



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MAY PARTICIPATE BY
TELECONFERENCE**
- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST
BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA
WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE
FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/88682449133>

(669) 900 6833 or (408) 638 0968

WEBINAR ID: 886 8244 9133

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A
COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "*9". IN
ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE
SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

**MONDAY
SEPTEMBER 13, 2021
8:30 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 3, 2020

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 3, 2020.

3. COUNCIL INTRODUCTIONS

G. Nudd/4786

gnudd@baaqmd.gov

Council members will have the opportunity to briefly introduce themselves to the membership.

4. OVERVIEW OF THE RALPH M. BROWN ACT

J. Freid/4971

jfreid@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide the Advisory Council with an overview of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

5. INTRODUCTION OF THE AIR DISTRICT

G. Nudd/4786

gnudd@baaqmd.gov

The Advisory Council will receive information on the Air District's history and administrative processes.

6. **BAY AREA AIR QUALITY OVERVIEW** **R. Chiang/4264**
rchiang@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide the Advisory Council with an overview Bay Area air quality.

7. **OVERVIEW OF AIR DISTRICT LEGAL AUTHORITIES** **A. Schwartz/4920**
aschwartz@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide the Advisory Council with an overview of the Air District's legal authority.

8. **OVERVIEW OF AIR DISTRICT PROGRAMS** **H. Hilken/4642**
hhilken@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide the Advisory Council with an overview of key Air District programs.

9. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

10. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council.

11. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

12. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, October 25, 2021, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

13. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Terri Levels, at (415) 749-4667 or by email at tlevels@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

SEPTEMBER 2021

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Advisory Council Meeting	Monday	13	8:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	15	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Administration Committee	Wednesday	15	10:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	15	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Technology Implementation Office (TIO) Steering Committee	Friday	17	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee - CANCELLED & RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 27, 2021 at 9:00 A.M.	Thursday	20	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	23	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	27	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

HL - 9/2/2021 - 2:35 P.M.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Approval of the Minutes of December 3, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of December 3, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of December 3, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of December 3, 2020

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 3, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Thursday, December 3, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 2:02 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long; Dr. Linda Rudolph, Dr. Gina Solomon, and Ex-Officio member, Rod Sinks.

Absent: None.

Also Present: None.

2. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 9, 2020**

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Dr. Rudolph made a motion, seconded by Dr. Lipman, to **approve** the Minutes of November 9, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Rudolph, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: None.

3. **REVIEW DRAFT PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT**

The Council concluded its deliberations on reducing fine Particulate Matter in the Bay Area and finalized its recommended measures to further protect public health, which will be presented to the Air District’s Board of Directors on December 16, 2020 at a joint Board of Directors and Advisory Council meeting. This included a list of findings, framework for evaluating PM reduction strategies, and recommended actions to reduce Particulate Matter.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; Rhoda Fry, Cupertino resident; and Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident.

The public expressed frustration, claiming that the Council’s most recent version of its Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report (Draft Report) did not include public input that had been submitted. The public urged the Council not to recommend the Draft Report be presented to the Board of Directors until public input was added back into the report.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the conversation had by Council members who met to discuss the Draft Report after the November 9, 2020 meeting; a request to ask the members of the environmental justice community to outline the items they had brought forward but believed to be missing from the draft version of the report. The distinction between *PM_{2.5} exposures, emissions, and concentrations*; the Council’s decision to suggest that the Air District set a “guideline ambient *PM^{2.5} target*” of 8 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, versus 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, and the suggestion that any strategic action plans that are designed for communities reflect the target. The Council’s belief that controlling emissions in local impacted areas is of primary importance; the fact that the Council’s believes that an anticipated increase in wildfire PM justifies greater efforts to reduce controllable sources of PM, in order to further mitigate overall health risk; the Council’s acknowledgment of ultrafine particles not being adequately monitored; the Council’s suggestion for the Air District to focus on racial justice when evaluating PM reduction strategies; the Council’s recommendation of designing PM reduction strategies that control the cumulative impact of regional, local, and localized hot-spot sources, including emissions reduction measures for both primary and secondary PM formed in the air; the Council’s decision to include the California Air Resources Board to the list of agencies that it intends to urge to establish more stringent air quality standards for PM; the Council’s recommendation of evaluating current efforts to prevent “piecemealing” in the Air District’s permitting process; the Council’s recommendation of identifying and further reducing significant sources of condensable PM from refineries; the Council’s recommendation of strengthening rules limiting emissions and trackout of road dust to reduce PM in overburdened communities; the Council’s recommendation of considering further restrictions on residential wood burning emissions; and the fact that the annotated bibliography for the reduction statements and framework sections of the Draft Report will be revised by Air District staff before December 16, 2020.

Council Action

Dr. Lipman made a motion, seconded by Dr. Long, to **provisionally approve** the Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report, as modified during the Council’s December 3, 2020 meeting, requiring that Chair Hayes makes a final review of a redlined copy of the Report prior to December 16, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long, Sinks, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rudolph.

4. REVIEW AND DISCUSSION OF THE PRESENTATION TO AIR DISTRICT’S BOARD OF DIRECTORS AT ITS DECEMBER 16, 2020 MEETING

Chair Hayes gave the presentation *Review and Discussion of the Presentation to Air District’s Board of Directors at its December 16, 2020 Meeting*, including: PM Symposium series timeline, October 28, 2019 event, PM community design team members, February 27, 2020 event, and community and industry presentations to the Council; and overview of *Draft Report* contents: Council Findings, PM Reduction Statements; Framework for Evaluation; Recommended Actions.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council members discussed how they would present the content of the Draft Report to the Board at the Joint Meeting of the Board and Council on December 16, 2020, and the manner in which the Council members would be introduced.

5. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT

Chair Hayes had nothing to report.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, thanked the Council members for the 18 months they spent deliberating on the content of the Draft PM Reduction Strategy Report.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Bayview Hunter’s Point resident.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

(Ex-Officio member) Board Chair Sinks requested that Air District staff send the Council members links to two videos that document the first year of implementation of the West Oakland Community Action Plan, prior to December 16, 2020.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Wednesday, December 16, 2020 at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Council Introductions

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

The Advisory Councilmembers are invited to briefly introduce themselves to the membership.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul

Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Overview of the Ralph M. Brown Act

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Staff will provide an overview on the Ralph M. Brown Act and the governance of public meetings.

DISCUSSION

The Advisory Council of the Air District is subject to the requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act. Staff will review the Ralph M. Brown Act and the legal requirements for open meetings and public access, including applicable procedural requirements.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Adan Schwartz

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Introduction of the Air District

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Staff will provide an introduction of the Air District, including the Air District's mission and vision, administrative structure, and the role of the Advisory Council in Air District work.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Bay Area Air Quality Overview

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Staff will highlight key air quality data and trends for the Bay Area, including:

- Emissions
- Ambient concentrations
- Exposure
- Health Impacts
- Climate Impacts

The presentation will also include an overview of tools and methods that the Air District uses to understand air quality,

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Ranyee Chiang and Henry Hilken

Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Overview of Air District Legal Authorities

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Staff will provide an overview on aspects of the Air District's legal authority.

DISCUSSION

Staff will discuss the legal framework in which the Air District operates, the legal authorities granted, and obligations imposed by that framework.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Adan Schwartz

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 9, 2021

Re: Overview of Air District Programs

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Staff will provide an overview of key Air District programs and initiatives.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sonam Shah-Paul

Reviewed by: Greg Nudd