Bay Area Air Quality Management District 375 Beale Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, California 94105 (415) 749-5073

#### **APPROVED MINUTES**

Community Advisory Council Thursday, January 13, 2022

This meeting was conducted pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361.

Members of the Council participated by teleconference.

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Air District Community Engagement, Senior Air Quality Engineer, Brian Butler, called the first meeting of the Community Advisory Council to order at 6:00 pm.

Present: Dr. Juan Aguilera, Fernando Campos, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret

Gordon, Arieann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha

Washington.

Absent: None.

# **Council Comments:**

Council members expressed concern regarding the facilitation of the meeting by Staff. Council member Ms. Margaret Gordon questioned why staff was facilitating the meeting without permission from the Council.

All Council members were provided the opportunity to state if they were comfortable with staff facilitating this meeting until a Chair is selected. The majority of Council members who responded stated they would accept the meeting move forward in this format, for this first meeting.

# 2. WELCOME FROM THE CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND EXECUTIVE STAFF

The Board of Directors Chairperson, Karen Mitchoff, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, Jack Broadbent, and Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, Veronica Eady, provided introductions and opening remarks.

Chair Mitchoff introduced herself, thanked members for attending, stated the election of a Chair and Co-Chair will be the first item on the agenda of the next Council Meeting, and noted the Council will need to adopt the Robert Rules of Order. Chair Mitchoff shared that the first gathering of this Council was a historic moment; that the Council will be instrumental in shaping the Air

District's work around equity and environmental justice issues; and thanked Council members for their time and commitment to the Council.

Mr. Broadbent introduced himself; echoed Chair Mitchoff's comments; restated the significance of this Council; and that the wisdom provided by members is invaluable to the Air District. Mr. Broadbent thanked community advocates and members.

Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, Veronica Eady, thanked everyone for coming to the meeting; welcomed the Council members; introduced herself; and shared that over the last two years the Air District's has made steps leading to this moment, including forming the Community Equity, Health, and Justice Committee, hiring an Environmental Justice Officer, and the leadership of the Board in the space of racial equity. Ms. Eady highlighted that the Air District is working on issues like strengthen permitting rules and increasing funding to community organizations and will be looking to the Council for guidance on supporting community members, organizations, and mitigating air pollution in their communities. Ms. Eady thanked members for their commitment and invited members to reach out to her personally.

#### **Public Comments**

Public Comment was given by Mr. Shankar, a resident from Milpitas, who shared concerns regarding the smell from the nearby Newby Island landfill, disproportionate effects on the Asian population, and discriminatory comments.

# **Council Comments**

Chair Mitchoff shared that the Board of Directors is familiar with the issue raised in public comment and noted it is an agenda item for the Stationary Source & Climate Impacts Committee.

The Council and staff discussed clarification regarding the Council's role, tasks, and jurisdiction; a scoping plan; the method for selecting agenda items; connection and communication with the Board and California Air Resources Board (CARB); communication protocols with staff; how to process community complaints bought up during public comment to the Council; and the request that information about staff divisions and responsibilities be shared with Council members.

The Council requested the following: the presence of relevant staff at Council meetings to address community complaints relevant to their divisions; an update on Air District Regulation 6-5; the Air District's considerations for electrification energy use; and for the Air District to deliberate and include the Human Rights Commission's stance on clean air as a human right.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### 3. COUNCIL INTRODUCTIONS

Mr. Butler introduced Environment Justice and Community Engagement Officer, Suma Peesapati. Ms. Peesapati introduced herself and welcomed Community Advisory Council members.

The Council members present gave short introductions about themselves, sharing their organizational affiliation, and experience.

#### **Public Comments**

No requests received.

#### **Council Comments**

None.

# Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### 4. OVERVIEW OF THE RALPH M. BROWN ACT

Mr. Butler, introduced, Adan Schwartz, Acting District Counsel, who gave the presentation *Overview of the Ralph M. Brown Act*, including Brown Act Fundamentals; Relationship to Parliamentary Procedure; Legislative Bodies Under the Brown Act; Brown Act Meetings; Virtual Meeting Under the Brown Act; Voting; and Public Comment.

### **Council Comments**

The Council requested a meeting of the members to become more familiarized with one another; a binder with printed information on the Council members and Brown Act; and the extension of meeting(s) to provide space for members to interact, with staff support. Staff noted they will provide the requested binder and will present a ideas to the Council with options to accommodate the requests that allow for members to interact with one another without violating the Brown Act.

Staff provided clarification that a quorum of the Council is 9 members; the Brown Act does not prohibit social gatherings so long as the business of the committee is not discussed if a quorum is present.

The Council and staff discussed the Council's requests for smaller social meetings and budget for such; Staff confirmed there is budget to support the Council's request and staff will propose ideas for social gatherings for the Council to consider.

#### **Public Comments**

Tonia Randell of the Marie Harrison Community Foundation provided public comment asking if there has been money allocated for community individual testing of members of different communities as to the health impacts and reporting to gauge how communities have been affected; shared that finding this information online is difficult; and asked for specific tests for individuals to use that pertain to the toxins and air quality in their areas.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

#### 5. INTRODUCTION OF THE AIR DISTRICT

Mr. Butler, introduced, Ms. Eady who gave the presentation *Introduction to the Air District* including Mission Statement; Air District Background; Air District Overview; Bay Area Air Quality Management District Organizational Chart; Executive Officers, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officers (DAPCOs); Accessing Community Advisory Council Materials; and Next Meeting.

# **Council Comments**

Council members asked for clarification and an update on the Enforcement, Policy, and Permitting Divisions' performance and enforcement plans to control the smells that community members are experiencing. The Council requested that this topic be an agenda item for the next meeting.

Council members asked to hear from staff directly about their programs and existing work.

Council members and staff discussed the Community Equity and Health Committee's (Committee) connection or relationship to the Council. Staff noted the Council is encouraged to interact with the Committee; staff will invite the Chair or Co-Chairs of the Committee to the next Council meeting; staff or a Committee member will give a presentation about the Committee at the next Council Meeting; and the Committee Meeting agendas will be shared with the Council going forward.

Council members requested clarification on how to select agenda items for upcoming meetings; the methods for communication amongst members, staff, and the board.

Council members requested that reports from other committees and boards be provided to the Council prior to their next meeting.

Council members shared that the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) Network meetings and reports may be helpful resources for Council members.

# **Public Comments**

No requests received.

#### Council Action

None: receive and file.

#### 6. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

Mr. Broadbent reported included a welcome to the Council members; he shared that the Air District is looking forward to working with the Council.

#### 7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Tonia Randell of the Marie Harrison Community Foundation provided public comment asking if there will be an allocation of funds to communities for individual testing of health impacts on community and reporting of health impacts to be able to track and document health trends in areas affected by poor air quality.

# **Council Comments**

Staff suggested that Air District's community grants, awards, and solicitation cycle be a topic for a future Council meeting; and that some grantees who are members of the Council may want to talk about their work under their grant funding.

Council members requested an update on the state of community monitoring and would like this to be an agenda item in a future meeting.

#### 8. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

# **Council Comments**

Council members thanked staff; and shared objectives to connect with community on topics for future meetings.

Council members requested clarification on the previous public comment regarding community testing and health monitoring, and the staff-suggested solution to share information about the allocation of grant funds; the Council members would like to understand the follow-up or process for the public comment(s) that are not on the agenda.

Council members noted that the Air District does not provide biomonitoring as an operational or administrative service; the Air District may grant community to do such monitoring; and in a recent news article about a doctor in Bayview Hunters Point who is doing biomonitoring based on the chemical contaminations, there was no clarification that the Air District gave funding for biomonitoring.

Council members requested that staff provides clarification on community health monitoring, including the actions and activities the Air District is doing for tracking of the health and funding allocations, and about the grant funds and their approved uses.

Staff shared their contact information with the public, should they want more information about the Air District's community grant programs.

Council members requested agenda items be added for Council member deliberation and that staff should not provide quick solutions; Council members requested the following topic to be added to the agenda for the next meeting: clarification on the actions and activities the Air District is using to track health and information about Air District grants.

Council members requested further clarification on their role; and would like to know if the Council be solving individual problems or is the Council deliberating over processes wherein an

individual problem could be used as a case for the Council as a whole to find a system-wide process or solution to benefit all community members.

#### Committee Action

Council member Arieann Harrison made a motion, seconded by Council member John Jefferson to add an agenda item to the next meeting regarding the public comment that requested a presentation on community health monitoring, including the Air District's actions and activities for tracking community health, funding allocations for the tracking of such, and about Air District community grants, awards, and solicitation cycle. Council member Ms. Margaret Gordon called for the question, and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Dr. Juan Aguilera, Fernando Campos, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret,

Gordon, Arieann Harrison, John Jefferson, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Violet Saena,

Ken Szutu, Latasha Washington.

NOES: None. ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Joy Massey, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez.

#### 9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

With no current Chair, Mr. Butler announced that the next meeting was not yet calendared; staff will be in touch with Council members to schedule the next meeting in March 2022 on Zoom in accordance with Assembly Bill 361.

# 10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:41 p.m.

/S/ Mona Alboud

Mona Abboud InterEthnica (contracted service)