Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Advisory Council Meeting
Monday, March 16, 2026

APPROVED MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Greg Nudd, Deputy Executive Officer of Policy, acting as meeting facilitator, called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m. This was the first meeting for two new Advisory Council (Council) members (Baldassare and Colburn); the other five members (Carlton, Holm, Martien, Raheja Schmeltz) had been reappointed from the previous Council configuration.

   Roll Call:

   Present: Chairperson Dr. Phil Martien; Vice Chairperson Professor Ann Marie Grover Carlton; and Members Dr. Daniel Baldassare, Melanie Colburn, Dr. Garima Raheja, and Dr. Michael Schmeltz.

   Absent: Dr. Stephanie Holm and Board Liaison Lynda Hopkins.

CONSENT CALENDAR

2. **APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETINGS OF DECEMBER 8, 2025**

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Prof. Carlton made a motion, seconded by Dr. Martien, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of December 8, 2025; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Baldassare, Carlton, Martien, Raheja, Schmeltz.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Colburn, Holm, Hopkins.

ACTION ITEMS

3. **ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

Mr. Nudd asked the Council to consider electing a Chair and Vice Chair to serve for the duration of the 2026-2027 term.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Discussion

None.

Council Action

Prof. Carlton made a motion, seconded by Dr. Raheja, to **appoint** Dr. Martien as Chairperson of the Advisory Council for the duration of the 2026-2027 term; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Baldassare, Carlton, Martien, Raheja, Schmeltz.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Colburn, Holm, Hopkins.

Dr. Martien made a motion, seconded by Dr. Schmeltz, to **appoint** Prof. Carlton as Vice Chairperson of the Advisory Council for the duration of the 2026-2027 term; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Baldassare, Carlton, Martien, Raheja, Schmeltz.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Colburn, Holm, Hopkins.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

4. **OVERVIEW OF THE RALPH M. BROWN ACT**

Brian Case, Assistant Counsel, gave the staff presentation *The Ralph M. Brown Act, as Applied to the Advisory Council,* including: topics to be covered; purpose of the Brown Act; are all meetings covered; the noticed agenda; conducting the meeting (loss of quorum, tips for effective meetings, removal for disruptive conduct); conducting the public meeting (public

comment); pathways for remote participation (just cause); conduct outside public meetings (email risks, role of staff); and penalties for Brown Act violations.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed requirements (including physical distance, quorum, and just cause participation) for remote teleconferencing participation; how often just cause participation may be utilized by each Council member per calendar year; and whether the Council would have to officially vote on implementing remote teleconferencing locations for its meetings. No action was taken, but the consensus of the Council was to consider utilizing remote locations for future Council meetings.

Council Action

No action taken

5. OVERVIEW OF CUMULATIVE IMPACTS WORKPLAN

Continuing the process from the Council's December 8, 2025 meeting, the Council considered making further refinements and additions to the proposed Cumulative Impacts Work Plan, including a newly expanded Appendix B entitled, "The Advisory Council's Interim Findings" (approved July 2024) and "Working Draft Outline for Cumulative Impacts Findings and Recommendations (considered December 2025)," developed by the Work Plan Ad Hoc Subcommittee. Chair Dr. Philip Martien facilitated the Council's discussion, and Air District staff provided feedback for each of the eight Working Draft Outline for Cumulative Impacts Findings and Recommendations.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Discussion

Chair Dr. Philip Martien introduced the workplan as a living document intended to guide development of recommendations to the Air District on how cumulative impacts should be incorporated into agency work. Chair Martien explained that the Council's prior work, beginning in 2024, narrowed the focus to cumulative impacts in permitting, especially how the Air District might better identify and reduce burdens from new or modified sources of air pollution. The Council discussed the workplan structure, including the background on cumulative impacts and existing Air District activities, methods for developing Council's recommendations, expected work product and timeline, interim key findings, and draft recommendations captured in the appendices. The Council expressed interest in setting a goal to complete a recommendation document during calendar year 2026.

Chair Martien said he would seek volunteers to form an ad hoc committee to help draft the recommendations document; staff and counsel noted that members interested in participating should contact Chair Martien outside the meeting to preserve the ad hoc status under the Brown Act.

Council members continued the discussion on the cumulative impacts workplan with the following major themes:

A. Improving impact assessment methods

The Council revisited earlier ideas in Table 1 of the workplan: adding background concentrations into hazard index calculations, because current methods often consider only the incremental emissions from a source and not existing community exposure levels; summing hazards across multiple target organs, drawing on research work conducted by Johns Hopkins University; considering place-based approaches, such as maps (for example, CalEnviroScreen-style approaches), to apply stricter review in overburdened communities; and increasing community representation in assessment and permitting processes.

Staff responded that the Air District had already been planning better air toxics monitoring and modeling, including expanded monitoring and refinery-adjacent community stations, which may help improve background estimates over time. Work is underway with Johns Hopkins University related to the implementation of multi-organ hazard assessment methods, though this will take time. The Air District already applies some place-based permitting protections in high-burden census tracts, and staff are now exploring a more layered approach to enhance community protections.

B. Clarifying “uninventoried” and facility-related sources

The Council’s discussion clarified that one concern was emissions within the facility fenceline that may not be fully captured in the permitting inventory or risk analysis, such as fugitive emissions, equipment degradation, or other non-routine sources. Staff also noted related community concerns about nearby light industrial operations, dust, and other local sources that may not always be well represented in emission inventories. The Council discussion suggested that some of these issues may be better captured through improved background measurement, more targeted enforcement, facility-wide review, or deeper review under existing rules.

C. Stressors and health impact assessment

The Council discussed whether factors such as odors, flaring, accidents, or repeated permit violations should be treated as stressors that affect community health and vulnerability, even when they are not easily incorporated into a traditional hazard calculation. Council members also discussed the concept of a Health Impact Assessment, but did not appear strongly supportive of a traditional health impact assessment model if it would be highly resource-intensive without clear practical value in permitting decisions.

D. Options for reducing cumulative impacts

The Council reviewed Table 2, which focuses on actions to reduce cumulative impacts, including: lower thresholds for requiring best available control technology (BACT) or toxic BACT in overburdened communities, tighter environmental review thresholds, enhanced public engagement, consideration of facility compliance history, limits on near-source $PM_{2.5}$ impacts, no-net-increase concepts or caps in overburdened communities, lower risk thresholds, support for existing-facility risk reduction efforts under Rule 11-18, community benefits agreements, and prohibiting some permit types in certain communities.

Staff responded that some of these ideas are already underway or partially reflected in current practices, especially place-based approaches, lower risk thresholds in certain areas, strengthened enforcement, and amendments to Rule 11-18 to improve implementation. Staff indicated they would bring back additional material—especially on the "layered" approach and aspects of the current permitting framework—to support future Council deliberation.

Chair Martien concluded that the discussion was productive and helped refocus the Council on its recommendations and outstanding questions requiring further consideration. As next steps, Council members interested in serving on an ad hoc committee were invited to notify the Chair. The ad hoc committee is expected to meet with staff to begin drafting initial recommendations, document questions and discussion points raised during the meeting, and coordinate with staff to address unresolved items. Chair Martien also indicated that future meetings would benefit from additional information on the layered effect, the permitting process, and updates on existing efforts related to the initial items listed in Table 2.

Council Action

No action taken.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (APCO)

Mr. Nudd waived this item.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS

Council member Colburn asked about the manner in which the Air District interacts with other public agencies.

Chair Martien suggested that Air District staff hold an onboarding for the new Council members.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the end of the meeting, the next meeting of the Advisory Council was scheduled for Monday, May 4, 2026. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting of the Advisory Council was scheduled for Monday, June 15, 2026, at 9:00 a.m. The meeting will be held in-person at the Bay Area Metro Center. Members of the public may also attend virtually via webcast.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:24 a.m.

/S/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards
Executive Office

/S/ Dr. Song Bai
Dr. Song Bai
Director
Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling