

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, October 25, 2021

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by Assembly Bill 361. Members of the Council participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) of Policy, acting as meeting facilitator, called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairpersons Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon; Vice Chairperson Prof. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Danny Cullenward, Dr. Adrienne Hollis, Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal, Garima Raheja; and Board of Directors (Board) Liaison David Haubert.

Absent: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 13, 2021

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Board Liaison Haubert, to **approve** the Minutes of September 13, 2021; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Cullenward, Haubert, Hollis, Kleinman, Phartiyal, Raheja.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Rudolph.
ABSENT: Solomon.

3. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Mr. Nudd reported that following the September 13, 2021 Council meeting, Air District staff had one-on-one discussions with Drs. Rudolph and Solomon, who indicated their interest in a Co-Chairperson model. Mr. Nudd asked if Prof. Kleinman would like to continue his role as the Council's Vice Chairperson, and he said yes. Mr. Nudd proposed that the Council vote on the following election of Officers for the Council: Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon as Co-Chairpersons and Prof. Kleinman as Vice Chairperson.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Board Liaison Haubert made a motion, seconded by Dr. Phartiyal, to recommend that the Board **approve** Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon as Co-Chairpersons and Prof. Kleinman as Vice Chairperson for the 2021-2023 term of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Cullenward, Haubert, Hollis, Kleinman, Phartiyal, Raheja, Rudolph.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Solomon.

Co-Chair Rudolph facilitated the meeting from this point on.

4. LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ROLE OF OFFICERS

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Legislative History of the Advisory Council and Role of Officers*, including: previous Advisory Council defined by California Health & Safety Code; current Advisory Council defined by California Health & Safety Code; role of the Advisory Council; role of the Chair and Vice Chair; and Advisory Council and Boards of the Air District.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident; Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association; and Richard Gray, Sunflower Alliance.

Council Comments

The Council members and staff discussed how the Board would like to utilize the Council's scientific expertise; whether the Council should develop policy recommendations to the Board; the anticipated interaction between the Council and the Air District's Community Advisory Council; and the extent to which the Council has historically been proactive about issues of interest to the Air District.

NOTED PRESENT: Co-Chair Solomon was noted present at 9:12 a.m.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. AIR DISTRICT CLIMATE PROTECTION PROGRAM UPDATE

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Air District Climate Protection Program*, along with Abby Young, Air Quality Program Manager, Dr. Sally Newman, Air Quality Specialist, and Anthony Fournier, Technology Implementation Officer. Slides included: overview; Advisory Council input and guidance; growing urgency – impacts and equity; Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; Climate Protection Program; where do we go from here; potential win-win solutions; transportation – incentives for electric vehicles (EVs); innovative financing for innovative technologies; loan guarantees; funded projects; qualified projects; carbon dioxide removal/carbon capture and storage; path to carbon removal; general types of carbon capture; arguments against carbon dioxide removal; moving forward; and discussion questions.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident; and Richard Gray, Sunflower Alliance.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed how to separate the causes of asthma (external pollutants versus inside the home), especially in Assembly Bill (AB) 617 and other overburdened communities; the opportunity costs of addressing point source carbon capture; tradeoffs between climate and air quality issues, specifically regarding the conversion of conventional petroleum refineries to biodiesel operations; mitigating short lived climate pollutants like methane (versus long term climate pollutants, such as carbon dioxide); how the reduction of Particulate Matter (PM), ozone, and nitrogen oxide emissions, both indoor and outdoor, can help mitigate asthma, and the suggestion that the Air District focuses on indoor air quality; climate dis-benefits; how the Air District is assessing GHG emissions impacts and cost-effectiveness for each of the Air District's programs; and the suggestion of creating climate resilience spaces in schools, libraries, and community centers during wildfires and heatwaves.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Mr. Nudd said that there was nothing to report.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

Board Liaison Haubert expressed his gratitude to the Council and Air District staff and remarked that the Board will benefit from the Council's discussions and guidance regarding science, metrics, prioritization.

Dr. Cullenward asked about the sources of information on which the Air District bases its policies regarding future climate impacts and emission reductions targets.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, November 8, 2021, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:43 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards