend, so Chair Hayes said that this item will be postponed until Professor Borenstein can attend a meeting (virtually) to be recognized.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY 12, 2020**

Council Comments

Chair Hayes requested that the following revisions in red be made to the Council Comments section of Item #3 (Particulate Matter Symposium Overview) of the proposed Minutes of May 12, 2020:

“The Council and staff discussed whether action was needed for this item; the request for an updated schedule~~d~~ as a footnote in the Executive Summary of the document “Advisory Council Meeting Summary: Bay Area Air Quality Management District Update on Current and Emerging Efforts on Particulate Matter,” due to COVID-19 schedule changes; a spelling error on page 27 of the aforementioned document; a disagreement regarding which units~~s~~ should be applied in the first full paragraph in parentheses on page 28 of the aforementioned document...”

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Ex-Officio member Sinks, to **approve** the Minutes of May 12, 2020 **as amended**; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman Lipman, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Long.

4. **REGULATED INDUSTRY PERSPECTIVES REGARDING PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) MEASURES**

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Frances Keeler, Vice President of the California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance, and Dr. Julie E. Goodman, Principal at Gradient, both of whom represent the regulated industry and gave presentations to help inform discussion on particulate matter reduction strategies.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Janet Johnson, Sunflower Alliance; Ladonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Todd Snyder, San Francisco resident; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; Ken Szutu, Vallejo Citizen Air Monitoring Network; Charles Davidson, Hercules resident; Sharon Shearer, PBF Energy; and Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and presenters discussed the request for an economic evaluation to determine both the greatest cost-effective PM_{2.5} reductions and potential health benefits; causation versus associations/correlations; the pace at which the Advisory Council should finalize its proposed action to the Air District, even while questions remain; whether to weigh the cost of PM-reducing measures on industry against the cost of improved health care benefit for those impacted by PM; how to determine a PM threshold for some members of the population at

various concentrations; outdoor versus indoor PM exposure; differing opinions as to whether PM causes health effects at ambient levels; and the questioning of a presenter’s objectiveness as to the interpretation of the data.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. BAY AREA PARTICULATE MATTER MODELING-BASED ASSESSMENTS AND NEXT STEPS

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) of Policy, introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling, who gave the staff presentation *Bay Area PM Modeling-Based Assessment and Next Steps*, including: overview; recent PM assessments; West Oakland Community Action Plan; regional-scale and community-scale modeling from 2017; block-by-block; unequal impacts: PM_{2.5} across West Oakland; impact zones; targets and source contributions for PM_{2.5}; impact per ton: PM_{2.5} in West Oakland; scenario tool; large industrial sources; Chevron Richmond Refinery; modeling study; Chevron PM_{2.5} concentration impacts by area and residents exposed; PM_{2.5} exposures by race/ethnicity; next steps; and summary.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Kevin Olson, Chevron; Sharon Shearer, PBF Energy; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Charles Davidson, Hercules resident; Todd Osterberg, Chevron; and Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Clean Air Health Alliance.

Committee Comments

The Council and staff discussed which Bay Area neighborhoods are included in the Air District’s 2030 and 2025 target levels of PM_{2.5}; the feasibility of modeling point source contributions to PM in Richmond; whether the Air District’s analyses are weighted for the toxicity of the pollutants from given sources; the comparison of PM impact from passenger and heavy-duty vehicles; and the amount of secondary PM_{2.5} generated from all sources at the Chevron refinery.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER STRATEGY AND NEXT STEPS

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. Cognizant of the Particulate Matter Symposium timeline, which began in October 2019, and the Council’s meeting schedule for the remainder of 2020, Council Chairperson, Stan Hayes, displayed a chart of potential strategies to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District’s Board of Directors at the end of the year. This chart also included the Council’s framework for

evaluating PM reduction strategies and its PM reduction statement. Deliberations will continue at the upcoming Council meeting.

Public Comments

Public comments received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, were submitted by Kimberly Ronen, Valero.

Committee Comments

The Council discussed design values (ug/m3) for each of the 16 different monitoring stations in the Bay Area that are comparable to the concentration level of the standard to assess attainment; the fact that although the frequency of wildfires is unpredictable, PM from wildfire smoke is a serious contributor to health effects; which parts of the Bay Area have attained current federal annual PM_{2.5} National Ambient Air Quality Standards; whether the Air District could attain even more stringent levels of PM_{2.5}, such as 8 or 10 µg/m3; whether PM localized hot-spot areas may experience PM levels significantly higher than their community-average level; the pace at which the Air District should take maximal feasible action regarding PM reduction strategies; lower-income populations with higher long-term PM exposure who are more susceptible to COVID-19; and whether PM reduction strategies should consider emission reduction measures for both primary PM and secondary PM formed by photochemical processes.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 9)

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, and Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

8. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT (ITEM 7)

Chair Hayes reported the following:

- He thanked Brian Bunger, District Counsel, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, Vice Chair Kleinman, and Dr. H. Christopher Frey of North Carolina State University for serving as panelists at the Air and Waste Management Association’s 113th Annual (virtual) Conference, where they discussed “Developing a Path Forward for PM_{2.5} Regulation in the Bay Area”.
- He presented “Particulate Matter Symposium Status Report” to the Air District’s Board of Directors on July 15, 2020.

9. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO (ITEM 8)

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. McKay thanked the Council for driving much conversation at the Air District and announced that a recruitment to address the current Council members’ two-year terms members will be forthcoming.

10. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

Ex-Officio member Sinks thanked the Council members and Air District staff who presented at the Air and Waste Management Association’s 113th Annual (virtual) Conference, which was held at the end of June.

11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the conclusion of the meeting, it was announced that though the next meeting was tentatively scheduled for Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., the next meeting would be held at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Friday, October 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:11 p.m.

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 2, 2020

Re: Deliberation on Particulate Matter (PM) Strategy

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Beginning in late 2019, the Advisory Council (Council) received presentations from nationally recognized scientists, community leaders, regulated industry, and Air District staff to inform discussion on fine particulate matter and potential measures to further protect public health. The Council will continue discussions from the July 31, 2020, meeting on reducing fine particulate matter in the region.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Jeff McKay