

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, November 8, 2021

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by Assembly Bill 361. Members of the Council participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairperson, Dr. Gina Solomon, called the meeting to order at 8:37 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairpersons Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon; Vice Chairperson Prof. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Danny Cullenward, Garima Raheja; and Board Liaison David Haubert.

Absent: Members Dr. Adrienne Hollis and Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal.

2. OVERVIEW OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

Azibuike Akaba, Public Information Officer, introduced Dr. Bhavna Shamasunder, Chair and Associate Professor of Occidental College's Urban & Environmental Policy Department, who gave the presentation *Translating Community Engagement in Science into Emissions Reduction*, including: our projects; community engaged research frameworks; from buckets to networks (community based monitoring); ongoing challenges and questions; support internal and out for community engagement; and possible considerations.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed concerns about monitors focusing on Particulate Matter (PM)_{2.5} over other pollutants; whether the Air District has seen a difference between enforcement-oriented action and rule development-oriented action in the community engagement space; whether regulating agencies acknowledge their differences in resources, time, and expertise

when assisting overburdened communities; whether the Air District has identified preferred community engagement models it would like to see replicated; how to maintain proposed timelines and make progress, given the time-intensive nature of community engaged work; challenges regarding agencies' response times to incidents; how volatile organic compounds (VOC) and toxic components from transient events can contribute to PM levels and to the changing of baselines for other sources; whether the Air District can capture particulate matter that are formed through secondary aggregation of VOCs in its emissions inventories; whether the Air District collects measurements intentionally during incidents; and the request for a future presentation on transient emissions events at facilities.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

3. CURRENT U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY (EPA) EFFORTS TO ADDRESS DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACTS IN OVERBURDENED COMMUNITIES

Mr. Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Dr. Phil Fine, Principal Deputy Associate Administrator for Policy at U.S. EPA, who gave the presentation *US EPA Efforts to Address Disproportionate Impacts on Overburdened Communities*, including: message from the Administrator; Executive Order on advancing racial equity and support for underserved communities through the federal government; Executive Order on tackling the climate crisis at home and abroad; prioritizing enforcement in communities with environmental justice concerns; disproportionate and cumulative impacts; Draft Fiscal Year 2022-2026 EPA Strategic Plan Framework; Budget of the US Government; EPA creates \$50 million fund for environmental justice initiatives; and partnerships.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed enforcement efforts of the EPA; whether the upcoming Request for Proposals regarding air district air monitors will be open to community associations and non-profits organizations; what the EPA considers ideal characteristics of newly developed tools; concerns with the current version of CalEnviroScreen, including the exclusion of certain neighborhoods and the need to consider toxic exposure; and how the federal government assesses health equity impacts of transportation or energy policy.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

The Council recessed at 10:15 a.m. and resumed at 10:21 a.m.

4. OVERVIEW OF AIR POLLUTION, INEQUITY, AND COMMUNITY HEALTH IN THE BAY AREA

Mr. Nudd and Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, & Modeling, gave the staff presentation *Overview of Air Pollution, Inequity, and Community Health in the Bay Area*, including: overview; what are the data and models telling us; community health; health inequities; air pollution; regional PM_{2.5} and air toxics modeling; measuring air pollution – expansion of monitoring and analysis options to understand inequities; ambient concentrations – area-wide measurement trends (24-hour PM_{2.5}); measuring air pollution – inequities; what actions is the Air District currently taking; Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Program overview; Bay Area communities; a community-centered program; “Owning Our Air” – West Oakland Community Action Plan; community-centered planning; “Owning Our Air” implementation approach and progress; why Richmond, North Richmond, and San Pablo; community co-leading the process; progress to date; East Oakland air pollution; incentives awarded in 2020; next steps; Community Advisory Council; air pollution and rules; prioritizing enforcement in AB 617 communities; facility risk reduction (Rule 11-18); and discussion questions.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed how to scale-up and make the process of the Air District partnering with communities to reduce inequitable exposures, less time and resource intensive; how the Air District applies data from one community and/or source to others and scale models for different sources; ways to adapt the Air District’s analyses to address issues in multiple communities and scale up the Air District’s approach; the Council’s interest in joint mtgs with the Community Advisory Council; the request that Council members be alerted of Air District community meetings, especially in AB 617 communities; the need to develop strategies to prioritize the Air District’s limited enforcement capacity; the request for a presentation on the Air District’s key efforts and initiatives for 2022; the status of the Air District’s Rule 11-18 (Hazardous Pollutants: Reduction of Risk From Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities); how the Air District selects sites’ short term monitoring, and how the history of community complaints in those areas informs the placement of new monitors.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, reported that Air District staff and Board members are attending the 2021 United Nations Climate Change Conference, COP26 (Conference of the Parties) annual summit, which brings countries together to accelerate action towards the goals of the Paris Agreement and the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. She described several conference events that the Air District’s Board members will be leading that may be viewed live by the public.

6. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

7. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, December 13, 2021, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:43 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards