

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Community Advisory Council
Wednesday, March 30, 2022

**This meeting was conducted pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361.
Members of the Council participated by teleconference.**

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Randolph Belle of Randolph Belle, Artist (RBA) Creative, called the meeting to order at 6:01pm.

Present: Dr. Juan Aguilera, Fernando Campos, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret Gordon, Arieann Harrison, Kevin John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha Washington.

Absent: None.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mr. Belle introduced Marcy Hiratzka, Clerk of the Boards, who led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Public Meeting Procedure video was played.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JANUARY 13, 2022

The Council members requested no edits to the Meeting Minutes of January 13, 2022.

Public Comment

No requests received.

Council Comments

Note: The following Council comments were made *after* the vote to approve the Minutes of January 13, 2022, and did not pertain to the Minutes of January 13, 2022.

Council member Jefferson shared his concerns about the chat function not being accessible during this meeting and requested that the chat function be in use for future meetings.

Council member Ruano Hernandez requested that a Land Acknowledgement be spoken at the beginning of each meeting, moving forward.

Council member Mendoza requested clarification in regards to gathering contact information from public commenters for follow up purposes, and requested that the Council's bylaws address the topic.

Council member Jefferson requested that the Pledge of Allegiance not be recited at future meetings.

Council member Harrison noted the recent change in Air District leadership and requested that the Council conveys its interest to the Air District's Board of Directors in participating in the selection process of the new Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO).

Council Action

Council member Ritterman made a motion, seconded by Council member Gordon to **approve** the Meeting Minutes of January 13, 2022, and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret, Gordon, Arieann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Violet Saena, Latasha Washington.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez.

ABSENT: Fernando Campos, Ken Szutu.

8.1 REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

Mr. Belle introduced Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, who introduced Alexander "Sandy" Crockett as the Interim Executive Officer/APCO. Mr. Crockett gave remarks about his commitment to ensure the work of this Council is supported and ongoing during the change in Air District leadership.

Public Comment

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

None; Receive and file.

6. VOTE ON STRUCTURE, GOVERNANCE, AND WORKPLAN

Mr. Bell introduced Suma Peesapati, Environmental Justice and Community Engagement Officer, who gave the presentation *Vote on Structure, Governance, and Work Plan*, including Requested Action; Leadership Structure; Chair & Vice-Chair Model; Chair and Officers Model; Two Co-Chair Model; Council Governance Document; Council Charter; Council Bylaws; Council Work Plan; and Requested Actions.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council discussed concerns about the receipt of an email calling for candidates who were interested in a leadership position. Council members Jefferson and Washington had expressed their interest in a leadership position via response to said email. Given the confusion about the email and receipt of such, the Council decided to nominate other candidates for leadership, during the meeting. Council member Mendoza nominated Council member Gordon, and as a result, the Council discussed having a three-co-chair leadership structure.

Council Action

Council member Reed made a motion, seconded by Council member Ruano Hernandez, to approve a three-co-chair leadership structure; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Godwin, Ms. Margaret Gordon, Arieann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha Washington.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Fernando Campos.

Council member Ruano Hernandez made a motion, seconded by Council member Reed, to approve tabling the vote on the decision concerning governing document structure until the leadership is selected and discusses the options, and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret Gordon, Arieann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha Washington.

NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Dr. Juan Aguilera, Fernando Campos.

Council member Ruano Hernandez made a motion, seconded by Council member Gordon, to adopt an ad hoc committee (comprised of six Councilmembers) who are to develop the Council's workplan and governance document, and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret Gordon, Ariann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha Washington.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Fernando Campos.

7. ELECTION OF COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL LEADERSHIP

Mr. Belle introduced Ms. Peesapati, who gave the presentation *Election of Community Advisory Council Leadership*, including Requested Action; Possible Responsibilities; and Statements from Candidates. At this time, Council members Gordon, Jefferson, and Washington gave their candidate statements, regarding their potential leadership, commitment to the work, and experience to support their capabilities.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Council members thanked the candidates, acknowledged their capabilities, and congratulated them on their election, as they were the only three candidates seeking leadership positions.

Council Action

Dr. Ritterman made a motion, seconded by Council member Harrison, to elect Council members Gordon, Jefferson, and Washington as the three co-chairs; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Ms. Margaret Gordon, Ariann Harrison, John Jefferson, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, Ken Szutu, and Latasha Washington.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Fernando Campos.

5. PRESENTATION ON BIOMONITORING FROM THE OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT

Mr. Bell introduced Stephanie Jarmul, Senior Environmental Scientist, of the California Environmental Protection Agency's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, who gave the presentation *Introduction to Biomonitoring and Example Projects* including What is Biomonitoring; Biomonitoring California; Why is Biomonitoring Useful?; Types of Projects and Example Findings; East Bay Diesel Project (EBDEP); EBDEP Overview; EBDEP- What Have We Learned So Far?; Stockton Air Pollution Exposure Project (SAPEP); and What's Next.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Council member Ruano Hernandez inquired about the projects' (1) measurement of particulate matter or other pollutants in addition to Diesel, (2) the data found from the Purple monitors in the schools, (3) the projects' time frame, (4) what produces flame retardants in homes, and the level of difficulty retrieving black carbon data; Council member Ruano Hernandez also suggested this presentation should be brought to the Richmond/San Pablo Community Emission Reduction Plan Steering Committee.

Council member Reed noted his concerns about inequities within the studies presented, asking if any of the studies have been conducted around the unhoused population. He expressed his hope that in the future this Council will be instrumental in holding agencies accountable in conducting studies more equitably. He also inquired about the follow up process used to engage with the studies participants post data collection.

Council member Mendoza inquired about the methodology by which community studies are chosen for the research, about what policies (if any) that result from the findings, and shared her shock about the toxicity of foam.

Council member Harrison suggested that Ms. Jarmul's organization partners with Dr. Porter and Dr. Dobrin in the Bayview District of San Francisco and to extend tox-screen analysis to include SO₂, diuranium, radioactive isotopes, and plutonium.

Council member Mejia inquired whether students, parents, and staff had access to the data from the Purple Air monitors.

Council member Szutu would like to understand the scale of the projects, asking about the capacity of people their program can take. He was also curious about the Purple Air data's interpretation with Diesel exposure.

Dr. Ritterman asked about the ability for teachers to administer urine samples from children to test for particulate matter in a more automated way and on an ongoing basis.

Council member Jefferson asked about the awareness of CalEnviro Screen and the number of zip codes within communities of color where studies have been conducted, He requested that the Council be shown where studies have been conducted, where future studies will happen, and the methodology of the studies.

Council member Gordon shared that the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project was a participant in one of the studies in 2018, noting her experience/organizational role finding families in the 94607 zip code through community engagement with key child centers. The study started in West Oakland, then included East Oakland, and then Richmond. Council member Gordon shared her frustration that the community is not aware of the public policy (if any) that has been instituted based on the data from the study and sharing policy action based on community study data continues to be an issue.

Council member Washington questioned the possibility of collecting urine samples from children on a broader scale, citing the logistical hurdles that occur when working with children.

Council member Goodwin inquired about how equity is written into the process at the time studies are allocated and questioned how they ensure that an equity lens is always applied.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

8.2 REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO

Ms. Eady provided a report on the Milpitas odor issue that was raised by the public at the January 13 meeting. Ms. Eady discussed the Air District's efforts to reach out to the gentlemen who provided public and provided information on variety of work being done currently at the Air District concerning the issue.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Dr. Ritterman inquired about the communication process with the Milpitas community to keep them informed.

Council member Szutu noted that the Council will want to follow up with the Milpitas community but also should continue to examine the monitoring issue, mentioning that this has been a concern for seven to ten years.

Co-Chair Jefferson reiterated his concern about the use of the chat function and was seeking feedback on the use of the chat function. Council member Massey shared that she would like to utilize the chat to comment (or agree with other comments noted) without raising her hand for

formal comment. Council member Massey said that she would like to understand the impact of the chat feature's use on the Brown Act and would like to know whether Council members may attend other stakeholder/Board meetings.

Council member Reed requested a status update regarding the Aggregate Stone Company and the tracking of its particulate matter and dust in the West Oakland Area.

Council member Harrison requested that the Council addresses the issue of Alice Griffith in San Francisco's Bayview District, which has been inundated with chemicals.

Council Action

None; Receive and file.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

10. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Co-Chair Gordon requested: (1) a full report on Alice Griffith, including an explanation as to why it took so long for the City Attorney to shut down the process and why it was not under the Air District's purview, (2) a presentation on the air monitoring studies among the nine Bay Area counties, and (3) an orientation on the services and connectivity of the Compliance & Enforcement and Meteorology & Measurement Divisions, including their processes when the community brings forth issues concerning odor, soil, or air issues within some communities.

Council member Mendoza requested that the Council makes biomonitoring a focus and a future discussion regarding how the Council can support this work in more communities, with more people, and to ensure that policies are resulting from those findings.

Dr. Ritterman requested a report about the restrictions of gas and oil drilling in Contra Costa County. Council member Ruano Hernandez offered to provide a presentation to the Council about his knowledge on this topic.

Council member Szutu requested that the Council creates a process to prioritize agenda items for the sake of time and effort to ensure there is a focus on items where Council member input and guidance where be most valuable. He also wondered whether the issue of enforcement and compliance should be handled in an ad hoc committee amongst Council members who are most interested, working closely with staff.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Mr. Belle noted that Air District Staff will coordinate the Co-Chairs to set the date and time of the next meeting, likely sometime in June, and that Council members should expect an email from Air District staff, regarding forms for stipends.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council discussed the potential benefits and disadvantages of a monthly meeting schedule, the level of work and dedication they have made in their past and current roles serving on other commissions or boards, and noted that the leadership structure of three co-chairs should help balance leadership responsibilities.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

12. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Belle adjourned the meeting at 9:48 P.M.

/s/ Briana Turk
Briana Turk
InterEthnica