

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

Advisory Council Meeting  
Monday, April 11, 2022

## APPROVED MINUTES

*Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at [www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas](http://www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas)*

**This meeting was conducted under procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361. Members of the Committee participated by teleconference.**

### 1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Opening Comments: Advisory Council Co-Chairperson Dr. Gina Solomon, called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.

#### Roll Call:

Present: Co-Chairperson Dr. Linda Rudolph; Co-Chairperson Dr. Gina Solomon; Vice Chairperson Dr. Michael Kleinman; Board Liaison David Haubert; and Council members Dr. Adrienne Hollis, Garima Raheja, and Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal.

Absent: Dr. Danny Cullenward.

### 2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

#### **REGULAR AGENDA (Items 3 - 7)**

### 3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 14, 2022

Co-Chairperson Rudolph made a motion, seconded by Board Liaison Haubert, to **approve** the minutes of February 14, 2022, and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Advisory Council:

AYES: Haubert, Hollis, Kleinman, Phartiyal, Raheja, Rudolph, Solomon.  
NOES: None  
ABSTAIN: None  
ABSENT: Cullenward.

#### **4. BUILDING APPLIANCE RULES: EXPOSURE AND EQUITY ASSESSMENT**

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) of Policy, introduced Dr. David Holstius, Senior Advanced Project Advisor, who gave the staff presentation *Building Appliance Rules: Exposure and Equity Assessment*, including: outcome; overview; recap: modeled outdoor Particulate Matter (PM) 2.5; modeled PM 2.5 exposure; primary vs. secondary PM 2.5; race/ethnicity vs. Total PM 2.5; within counties, a different pattern; population distribution; "per capita" is population-weighted; and summary.

##### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

##### Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether the Air District is monitoring variation in proportion of PM risk attributable to various sources in different Bay Area counties and subregions; whether contrasting results between health impacts experienced by different races are due to differences in home appliances; appliance limitations experienced by renters; the number of different racial groups in the Bay Area; how design values differ from modeled values, and how protective they should be; the origins of the presented health data and their comparison to the design value; whether gas appliances should be banned, and why they are still permitted; the implications of the Air District's analysis for regulatory strategies for reducing emissions in the home; and the request for data regarding health impacts based on gender in the Bay Area.

##### Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### **5. FINE PARTICULATE MATTER LOCAL RISK METHODOLOGY: KEY QUESTIONS**

Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, & Modeling, gave the staff presentation *Fine Particulate Matter Local Risk Methodology: Key Questions*, including: overview; gaps in the regulatory framework; community-scale modeling reveals localized impacts of PM 2.5; gaps in the regulatory framework; how to reduce the gap for PM 2.5?; Draft PM 2.5 Local Risk Approach; toxics framework example: benzene and cancer; PM 2.5 and premature mortality; envisioned applications; envisioned source types; staged approach for permitting; key questions; reasons to be simple; ways to be less simple; ways to more simple; rollout and communication; and next steps.

##### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident, and Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

##### Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed how population death rates can affect estimated health impacts; whether the Air District should utilize the approach of looking at cancer risk uncertainty factors used by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment; the differences between adopting a margin of safety and developing uncertainty factors; and how the Air District plans to refine regional mortality data.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

**6. COMBUSTION ANALYSIS REPORT PROPOSAL**

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Combustion Analysis Proposal*, including: overview; concept; purpose; methodology; more about Intervention Model for Air Pollution (InMap); InMap sample results; PM Reduction Strategy Nexus; and next steps.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the status of the Air District's combustion strategy, and whether Assembly Bill (AB) 398 impacted that development; the accuracy of InMap; the plan for uncertainty factors compared to the regional models; the definition of combustion emissions; a Council member's concern about new information on health impacts of combustion and combustion sources, whether the Air District will prioritize aggressively reducing exposure and how long that would take; and whether a utility exists that would separate rural and urban components (of combustion sources).

Council Action

None; receive and file.

**7. IMPLEMENTATION OF ADVISORY COUNCIL PARTICULATE MATTER RECOMMENDATIONS**

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *PM Strategy Progress Report*, including: outline; background; approach; challenges; highlights; priority actions; measuring progress; targets; impacted communities; wildfires; regional PM; and next steps;

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Christine Wolfe, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed prioritizing strategies that would be quickest to implement; the dangers of wood burning; the suggestion of attaching socioeconomic analyses to the Air District's whitepapers; whether the Air District monitors how long permit applications must wait to be considered for approval; a Council member's concern that the Air District should provide a more enhanced process to engage the public regarding Air District programs and initiatives; the best strategy for communicating benefits, versus risk, (quantify missed work and school days) to the public; whether the Air District's Board is looking at mobile source incentives and community building incentives; and the Air District's role in

mobile source incentives.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

**8. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

Alexander "Sandy" Crockett, Assistant Counsel, announced that he was appointed by the Board to be Interim Executive Officer/APCO, due to the departure of Jack Broadbent. Mr. Crockett reported that the Board will be appointing a long-term Interim APCO, and will also be recruiting for a permanent successor. In addition, Mr. Crockett announced that the Air & Waste Management Association's 115th Annual Conference will be held in San Francisco for June 27-30, and any Council members who wish to attend (three slots only) must tell Vanessa Johnson of their desire to attend by April 29, 2022. Regarding the recruitment for a new APCO, the Council expressed interest in participating in the recruitment.

**9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

**10. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Dr. Rudolph reported that she and Dr. Solomon attended the Air District's March 30, 2022 Community Advisory Council meeting, and observed that there is much more public engagement.

**11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the end of the meeting, the date of the next Advisory Council meeting was tentatively scheduled for Monday, June 13, 2022. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Monday, July 11, 2022, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, teleconference, or Zoom, pursuant to procedures in accordance with AB 361 (Rivas 2021.)

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:26 a.m.

*/s/ Luis Espino*  
Luis Espino  
Acting Clerk of the Boards