



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS
ADVISORY COUNCIL

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Dr. Linda Rudolph (Co-Chair), MD, Center for Climate Change and Health
Dr. Gina Solomon (Co-Chair), MD, University of California San Francisco
Dr. Danny Cullenward, PhD, JD, CarbonPlan
Dr. Adrienne L. Hollis, PhD, JD, Hollis Environmental Consulting, LLC
Dr. Michael Kleinman, PhD, University of California Irvine
Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal, PhD, Rainforest Action Network
Garima Raheja, PhD candidate, Columbia University
David Haubert, Air District Board of Directors Liaison

THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY ASSEMBLY BILL 361 (RIVAS 2021) ALLOWING REMOTE MEETINGS. THIS MEETING WILL BE ACCESSIBLE VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND ZOOM. A ZOOM PANELIST LINK WILL BE SENT SEPARATELY TO COUNCIL MEMBERS

- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA WEBPAGE AT**

www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/88945950291>

(669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968

WEBINAR ID: 889 4595 0291

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "**9". IN ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING AGENDA

MONDAY, JANUARY 30, 2023

8:30 AM

1. **Call to Order - Roll Call**
2. **Public Meeting Procedure**

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Council. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

CONSENT CALENDAR (Item 3)

3. Approval of the Advisory Council Meeting Minutes of September 12, 2022

The Council will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the meeting of September 12, 2022.

INFORMATIONAL ITEM(S)

4. Update on the Proposed Methodology for Determining Local Health Risks from Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5})

The Advisory Council will receive a presentation from staff regarding the PM_{2.5} local risk methodology, containing: a brief review of progress during 2022; an update responsive to a Council question; and a high-level overview of public comments on the draft white paper, Modeling Local Sources of Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) for Risk Management.

5. Comments on the Proposed Methodology for Determining Local Health Risks from Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5})

The Advisory Council will receive presentations from, and have an opportunity to discuss and raise questions with, three organizations that provided public comment on the draft white paper, Modeling Local Sources of Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) for Risk Management.

6. Revision of the PM_{2.5} National Ambient Air Quality Standard: The Role of Air Monitoring Data

Air District staff will provide information and context about the recent proposal from U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). In addition, Air District staff will provide an overview of the Particulate Matter (PM) National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS), and how air monitoring data is compared to the NAAQS. This item will be presented by Kate Hoag, Ph.D., Assistant Manager in the Meteorology and Measurement Division.

OTHER BUSINESS

7. Report of the Interim Executive Officer/APCO

8. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have five minutes each to address the Council.

9. Council Member Comments / Other Business

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

10. Time and Place of Next Meeting

At the Call of the Chair.

11. Adjournment

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Suma Peesapati, at (415) 749-4967 or by email at speesapati@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

JANUARY 2023

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Advisory Council Meeting	Monday	30	8:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	30	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

FEBRUARY 2023

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	1	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Administration Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	1	12:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Budget and Finance Committee	Wednesday	1	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Wednesday	8	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	8	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	15	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Wednesday	15	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Wednesday	15	3:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	27	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon, and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Date: January 30, 2023

Re: Approval of the Advisory Council Meeting Minutes of September 12, 2022

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of September 12, 2022.

BACKGROUND

None.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of September 12, 2022.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of September 12, 2022

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Advisory Council Meeting
Monday, September 12, 2022

DRAFT MINUTES

Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

This meeting was conducted under procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021). Members of the Advisory Council participated by teleconference.

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Advisory Council (Council) Co-Chairperson, Dr. Gina Solomon, called the meeting to order at 8:31 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Co-Chairpersons Drs. Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon; Members Dr. Danny Cullenward, Dr. Adrienne Hollis, Dr. Pallavi Phartiyal, Garima Raheja; and Board Liaison David Haubert.

Absent: Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman.

2. **PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**
3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 11, 2022**

Public Comments

No requests submitted.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Board Liaison Haubert made a motion, seconded by Co-Chair Rudolph, to **approve** Minutes of July 11, 2022; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Cullenward, Haubert, Hollis, Raheja, Rudolph, Solomon.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Kleinman, Phartiyal.

4. **FINE PARTICULATE MATTER LOCAL RISK METHODOLOGY UPDATE**

The Advisory Council received a presentation from Dr. David Holstius, “Fine Particulate Matter Local Risk Methodology Update.” Mr. Greg Nudd introduced the presentation by framing the methodology as a potential tool to strengthen the Air District’s permitting programs and land-use guidance. Staff described connections between the proposed methodology, the toxics methodology used in permitting carcinogenic emissions from individual sources, and the methodology used to estimate total population impacts of PM_{2.5} at a regional scale.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Kevin Buchan, Western States Petroleum Association.

Council Comments

Staff addressed questions concerning whether the methodology addresses short-term acute exposures; the aspects that make it a maximal-risk approach, and the relationship of that to a total or average population-impacts approach; the meaning of the Worker Adjustment Factor; whether the methodology addresses risks borne by unhoused populations; and the effective infiltration factor. In response to public comment, staff stated that the methodology was being developed in concert with other agencies, and that a 30-day comment window would be provided for the public release of the white paper. The Council remarked that while effect sizes may be small, we can have confidence in scientific estimates of them, and that reporting confidence intervals could help. The Council recommended the provision of more detail regarding the studies used as a basis, any parameters that are not averages, and the method used to standardize effect sizes. The Council also recommended that clearer links be established to the Council’s previously published PM Report. The Council stated that some aspects of the methodology use health-protective assumptions, while others do not, or remain out of scope; but that, overall, an appropriate balance has been found. The Council concluded by requesting that staff look further into the issue of infiltration factors.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. **SOURCE PRIORITIZATION FRAMEWORK**

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Phartiyal was noted present at 10:20 a.m.

Mr. Nudd introduced Elizabeth Yura, Director of Rules and Strategic Policy, who have the staff presentation *Source Prioritization Framework*, including: outline; why set priorities; prioritization framework; the larger context; implications and questions; and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Tony Fisher, Coalition for Clean Air.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether the Air District has considered conducting an environmental justice analysis, and how equity affects the prioritization framework; concern about the fact that sources or strategies with primarily climate impact will likely be low-priority, and that the role of rules in climate efforts remain uncertain; whether the Air District plans to utilize a numerical ranking system and/or index when prioritizing rules making efforts; whether the Air District’s rulemaking development/analyses will always be made public; whether the Air District uses a narrative or quantitative framework to weigh each prioritization factor; the anticipated timeline for the prioritization framework process; the desire for regional modeling for woodsmoke impacts; the request for a ranking of the prioritization factors; the fact that Assembly Bill (AB) 398 (E. Garcia 2017) prevents air districts from adopting or implementing emissions reduction rules for carbon dioxide from sources subject to the Cap & Trade program, which lessens the Air District’s ability to regulate climate change; what happens if the public desires different priorities from what the Air District proposes; and the request that the list of prioritization factors be revised and brought back to the Council in November 2022 (expand the “Health & Equity” and “Other Impacts” factors, and create a “Climate Co-Benefits” factor.)

Council Action

None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

On behalf of Interim Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, Sharon L. Landers, Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, reported the following:

- The Air District’s newest AB 617 designation is East Oakland. The East Oakland Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee has been formed and will hold its first meeting on September 15, 2022 at 6:00pm (via Zoom.)
- During the heat wave of the week of September 5, 2022, the Air District issued six Spare the Air alerts, requesting that people limit their driving.
- Dr. Ranyee Chiang, Director of Meteorology and Measurement, was asked to provide a summary on recent air quality.

- The Air District is preparing to open over 300 “Clean Air Centers” throughout the Bay Area, when air quality is poor due to wildfires. Clean Air Centers are locations where residents can find respite from wildfire smoke during poor air quality. The Clean Air Center Program provides funding for county agencies in the Bay Area to create a network of Clean Air Centers to mitigate the adverse public health impacts due to wildfires. The program provides portable air cleaners or heating, ventilation, and air conditioning upgrades to schools and other buildings that can serve the public when air quality reaches unhealthy levels. More than 75 percent of Clean Air Centers in the Bay Area will benefit vulnerable communities most impacted by air pollution. The first location will be in the Bayview Hunters Point neighborhood of San Francisco.

7. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS/OTHER BUSINESS

Co-Chair Rudolph asked whether the Air District plans to educate the public about the correlation between rising heat and rising ozone levels.

Member Raheja asked whether the Air District plans to partner with indigenous communities regarding cultural burn events and fire practices. She also asked the time of day by which controlled burns must cease.

Co-Chair Solomon asked whether Spare the Air alerts are issued/advertised in indigenous languages, and if so, how the alerts are being issued in languages that are only spoken and not written.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the end of the meeting, the next meeting was to be held on November 14, 2022, but after the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Monday, January 30, 2023, at 8:30 a.m., via webcast, teleconference, and Zoom, under procedures authorized by Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021) allowing remote meetings.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon, and Members of the Advisory Council

From: Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Date: January 30, 2023

Re: Update on the Proposed Methodology for Determining Local Health Risks from Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5})

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; presentation only.

BACKGROUND

The Air District has received public comments on a draft white paper, *Modeling Local Sources of Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) for Risk Management*, and an accompanying spreadsheet that proposes and illustrates a methodology for modeling health risks attributable to local sources of fine particulate matter, or PM_{2.5}. The purpose of this methodology is to support the assessment and regulation of health risks from PM_{2.5} at a local level. This proposed methodology has been developed by the Air District with guidance from the Air District's Advisory Council and in consultation with staff at the United States Environmental Protection Agency, the California Air Resources Board, and California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment.

DISCUSSION

At the last Advisory Council meeting (September 2022), the Council requested that staff look into the issue of PM_{2.5} infiltration factors. Today, staff will update the Council on a recommended adjustment to the methodology that is responsive to that request.

In October 2022 – November 2022, the Air District sought public comments regarding the content of the methodology itself. Comments were received from three organizations and one individual:

- California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance
- Citizen Air Monitoring Network
- Western States Petroleum Association
- Dr. Julia Walsh

Staff will present a brief overview of the types of comments received, focusing on themes that pertain to the content of the proposed methodology itself (as opposed to, e.g., potential applications or policy implications). Staff will also highlight the aspects of the proposed methodology that received the most significant attention.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: David Holstius
Reviewed by: Phil Martien & Greg Nudd

ATTACHMENTS:

None

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon, and Members of the Advisory Council

From: Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Date: January 30, 2023

Re: Comments on the Proposed Methodology for Determining Local Health Risks from Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5})

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; presentation only.

BACKGROUND

The Air District received public comments on a draft white paper, Modeling Local Sources of Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) for Risk Management, and an accompanying spreadsheet that proposes and illustrates a methodology for modeling health risks attributable to local sources of fine particulate matter, or PM_{2.5}. The purpose of this methodology is to support the assessment and regulation of health risks from PM_{2.5} at a local level. This proposed methodology has been developed by the Air District with guidance from the Air District's Advisory Council and in consultation with staff at the United States Environmental Protection Agency, the California Air Resources Board, and California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment.

DISCUSSION

In October 2022, the Air District released the draft white paper, Modeling Local Sources of Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) for Risk Management, to its website and sent an eblast to interested stakeholders, seeking public comment and feedback on the content of the methodology. The public comment period closed in late November 2022, and the Air District received public comment from four organizations and individuals.

The Air District extended invitations to each commentor to present and share information with the Advisory Council. Today, the Advisory Council will receive presentations from three of the organizations that provided public comment:

- Christine Wolfe, Policy and Communications Director, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance
- Ken Szutu, Founder and Director, Citizen Air Monitoring Network
- Dr. Julie Goodman, Gradient, on behalf of Western States Petroleum Association

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: David Holstius & Sonam Shah-Paul
Reviewed by: Phil Martien & Greg Nudd

ATTACHMENTS:

None

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Linda Rudolph and Gina Solomon, and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Date: January 30, 2023

Re: Revision of the PM_{2.5} National Ambient Air Quality Standard: The Role of Air
Monitoring Data

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; presentation only.

BACKGROUND

The U.S. National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS, pronounced /'næks/ naks) are limits on atmospheric concentration of six pollutants that cause serious health hazards as well as smog and acid rain. Of these six pollutants, in the Bay Area, the concentrations of fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) and ozone are closest to the NAAQS. On January 6, 2023, the U.S. EPA announced their decision for the reconsideration of the particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) standard. They proposed to revise the annual PM_{2.5} standard to be more stringent, which may put the Bay Area above the new NAAQS, depending on where it is set. The Bay Area will likely be required to develop and submit a federally enforceable plan to attain the new, more health protective standard. For ozone, the EPA has determined that the Bay Area met the ozone NAAQS (8-hour). However, our most recent air monitoring station data indicates we may bounce above and below this standard in the coming years.

DISCUSSION

Air District staff will provide preliminary information on the recent proposal from EPA as well as background information about the activities that occur after the NAAQS is revised. The presentation will include a review of NAAQS, how monitoring data is used to calculate a design value (the statistic that is compared to the NAAQS), an example of PM_{2.5} trends relative to current and proposed NAAQS, and how wildfire data impacts design values. Staff will also introduce the implications for a revised PM_{2.5} NAAQS and the policy challenges for significantly reducing ambient PM concentrations. We will be responding to the EPA proposed rulemaking on the NAAQS and continue to evaluate our air monitoring data for designations and NAAQS implementation.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Sharon L. Landers
Interim Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Ranyee Chiang, Kate Hoag
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

ATTACHMENTS:

None