



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MAY PARTICIPATE BY
TELECONFERENCE**
- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST
BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA
WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE
FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/82433140213>

(669) 900 6833 or (408) 638 0968

WEBINAR ID: 824 3314 0213

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "*9". IN
ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE
SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

**MONDAY
NOVEMBER 9, 2020
9:00 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 9, 2020 Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of October 9, 2020.

3. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will continue discussions on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region.

4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

5. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council.

7. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Wednesday, December 16, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

NOVEMBER 2020

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Nominating Committee - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2020 AT 9:00 A.M.	Wednesday	4	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2020 AT 10:00 A.M.	Wednesday	4	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Community & Public Health Committee - CANCELLED	Thursday	5	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion	Thursday	5	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Advisory Council Meeting	Monday	9	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Thursday	12	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Nominating Committee	Wednesday	18	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	18	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO THURSDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2020 AT 11:30 A.M.	Thursday	19	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee	Thursday	19	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Monday	23	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee – CANCELLED	Monday	23	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 2, 2020

Re: Approval of the Minutes of October 9, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of October 9, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of October 9, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of October 9, 2020

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of October 9, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Friday, October 9, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman.

Also Present: None.

2. COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

The Council recognized Professor Severin Borenstein, for his service, leadership, and dedication to protecting air quality in the Bay Area. On behalf of the Board, Board Chair Sinks thanked Professor Borenstein for bringing an economist's perspective to Council deliberations on Particulate Matter reduction strategies.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 31, 2020

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Dr. Rudolph made a motion, seconded by Dr. Solomon, to **approve** the Minutes of July 31, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Lipman, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Long.
ABSENT: Kleinman.

4. **DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY**

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. The Council refined a list of findings and potential strategies to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District’s Board of Directors at the end of the year.

The Council recessed at 10:50 a.m. and resumed at 11:03 a.m.

Chair Hayes gave the presentation *Particulate Matter Strategy Report*, including: final report; Appendix A: Supplemental Information; and Appendix B: Symposium Summaries, Presentation, and Additional Information.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident; Dan Sakaguchi; and Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether there is evidence of a health effects PM_{2.5} threshold; how health protective more stringent PM_{2.5} standards might be; the feasibility of the Air District setting a Bay Area target below the current PM_{2.5} National Ambient Air Quality Standards, perhaps as low as 10 or 8 ug/m³; How to account for wildfire PM exposure, over time; the suggestion of referencing the United States Environmental Protection Agency’s definitions when using certain terms, such as “sensitive population”; the need to make PM speciation data available to the public; the need for increased monitoring of ultrafine particles on a national scale and the study of their health impacts; appealing to federal and state agencies who have regulatory authority the Air District lacks to set more stringent PM standards; the need for the expansion of community-level exposure and health impact assessments; the PM impacts of the transition to electrification from fossil fuels by bridging the gap with natural gas; the Board’s request that the Council provides input on the tradeoffs between wet and dry scrubbing technology to reduce PM in the Bay Area; the ability of the Air District to set "standards" vs "targets"; and whether public comments should be heard before or after Council deliberation.

Chair Hayes said that Council members would be individually sent the revised Findings and Potential Recommendations list, and that Council members had until October 16 to submit comments to Air District staff. Deliberations will continue at the upcoming Council meeting.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. **CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT**

Chair Hayes had nothing to report.

6. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for their time and contributions to the ongoing Particulate Matter deliberation.

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, were submitted by Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

8. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, November 9, 2020 at 9:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 1:20 p.m.

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 2, 2020

Re: Deliberation on Particulate Matter (PM) Strategy

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Beginning in late 2019, the Advisory Council (Council) received presentations from nationally recognized scientists, community leaders, regulated industry, and Air District staff to inform discussion on fine particulate matter and potential measures to further protect public health.

The Council will continue discussions from the July 31, 2020 and October 9, 2020 meetings on reducing fine particulate matter in the region.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Jeff McKay