

Errata Sheet

Revised Agenda
Advisory Council Meeting
Thursday, December 3, 2020

Agenda Item #3 Title Change

3. **REVIEW DRAFT PARTICULATE MATTER REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT**
J. McKay/4629
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council intends to complete its review of the draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report.

is being changed to:

3. **REVIEW AND POSSIBLE APPROVAL OF DRAFT PARTICULATE MATTER REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT**
J. McKay/4629
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council intends to complete its review and may vote to approve the draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report for submission to the Board of Directors.



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MAY PARTICIPATE BY
TELECONFERENCE**
- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST
BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA
WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE
FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/83957928114>

(669) 900 6833 or (408) 638 0968

WEBINAR ID: 839 5792 8114

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "*9". IN
ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE
SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

**THURSDAY
DECEMBER 3, 2020
2:00 P.M.**

REVISED AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 9, 2020

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of November 9, 2020.

**3. REVIEW AND POSSIBLE APPROVAL OF DRAFT PARTICULATE MATTER
REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT**

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council intends to complete its review and may vote to approve the draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report for submission to the Board of Directors.

**4. REVIEW AND DISCUSSION OF THE PRESENTATION TO AIR DISTRICT'S
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AT ITS DECEMBER 16, 2020 MEETING**

J. McKay/4629

jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will review and discuss the upcoming presentation to the Board of Directors at its December 16, 2020 meeting.

5. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

6. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council.

8. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Wednesday, December 16, 2020 at 10:00 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Terri Levels, at (415) 749-4667 or by email at tlevels@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

DECEMBER 2020

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	2	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee - CANCELLED	Thursday	3	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	3	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Advisory Council Meeting	Thursday	3	2:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion	Monday	14	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	16	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors & Advisory Council Joint Meeting	Wednesday	16	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee	Thursday	17	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

AD – 11/25/2020 – 12:10 PM

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 23, 2020

Re: Approval of the Minutes of November 9, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of November 9, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of November 9, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of November 9, 2020

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of November 9, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, November 9, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: None.

Also Present: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 9, 2020

Council Comments

Dr. Solomon observed that the minutes did not capture the content of the public comments, which she had hoped to see, for context. Chair Hayes requested that the transcript of the October 9, 2020 meeting be sent to all Council members.

Council Action

Dr. Lipman made a motion, seconded by Dr. Long, to **approve** the Minutes of October 9, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rudolph.

3. DELIBERATION ON PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) STRATEGY

The Council continued its deliberations on reducing fine particulate matter in the Bay Area region and potential recommended measures to further protect public health. The Council further refined and prioritized a list of findings, framework for evaluating PM reduction strategies, and recommended actions to reduce Particulate Matter that will be presented to the Air District’s Board of Directors meeting at the end of the year.

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Rudolph was noted present at 9:39 a.m.

The Council recessed at 11:04 a.m. and resumed at 11:16 a.m.
The Council recessed at 12:24 p.m. and resumed at 12:31 p.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the fact that there is not one, universal reduction strategy that will address multiple PM source categories; the importance of monitoring PM precursors; the importance of addressing both localized and cumulative PM health risks, especially during the Air District’s permitting process; the need to encourage building electrification in new and existing construction, especially in disadvantaged communities; evaluating the efficacy of sulfur reduction in refinery fuel gas; the importance of reducing vehicle miles traveled in order to reduce PM from road dust, brake, and tire wear, and vehicle exhaust; consideration of re-establishing a partnership with the US Environmental Protection Agency regarding a lower ambient PM standard; the need to evaluate the technical and economic feasibility of PM regulations before attempting to implement all options for control that exist; whether improving indoor air quality should be a priority of the Air District; whether to rank the Council’s recommended actions by priority (to the Board), or just categorize them; the need for improved air monitoring practices and data collection; whether the Air District requires authority to create emission reduction targets (versus standards); the Council’s desire that the Air District seeks legislative authority to establish a standard for PM_{2.5} (potentially 8 µg/m³); the fact that more stringent National Ambient Air Quality Standards would be more health protective; the need to remember that exposures vary substantially across communities; and the fact that wildfire smoke increases PM_{2.5} levels substantially above the proposed 8 µg/m³ ambient PM standard.

Chair Hayes said that Council members would be individually sent the revised document that was wordsmithed at the meeting, and that Council members may have one last opportunity to deliberate on it, at another Council meeting to be scheduled prior to December 16, 2020. Chair Hayes also asked Council members to submit comments to him on the full Draft Advisory Council Report to be submitted to the Air District Board of Directors as soon as possible.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

5. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT (ITEM 4)

Chair Hayes reported that he presented on the status of the Council’s PM Strategy Report at the Board of Director’s Executive Committee on October 21, 2020.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (ITEM 5)

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for their time and contributions to the ongoing Particulate Matter deliberation.

7. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

(Ex-Officio member) Board Chair Sinks extended the Board’s appreciation of the Council’s time on its PM Strategy Report that has been under development. He said he hopes to see the Council members at the December 16, 2020 joint meeting of the Board and Council.

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the conclusion of the meeting, Chair Hayes said that there will be a joint Board/Advisory Council meeting on December 16, 2020 at 10:00 a.m. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Thursday, December 3, 2020 at 2:00 p.m. via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newson.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:53 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 25, 2020

Re: Review and Possible Approval of Draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Beginning in late 2019, the Advisory Council (Council) received presentations from nationally recognized scientists, community leaders, regulated industry, and Air District staff to inform discussion on fine particulate matter and potential measures to further protect public health.

Over the last three meetings, in July, October, and November 2020, the Council has deliberated and developed a draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report to share with the Air District Board of Directors. The Council intends to complete its review of the draft report.

The Council may, if they choose, vote to approve the draft report for submission to the Board of Directors at the conclusion of their review and discussion.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 23, 2020

Re: Review and Discussion of the Presentation to Air District's Board of Directors at its
December 16, 2020 Meeting

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

At a joint meeting of the Air District Board of Directors (Board) and Advisory Council (Council) on December 16, 2020, the Council will submit the draft Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report to the Board. The Council will provide the Board with a presentation of its findings and recommend next steps.

The Council will review and discuss the upcoming presentation to the Board of Directors.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Jeff McKay