Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Community Advisory Council
Thursday, March 16, 2023

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The meeting Facilitator, Randolph Belle of Randolph Belle, Artist (RBA) Creative, called the Community Advisory Council (Council) in-person meeting to order at 6:03 p.m. Council Co-Chairperson, Latasha Washington, congratulated the Council members and Air District staff on the Council's one-year anniversary. She also listed expectations and ground rules for every meeting of the Council.

Roll Call:

Present, In Person: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Fernando Campos, William Goodwin, Arieann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Participated Remotely, via Zoom (remote presence does not count for quorum, but votes are counted for all action items): Council Member Rio Molina (just cause).

Absent: Council Member Dr. Juan Aguilera.

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Facilitator provided an overview of Public Meeting Procedures.

CONSENT CALENDAR

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JANUARY 19, 2023

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Co-Chair Ms. Margaret Gordon requested that her comments within Item 11 (Committee Member Comments/Other Business), regarding leading a workshop at the Air District's upcoming Youth

for the Environment and Sustainability (YES) Conference, be revised to reflect her request for staff follow-up.

Council Action

Council Member Ruano Hernandez made a motion, seconded by Council Member Harrison, to **approve** the revised Meeting Minutes of January 19, 2023, and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Campos, Goodwin, Gordon, Harrison, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Reed, Ritterman, Ruano Hernandez, Saena, Szutu, Washington.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Aguilera, Molina, Pelagio.

Motion Approved

ACTION ITEM

4. VOTE ON COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHARTER

Council Member, William Goodwin, gave the presentation *Vote on the Community Advisory Council Charter*, including: requested action; Governance Ad Hoc Committee; Council Charter; changes; and next steps.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether there is a provision in the proposed Charter about the Council holding retreats; whether the required civility training is equivalent to the required ethics training, and how often both need to be completed by Council Members; co-chair terms and rotation, and who decides this (Council Members versus Air District staff); concerns about retroactive implementation of policy regarding the Council, and the desire for immediate implementation, moving forward; whether special elections for new co-chairs will be allowed, if needed; and the suggestion of limiting the number of co-chairs.

NOTED PRESENT: Council Member Pelagio was noted present at 6:42 p.m.

During the meeting, Council Members made revisions to the following sections of the proposed Charter:

- 1.3 Leadership
- 1.3.2 Leadership (Co-Chairs) Terms of Office

- 1.3.3 Terms of Leadership

Council Action

Co-Chair Washington made a motion, seconded by Council member Reed, to recommend the revised Community Advisory Council Charter to the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee and the Board of Directors for approval; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Campos, Goodwin, Gordon, Harrison, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Molina, Pelagio, Reed, Ritterman, Ruano Hernandez, Saena, Szutu, Washington.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Aguilera.

Motion Approved

THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 6:56 P.M., AND RESUMED AT 7:08 P.M.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

5. **DISCUSS THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL 2023-2024 WORK PLAN**

Council Member, Ken Szutu, gave the presentation *Discuss Community Advisory Council 2023-2024 Work Plan,* including: informational item; Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee; Work Plan purpose; priority rating matrix; and Council Work Plan.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the desire for more specific details in the Work Plan; the desire for the Work Plan to be based on the needs expressed by community members; the desire for Council Members to learn about the environmental justice and Air District Compliance & Enforcement activities in each other's communities; challenges presented by the Ralph M. Brown Act; ways in which presentations from communities of each Bay Area county could be presented to the Council; the suggestion of holding town hall meetings in each Bay Area county to discuss Air District Compliance & Enforcement and remediation strategies; the desire to see home electrification prioritized; the desire to see designated Bay Area Assembly Bill (AB) 617 communities learn from each other's strategies to reduce exposure to air pollutants in neighborhoods most impacted by air pollution, as new communities are selected by the California Air Resources Board each year; the desire for members of the community to set program timelines, and not Air District staff; the desire for Council Member field trips to impacted communities of each Bay Area county; the request for the appointment of a Board Liaison to the Council; the

suggestion of holding listening sessions (in breakout sessions) during Council meetings, and reporting back to the Council on what was heard; and utilizing Air District program status reports (James Carey Smith grants and AB 617 community reports) as a means to learn the activities within all of the Bay Area counties.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

6. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE POLICY AD HOC COMMITTEE UPDATE

Council Member Ruano Hernandez gave an update from the Environmental Justice Policy Ad Hoc Committee, including:

— The continued focus of the Environmental Justice Policy Ad Hoc Committee is the Council's Environmental Justice Policy Action Plan. The Ad Hoc Committee has met with both Air District staff and selected consultant, Metropolitan Group, to develop the Council's Environmental Justice Policy Action Plan. Members of this ad hoc committee divided into sub-groups to flesh out key elements of the proposed action plan. The sub-groups gathered information on rules, activities, and processes of various Air District divisions, and added technical details and measurable activities to the proposed action plan, relevant to those divisions. The Ad Hoc Committee would like to see an improved environmental justice focus within the Air District's Legal, Engineering, and Compliance & Enforcement Divisions.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed next steps, after the draft policy is finalized.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

7. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER / AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (APCO)

Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity, introduced new Executive Officer/APCO, Dr. Philip M. Fine, who gave remarks on the following items:

— Updates about the designated AB 617 communities of Richmond, East Oakland, West Oakland, and Bayview Hunters Point will be emailed to the Council Members regularly. Co-Chair Ms. Margaret Gordon requested that Council Members be informed of when these groups are meeting.
— On March 15, 2023, the Air District's Board of Directors adopted amendments to Regulation 9, Rules 4 and 6 to eliminate emissions of nitrogen oxides from residential and commercial natural gas furnaces and water heaters in the Bay Area by requiring new appliances to be zero-NOx, starting 2027. The Air District is committed to identifying financial assistance tools for residents during implementation. The Council will be asked to help develop such strategies through an equity lens.
— Air District staff is meant to partner with the Council to make the Council's work possible and effective.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Three written public comments had been submitted via email, but Assistant District Counsel advised that because two of the comments were regarding Air District regulations that were already adopted, and one comment did not fall within the AD's jurisdiction, the three comments did not need to be read or addressed. The consensus of the Council Members present was that the three emails did not have to be read.

9. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Council Member Mejia:

— requested explanations for previously scheduled public Air District meetings that were cancelled.
— requested that Air District staff send Community Benefit Fund Ad Hoc Committee meeting reminders to the Council members as soon as possible.

Council Member Mendoza expressed concern about language that was captured in both the Council's proposed Charter (which was approved at the meeting) and the talking points regarding expectations of conduct, read by the Co-Chairs at the beginning of each Council meeting. She proposed changing "Personal attacks will not be tolerated" to softer language. Miriam Torres, Senior Advanced Projects Advisor, said that the language could be revised when it is read as part of the expectations of conduct, but that the Council would have to vote on changing that language in the charter, as it was already approved.

Council Member Ruano Hernandez:

— stated that the Richmond office of Communities for a Better Environment held a meeting for young adults, and he relayed the desires of the youth that spoke, including an air quality monitoring program to better understand air pollution in Richmond, utilize PurpleAir monitors and community sensors, hold actions at difference hot spots in Richmond (Chevron, Chemtrade, Amazon warehouse, etc.), and conduct lobbying visits to push for climate action legislation.

— mentioned that he was invited to visit various community colleges, hosted by Student Senate for California Community Colleges, to address environmental justice issues. He shared other students' perceptions of Air District activities and opportunities.
— described the curriculum he is helping develop for a community college-level environmental ethics course.
— described his experience holding listening sessions and town hall meetings within the Contra Costa College District and the development of multiple action plans and subsequent grants to promote students' desired priorities.

Council Member Reed reiterated the Council's desire for a Board Liaison.

10. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, May 18, 2023, at 6:00 p.m. at a location to be determined. The meeting will also be webcast for members of the public.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 9:33 p.m.

/S/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards