

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Advisory Council Meeting
Monday, July 11, 2022

APPROVED MINUTES

Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

This meeting was conducted under procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361. Members of the Advisory Council participated by teleconference.

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairperson, Dr. Linda Rudolph, called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Co-Chairpersons Dr. Linda Rudolph and Dr. Gina Solomon; Vice Chairperson Dr. Michael Kleinman; Members Dr. Danny Cullenward, Dr. Adrienne Hollis, Garima Raheja; and Board Liaison David Haubert.

Absent: Member Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal.

2. **PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**
3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 11, 2022**

Public Comments

No requests submitted.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Board Liaison Haubert, to **approve** Minutes of April 11, 2022; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Cullenward, Haubert, Hollis, Kleinman, Raheja, Rudolph, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Phartiyal.

4. **PARTICULATE MATTER (PM) MODELING: CONTEXT, PRODUCTS AND PROGRESS**

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *PM Modeling: Context, Products, and Progress*, including: outline; the larger PM context; four recent Advisory Council presentations; the takeaway; PM modeling efforts in summary; modeling products and timeline; combustion analysis progress – building appliances, all source assessment: application of InMAP; and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the difference between the InMAP and BenMAP-CE modeling programs; whether modeling programs accurately capture peaks during upset conditions and disruptions in normal activity; how wildfire smoke and vehicular emissions are incorporated into cumulative impacts; whether regulated facilities are required to notify the Air District when they begin flaring; Haubert: types of fuels of combustion and which have the greatest health impacts; why the Air District allows woodburning in homes within impacted neighborhoods; whether modeling methods that differentiate between vehicular break and tire wear exist; whether the Air District has implemented the Council’s recommendation from 2019 to establish more a more stringent, health-protective PM target (for the Bay Area region) than the current federal standards; and the request for a list of wildfire smoke preparedness tips.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. **FINE PARTICULATE MATTER LOCAL RISK METHODOLOGY: UPDATE AND KEY QUESTIONS**

Greg introduced Dr. David Holstius, Senior Advanced Projects Advisor, who gave the staff presentation *Fine PM Local Risk Methodology: Update and Key Questions*, including: overview; key questions; recap: average annual impact; advancements; revised approach; illustration; exposure window; points of reference; safety/uncertainty considerations; Di et al (2017); Yazdi et al (2021); Vodonos et al (2018); receptors to consider; senior at a residence; worker at a workplace; child at a school or daycare; and key questions.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, San Francisco resident.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the request for error bars (graphical representations of the variability of data to indicate the error or uncertainty in a reported measurement) in future presentations; the fact that because the Air District lacks adequate linear data, the collected data is an approximation; the desire to see

more robust safety/uncertainty factors; and the request to see uncertainty factors for database deficiencies in future presentations.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, made the following announcements:

- Sharon Landers, Interim Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, is taking time off due to medical reasons.
- The Air District’s Community Advisory Council has met three times, and a joint meeting of the Council and Community Advisory Council is anticipated.

Dr. Ranyee Chiang, Director of Meteorology and Measurement, was asked by Ms. Eady to provide a summary on recent air quality.

7. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/OTHER BUSINESS

None.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the end of the meeting, the next Advisory Council meeting was to be scheduled at the call of the Co-Chairs. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Monday, September 12, 2022, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, teleconference, or Zoom, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021).

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:35 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards