

CARE Task Force Meeting Summary
(DRAFT)
July 18, 2006

ATTENDEES:

Task Force Members

Pamela Evans (Alameda Co. Env. Health), Eric Fujita (DRI), James Fine (USF), Eric Roberts (Calif. Env. Health Tracking Program), Kevin Buchan (WSPA), Shankar Prasad (CARB, via phone), Margaret Gordon (WOEIP)

Members of the Public

Wafaa Aborashed (EJAQC), Richard Grow (USEPA), Linda Weiner (BACATF), Ken Kloc (BAEHC, ELJC), Justin Scoggins (UCSC, via phone), Amy Cohen (CBE, via phone), Harold Brazil (MTC, via phone)

Air District Staff

Jack Broadbent, Jean Roggenkamp, Peter Hess, Brian Bunger, Henry Hilken, Gary Kendall, Brian Bateman, Jack Colbourn, Scott Lutz, Eric Stevens, Amir Fanai, Daphne Chong, Darrell Waller, Phil Martien

Air District Consultant

Stephen Reid (Sonoma Tech. Inc.)



INTRODUCTIONS (J. Broadbent)

J. Broadbent: It has been a while since our last meeting. We have been busy working on the CARE program. There have been changes in staff: P. Martien is the new project manager.

All: Introductions

J. Broadbent: Please note the agenda

(http://www.baaqmd.gov/CARE/documents/agenda_care_07_18_06.pdf).

There is a public comment period at end, item 6. We would like to hold public comments to the end of the meeting. The CARE program continues to be an important program. In this new fiscal year, there is a commitment to the program from the District's Board.

- \$1M was allocated to the CARE program,
- we expect to hold more frequent meetings of the TF,
- a variety of efforts are underway,
- it makes sense to us to incorporate findings/results as they are developed to help focus mitigation strategies as the program evolves.

W. Aborashed: Can we discuss alternates in case TF members can't attend?

J. Broadbent: Let's postpone that discussion until the discussion period (agenda item 5).



REVIEW & STATUS (P. Martien)

P. Martien: Presentation of slides

(http://www.baaqmd.gov/CARE/documents/care_intro_tf_071806_2.pdf)

The CARE Program is a three phase project. We are nearing the completion of Phase I, development of a screening-level emissions inventory of toxic air contaminants (TAC) and associated support studies.

M. Gordon: What part of Phase I work is not completed? Please make materials available so TF can comment. Seek resident input on draft population-weighted emissions maps. Why isn't West Oakland diesel PM shown as higher? This is just not correct.

H. Hilken: We will revise maps to provide more up-to-date information. We recognize that the current maps under-represent West Oakland. We will be updating the relevant maps.

E. Roberts: When do TF members provide input? Be clear when we're being asked for input vs. District just presenting review materials. A timeline would help us know when we should provide review.

P. Martien: More materials will be made available for TF review online. We will seek more feedback between meetings.

K. Kloc: Will materials for review be available to members of the public?

J. Broadbent: Materials made available to TF will be made available to members of the public.

J. Fine: How do emissions estimates compare to monitored data?

M. Gordon: Why are we just talking about cancer and not talking about asthma and respiratory disease? Is there duplication of efforts? Why is BAAQMD doing the same work as ARB? We need greater detail at the block level.

S. Prasad: It will take much more effort to extend analyses to the block level. We need to allow time to develop such products.

J. Fine: Identify how disadvantaged communities will benefit from CARE program. Show two-year schedule/timeline with meetings and input/decision points. What happened to the pilot project?

J. Broadbent: We will discuss pilot project during later discussion of Port of Oakland joint project with CARB and the Port. We are working with ARB, not to duplicate efforts, but to compliment efforts.

A. Cohen: Suggest that the District look at ethnicity in future analyses.



TAC EMISSIONS INVENTORY DEVELOPMENT (S. Reid)

S. Reid: Presentation of slides

(http://www.baaqmd.gov/CARE/documents/sti_presentation_07182006.pdf). Starting from PM10 and total organic gases (TOG) estimates for on-road mobile and area-source emissions and from speciated toxic point-source emissions provided by the District, STI has helped the District to develop a screening-level emissions inventory for TAC. On-road mobile and area sources are gridded to 2 kilometer by 2 kilometer resolution.

M. Gordon, E. Roberts: Share the technical data behind the inventory. TF is trying to understand the methods used to derive the inventory estimates.

P. Martien: Technical document will describe assumptions and methods. These will be put on our web site. (The Final Report prepared by STI.)

J. Fine: Two questions: What are the major uncertainties in the emissions inventory? What can communities provide in terms of feeding back information to the District?

S. Reid: I suggest focusing on categories with high emissions and with high uncertainties, e.g., construction equipment and diesel PM. To address such uncertainties, it would be useful to conduct surveys and ground-truthing. Communities could be useful for ground truthing, checking emissions within their grid cell.

J. Fine: Prepare a slide to list how the CARE program will benefit and involve community groups in the short-term and long-term.

G. Kendall: What are the relative fractions of on-road vs. off-road construction diesel fuel consumption?

S. Reid: I would expect that they are on the same order of magnitude.



FINDINGS & POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS (P. Martien)

P. Martien: Presentation of slides

(http://www.baaqmd.gov/CARE/documents/care_present_tf_071806_3.pdf)

- Diesel PM represents about 80% of the cancer risk in the Bay Area;
- acrolein is about 50% of the chronic, non-cancer risk and about 90% of the acute risk.
- We are planning to use the screening-level TAC emissions inventory, along with demographic and health data, to develop surrogates for TAC exposure for sensitive populations.
- We will tailor our TAC mitigation measures to focus on areas with high TAC exposures for sensitive populations.

In Phase II, we will apply local- and regional-scale models to estimate concentrations. This will include a joint HRA with the Port of Oakland and CARB. In Phase III, we will focus on estimating micro-scale TAC exposures.

J. Broadbent: Because of work to date, the District's thinking has evolved with respect to the pilot project. We are planning to focus our efforts at the Port of Oakland first, working with the Port and CARB. We will build off the Port and Railroad HRAs in West Oakland. This work will then inform other additional HRAs.

E. Roberts: Consider limitations associated with risk-weighting, for example, consider the acute health effects of acrolein. Should we be developing policy based on data that is so uncertain? How do we feel about basing our decision on uncertain risk factors?

J. Fine: Consider developing a matrix to categorize the types of uncertainties.

B. Bateman: Acute effects of all toxic air contaminants tend to be mild irritations. More weight is generally given to chronic (cancer and non-cancer) health effects.

M. Gordon: Why spend time on acute impacts (eye irritation)?

K. Buchan: With respect to the HRA, will the District calculate background risk, e.g. at a background site like Point Reyes? Discuss risk relative to the background.



DISCUSSION (All)

J. Fine: Exact numbers in emissions estimates and risk-weighted emissions estimates are not as important as the relative differences since we want to make comparisons.

M. Gordon: Tell cities to do health risk assessments for new development projects. Oakland planners are currently ignoring health issues.

E. Fujita: Use TAC monitoring data to evaluate emissions inventory estimates. For diesel PM and acrolein, this will involve developing correlations to other species that are measured. There are no direct measurements of diesel PM. Most sites don't measure acrolein. EC and black carbon can be used as markers for diesel PM. Acrolein can be correlated to 1,3-butadiene.

A. Cohen: Community groups want the District to pursue the pilot project to develop cumulative analysis tools that can be applied elsewhere.

J. Broadbent: I think there is a problem of semantics. What we are proposing in West Oakland is essentially a pilot project. Our work with the Port of Oakland and ARB will help us build tools in-house that we can use for additional HRAs. We'll discuss this more at future meetings.

S. Prasad: Can we meet more often?

L. Weiner: Meetings have been running longer than 2 hours. Can we set the agendas to reflect the actual time required?

M. Gordon: We should do a tour of the Port of Oakland, West Oakland neighborhoods, and proposed development sites.

W. Aborashed: Alternates?

J. Broadbent: What is the task force opinion of having an alternate? We request that one person be selected and that the District is notified of who the alternate will be.

J. Fine: If TF members are not attending, we should consider revising the TF membership to open up more slots.

K. Buchan: If we repopulate the TF, there should be a clear explanation of the criteria used to select new members. Also, it would be helpful if TF meetings started earlier.

J. Broadbent: Let's agendaize the discussion of alternates for the next TF meeting.

P. Martien: Next TF meeting is tentatively scheduled for Aug. 17th. The meeting time is to be determined. It will probably be 11 a.m. to 2 p.m.