

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Monday, December 13, 2021

*An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at*  
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

**This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by Assembly Bill 361. Members of the Council participated by teleconference.**

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairperson, Dr. Linda Rudolph, called the meeting to order at 8:31 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairpersons Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon; Vice Chairperson Prof. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Danny Cullenward, Dr. Adrienne Hollis, Garima Raheja; and Board Liaison David Haubert.

Absent: Member Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal.

### **2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 25, 2021, AND NOVEMBER 8, 2021**

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Council Comments

None.

#### Council Action on Minutes of October 25, 2021

Dr. Hollis made a motion, seconded by Dr. Cullenward, to **approve** the Minutes of October 25, 2021; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Cullenward, Hollis, Kleinman, Raheja, Rudolph, Solomon.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Haubert, Phartiyal.

### Council Action on Minutes of November 8, 2021

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Dr. Hollis, to **approve** the Minutes of November 8, 2021; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Cullenward, Hollis, Kleinman, Raheja, Rudolph, Solomon.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Haubert, Phartiyal.

### 3. **OVERVIEW OF PARTICULAR MATTER**

NOTED PRESENT: Board Liaison Haubert was noted present at 8:40 a.m.

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, Dr. David Holstius, Senior Advanced Projects Advisor, and Dr. Ranyee Chiang, Director of Meteorology and Measurement, gave the staff presentation *Overview of Particulate Matter (PM)*, including: highlights from Council recommendations (December 2020); permitting regulatory needs; modeling local-scale PM<sub>2.5</sub> impacts for risk management; overview/framing; update: state of the science; policy-relevant range; emissions, concentrations, exposures; risk: PM<sub>2.5</sub> and mortality; from modeling to evaluation; complexity: multiple metrics and population dependence; selected references; setting an air quality target; highlights from Council recommendations (December 2020); objectives and considerations; options for implementing recommendations; tools to identify issues and demonstrate progress; regional approach; local disparities approach; other open questions on metrics; and particulate matter key issues.

#### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Charles Reed, Emerald New Deal; Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo resident; and Tara Cahn, Tara Cahn Architecture.

#### Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the types of air pollution issues that the Air District studies and subsequent processes, and whether the Bay Area Air District is the only California air district pursuing the issues that it pursues; how Air District Board members can utilize the scientific information it receives from the Council; whether the Air District should consider morbidity rates; background levels of PM exposure and how wildfire smoke could be incorporated into standard PM regulation; whether studies regarding exposure of disproportionate burden on race (and gender or income), versus an average population, are available; whether the Air District should prioritize the protection of vulnerable/overburdened populations, versus average populations, in studies and in policy interventions, and how the Air District would respond if a member of the public inquired about that; why the Air District believes that current federal standards are not health protective, and whether the Air District believes that the federal

standards will become more stringent over time; the cumulative effects of multiple sources of air pollution, and whether it is more beneficial to analyze regional, versus local, air pollution; and the need for a health protective standard for regional PM.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### **4. DISCUSSION OF ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETINGS AND 2022 TOPICS**

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Discussion of Advisory Council Meetings and 2022 Topics*, including: research and discussion questions: climate, equity and community health, and PM.

#### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Christine Wolfe, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance; and Tara Cahn, Tara Cahn Architecture.

#### Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the Air District's impact on green economy jobs; the suggestion of looking at co-benefits regarding climate change, and prioritizing things that the Air District can do to reduce Toxic Air Contaminants, PM, and climate gases; the suggestion of establishing a budget to address health risks in various communities; the suggestion of initiating a series of case studies with a modeling approach that looks at various populations, health metrics, and time periods; how to prioritize interventions regarding climate pollution, and the difficulties of doing so when regulation has legal limitations; tradeoff decisions that the Air District faces, regarding the high impacts but short atmospheric lifetimes of non-carbon dioxide pollutants; which average PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards (24-hour or annual) are most utilized by the United States Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee and California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment; how PM emissions from wildfires fit into California's assessment; the Air District's partnerships with the US EPA and California Air Resources Board to address community climate resilience clean air centers, particularly at schools for children during high-exposure (wildfire) situations; and whether the Air District has a standard method for presenting scientific information to its Board of Directors.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### **5. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

Mr. Nudd reported that Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, chose to waive his report.

#### **6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

**7. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

Co-Chair Solomon asked whether it can be proven that woodsmoke air pollution is greater than motor vehicle and refinery pollution during the winter in the Bay Area, and whether the Air District models wildfire smoke PM impacts by neighborhood.

Co-Chair Rudolph asked how much air pollution is generated by commercial operations and expressed the desire to hold such facilities accountable for their emissions.

Vice Chair Kleinman suggested that the Air District invite Dr. Timothy Larson of the University of Washington to speak about his findings regarding the health effects woodsmoke.

**8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

The time and place of the next Council meeting was originally at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the time and place of the next meeting was set for Monday, February 14, 2022, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, conducted under procedures authorized by Assembly Bill 361.

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:03 a.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards