

WEBVTT

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:00.000

It's the second webinar that the air district is hosting as part of our building decarbonisation webinar series. And there's more information on where to find the previous webinar and recording and how to subscribe to, you know, the notices for forthcoming

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:00.000

webinars on a slide, later on in the presentation.

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:01.000

Let's go to the second slide please go I'm going to start the recording now too.

00:00:01.000 --> 00:00:16.000

So, just so everyone knows this meeting will be recorded and will be hosted on our website later.

00:00:16.000 --> 00:00:18.000

Okay, great.

00:00:18.000 --> 00:00:23.000

So just a couple of slides about the air district.

00:00:23.000 --> 00:00:39.000

So the barrier Quality Management District is, this is the air quality regulator for the nine County, San Francisco Bay area are our goal traditionally has been achieved and maintained state and national quality standards, and that goal continues and

00:00:39.000 --> 00:00:56.000

is complemented by new priorities or newer priorities and objectives to help address the climate crisis and adverse public health impacts in our communities throughout the Bay Area, and specifically we strive to eliminate the public health disparities

00:00:56.000 --> 00:01:00.000

among the area communities as a result of poor air quality.

00:01:00.000 --> 00:01:13.000

And likewise, we're committed to reducing the Bay Area's greenhouse gas emissions to be 80% below 1990 levels by the year 2015.

00:01:13.000 --> 00:01:16.000

Let's go to the next slide please.

00:01:16.000 --> 00:01:26.000

Alright so this brings us to buildings and building decarbonisation so it's an interesting intersection of climate, or quality public health and equity as well.

00:01:26.000 --> 00:01:33.000

And so we recognize that buildings make up about 10% of the barriers greenhouse gas emissions.

00:01:33.000 --> 00:01:48.000

And in addition, from a quality perspective, nitrogen oxide emissions from buildings in the Bay Area are actually slightly higher than Knox emissions from all passenger vehicles in the Bay Area, so that's that's quite a statistic there.

00:01:48.000 --> 00:02:07.000

And we know that there's detrimental public health impacts associated with breathing air with higher concentrations of knocks. So the point here is that we can link these emissions to combustion of natural gas in our buildings.

00:02:07.000 --> 00:02:16.000

Specifically, natural gas combustion for space heating water, water heating clothes drying and cooking.

00:02:16.000 --> 00:02:26.000

And so we know that we can reduce these emissions by improving the energy efficiency of our buildings relying more on renewable energy and electrifying our appliances.

00:02:26.000 --> 00:02:35.000

We also know that making some of these transitions and changes equitably is indeed a challenge.

00:02:35.000 --> 00:02:49.000

And so the air district has partnered with various organizations to further building decarbonisation work throughout the region. We've worked with the building decarbonisation coalition to design a clean building compass with tools for local governments

00:02:49.000 --> 00:02:51.000

and other other organizations.

00:02:51.000 --> 00:02:59.000

And we have a link at the end of the presentation. And we'll also send that out around afterwards, by email.

00:02:59.000 --> 00:03:15.000

And we've also provided funding to organizations working on building decarbonisation, with a focus on reducing climate pollutants, improving air quality, improving public health by also taking into into account equity considerations of these decarbonisation

00:03:15.000 --> 00:03:16.000

efforts.

00:03:16.000 --> 00:03:29.000

And so our presenters today are leading initiatives to incorporate equity into existing building decarbonisation, and one of them is actually a recipient of the district's Climate Protection grant program.

00:03:29.000 --> 00:03:32.000

That'll be covered a little bit during the presentation.

00:03:32.000 --> 00:03:39.000

So again we're thankful to our presenters for, for taking the time to be with us today.

00:03:39.000 --> 00:03:50.000

And I'll turn it over to my colleague, Lizzie to go through the agenda and provide introductions. Thank you.

00:03:50.000 --> 00:04:07.000

Thank you, Jacob. Hello, everyone. My name is Lizzie, I'm interning with the air district this summer and I'm very excited to be here. I'm really excited for this webinar in particular because you know equity is something that that has really come to

00:04:07.000 --> 00:04:17.000

the forefront of government planning and I feel like it should always have been considered right and so what does that look like how do we intentionally plan for that.

00:04:17.000 --> 00:04:26.000

And how do we understand that these implementations are different for every community right well also keeping the same principles in mind.

00:04:26.000 --> 00:04:40.000

So I'm very excited to have our two presenters here today, we have generic presenting first on the draft Berkeley existing buildings electrification strategy, and then Amanda will be presenting on electric heist and as a, and we'll have a portion for

00:04:40.000 --> 00:04:55.000

question and answer at the end. So the chat is set that you can only message me and Jacobs have any questions come up throughout either of the presentations, just shoot me a message and we'll read them out at the end of the presentation, please remember

00:04:55.000 --> 00:05:05.000

to stay muted throughout both of the presentations, and then if you would like to ask your question yourself you can raise your hand at the end. And there are closed captions.

00:05:05.000 --> 00:05:15.000

If you need that so it should be at the bottom of your zoom panel and you can just hit closed captions, and that is available to you.

00:05:15.000 --> 00:05:18.000

Is there anything else that I'm missing Jacob,

00:05:18.000 --> 00:05:24.000

that's that's great thanks Lizzie. Hey sweet. And so we'll dive right in.

00:05:24.000 --> 00:05:39.000

So first let me introduce the NEA to Nash shorter is the community engagement program director for the Ecology Center, a Berkeley nonprofit that focuses on improving the health and the environmental impacts of urban residents.

00:05:39.000 --> 00:05:53.000

Today, overseas programming for the Ecology Center store and public resource center engagement and education programs, and ego house. She leads and supports programming focusing on climate action, through the Berkeley Climate Action Coalition and zero

00:05:53.000 --> 00:06:07.000

waste education that supports Berkeley's residential curbside recycling program. Today I bring to the rich experience and education and engagement, most recently leading a goodwill community outreach, alongside the city of Berkeley and local efforts to

00:06:07.000 --> 00:06:18.000

transition towards a fossil fuel free future through its existing buildings electrification strategy.

00:06:18.000 --> 00:06:35.000

Awesome. Hope folks can hear me gonna talk slowly and see if I have any comments or anything. Awesome. Thank you so much Lizzy for that intro. Thank you, Jacob also everyone who coordinated this event super happy to be here and present alongside Amanda,

00:06:35.000 --> 00:06:45.000

as you mentioned, my name is Denise shorter community engagement program director at the Ecology Center which I'll get a little bit more into during the time I have here today.

00:06:45.000 --> 00:07:02.000

I have been leading along with a variety of other team members which will also speak to the outreach, education, with a draft Berkeley existing buildings electrification strategy as you just mentioned here working really closely with city of Berkeley's

00:07:02.000 --> 00:07:05.000

Office of Energy and sustainable development.

00:07:05.000 --> 00:07:20.000

Which one of their key goals in that office is to work towards the Council's resolution to become a fossil fuel free city, as soon as possible. Which means, eliminating gas from all of their buildings and transportation systems there's already a ton of

00:07:20.000 --> 00:07:36.000

work that's been done to address. For example, the prohibition on natural gas which addresses, no new gas hookups, but this project specifically addresses kind of existing buildings, much more complicated but today here to discuss the strategy.

00:07:36.000 --> 00:07:47.000

My role the ecology centers role in the equitable outreach related to this strategy and kind of pallets culminated over the last couple of years. and what's next for this project.

00:07:47.000 --> 00:07:48.000

Next slide.

00:07:48.000 --> 00:07:57.000

So again, working really closely with the city of Berkeley, specifically with that Office of Energy and sustainable development has been great.

00:07:57.000 --> 00:08:03.000

The plans here, tie into the larger Climate Action Plan.

00:08:03.000 --> 00:08:20.000

And the outreach, I'll actually move into the project scope on the next side was to determine how to equitably electrify all Berkeley's existing buildings and to determine a date possible and provide kind of short and long term recommendations recommended

00:08:20.000 --> 00:08:22.000

solutions to get there.

00:08:22.000 --> 00:08:33.000

As a part of this process. The team also conducted an analysis of Berkeley's existing building stock to really inform what type of work would need to be done.

00:08:33.000 --> 00:08:36.000

And of course how much it would cost.

00:08:36.000 --> 00:08:51.000

The project team, then kind of model costs and potential savings of electrifying buildings under different conditions, and then through all of this ensured that the community was engaged from the very beginning and kept in the loop throughout this entire

00:08:51.000 --> 00:09:06.000

project was which is really where my expertise and experience comes in with this project definitely not a technical expert on electrification can answer those specific questions but really led a lot of the outreach and education around this.

00:09:06.000 --> 00:09:21.000

So, our team, as I mentioned, amazing team of a variety of different folks Rane Khan consultants lead the environmental consulting piece along with Rmi Brian Gardner from Rane Khan was our team lead on this project.

00:09:21.000 --> 00:09:35.000

I'm Michael Gartman from Rmi who led the technical and cost analysis on this project as well. Again amazing team at the city of Berkeley, Katie Van Dyck Billy, Rebecca whole bunch of other folks that I shouldn't start mentioning, because I don't want

00:09:35.000 --> 00:09:47.000

to leave anyone out, but it really was a team effort. And then we're super grateful to have been able to partner with the Ecology Center for the outreach and education just based on our experience.

00:09:47.000 --> 00:10:02.000

Our long standing commitment to the community here in Berkeley in the greater East Bay Area and ensuring that we not only as a community partner as residents as you know folks who also live and reside and work in Berkeley to also be a part of this project

00:10:02.000 --> 00:10:04.000

in this way.

00:10:04.000 --> 00:10:19.000

So next I want to kind of talk about the community outreach and the equity guardrails kind of what we're all here to talk about today. The community engagement has been a part of this project again from the very beginning the city new they wanted to lead

00:10:19.000 --> 00:10:34.000

lead with equity and so that meant, of course, making sure that all community members, especially targeting frontline those communities hit first and worse by the climate crisis, mostly being impacted by you know something as large as electrifying the

00:10:34.000 --> 00:10:43.000

city's existing building and so making sure that the team had that equity expertise by subcontracting with us at the Ecology Center.

00:10:43.000 --> 00:11:00.000

We are a 51 now year old Berkeley based nonprofit organization we've been focused on improving the health and environmental impacts for urban residents for, you know, 51 plus years we run the city's curbside recycling residential curbside recycling program.

00:11:00.000 --> 00:11:12.000

We have other programs around zero waste climate action youth development food and farming, sustainable living in a variety of other things so it was really intentional that the city partnered with an organization like the Ecology Center, someone that

00:11:12.000 --> 00:11:23.000

was already rooted in the community had some of these connections that the city knew were important to thread into this project, and to really be in charge of kind of leading that effort.

00:11:23.000 --> 00:11:33.000

So leading the outreach and engagement for this project again holding both equity and city community relationships, building as core priorities.

00:11:33.000 --> 00:11:44.000

The elephant in the room, you know, city government there's long standing disparities in city government especially when it comes to communities of color, low income communities frontline marginalized disadvantaged communities.

00:11:44.000 --> 00:11:59.000

So really understanding what those historical mishap mishaps have been bridging that gap, acknowledging and recognizing and then working through, through different approaches and strategies, was it was really key.

00:11:59.000 --> 00:12:15.000

There's obviously no one size fits all when it comes to outreach. When it comes to engagement. So we really utilized a variety of different approaches kind of based on existing and learned information about the communities, hoping to engage at whatever

00:12:15.000 --> 00:12:19.000

level, you know, made made sense in the moment.

00:12:19.000 --> 00:12:39.000

The goal I think through this engagement was to identify and engage these key impacted communities and constituents surfacing and raising up needs and concerns, while also identifying opportunities for these communities here in Berkeley, that aligns with

00:12:39.000 --> 00:12:55.000

with this project. So, ensuring, again, we use a variety of different approaches. It's important to note that much of this engagement kind of overlapped with coven, the social uprising so much other stuff that has happened over the last year's especially

00:12:55.000 --> 00:13:08.000

when we're talking about frontline and marginalized communities who are already compounded by a variety of crises so our approaches our engagement our style our priorities bare priority shifted and we had to shift right along with them and that's what

00:13:08.000 --> 00:13:25.000

true equity actually really means. So, we shifted from one on one conversations with certain communities, establishing trusted kind of civic community thought leaders from communities using utilizing their expertise and experience into the community.

00:13:25.000 --> 00:13:30.000

Advocacy advocacy groups, organizations that were already doing the work.

00:13:30.000 --> 00:13:47.000

aligned with electrification meeting folks from the community were already in this industry and could provide education or help us provide education we use the train the trainer model in some instances where we provided education training to some trusted

00:13:47.000 --> 00:13:58.000

partners in the community and they went on to educate their own community because peer to peer education is proven to sometimes be the better route, depending on what you're doing.

00:13:58.000 --> 00:14:13.000

So really gathering that information on how to engage the larger community was that process so those one on one conversations to, you know, establish trust, bringing in the city when it felt right with us, and the community more specifically with the

00:14:13.000 --> 00:14:27.000

community, ensuring that we are recognizing those past harms that have been done, trying to bridge that gap and create new building relationships so without the ecology center of the city and these communities can move forward with this project and future

00:14:27.000 --> 00:14:45.000

projects and feel comfortable and trusted and safe to exchange and engage, regardless of the approach, or the strategy we really focused on utilizing an equity analysis that leads with race, as it is the most predictive factor in life outcomes.

00:14:45.000 --> 00:14:58.000

So again, recognizing the historical discrimination policies in Berkeley and in a lot of other places when it comes to housing and redlining and gentrification and present day.

00:14:58.000 --> 00:15:14.000

issues that are impacting these frontline communities we kind of lead with this targeted University universalism approach where we collaboratively united behind this common goal of electrifying Berkeley's existing buildings, and then this process necessitates

00:15:14.000 --> 00:15:27.000

identifying specific population groups and analyzing impacts and resource needs for each group so really keeping that in mind as we developed approaches, as we changed approaches to fit the needs of the community and the priorities of the community at

00:15:27.000 --> 00:15:43.000

the time again with this last couple of years of chaos, to say the least, definitely making sure we were presenting and centering what the community's needs and priorities where we identified certain communities that have historically been marginalized,

00:15:43.000 --> 00:15:57.000

that may have historically been excluded from this type of outreach from being included in projects from being engaged with or or reached out to for project like this and making sure that we're being intentional about that, and not just going the traditional

00:15:57.000 --> 00:16:00.000

routes and methods of communication.

00:16:00.000 --> 00:16:17.000

This next slide shows an example of that we engage with green the church and the Berkeley black youth medical ministerial Alliance bima around this same project in around electrification they had already been doing a lot of work and education around building

00:16:17.000 --> 00:16:32.000

electrification, and then those engagement meetings while we were kind of strategizing around what what a community look like, how can we get this community to come to a meeting, and really listening to this community listening to the hold that they already

00:16:32.000 --> 00:16:48.000

had. They were already working and have a stronghold in the black faith based organizations in, and community in Berkeley, and we actually got a grant from USDA and urban sustainability directors network to do some targeted outreach with this church with

00:16:48.000 --> 00:17:04.000

this group and targeting specifically this community, and we ended up coming up with doing a train the trainer model as you can see from this flyer, this is something that they developed, they put out on their platforms, and we provided education resources

00:17:04.000 --> 00:17:17.000

training to their leaders in this community to kind of get this message we're able to get feedback, we were able to introduce the city into this community when they felt like it was appropriate and they were comfortable with that and welcomed the city

00:17:17.000 --> 00:17:29.000

into this space in addition to us at the Ecology Center, and it was just a beautiful model of, you know, a shifting that focus and that idea of, hey we're having this thing come to it, how do we get people to come to it.

00:17:29.000 --> 00:17:45.000

And really it was. We, you all have that information the capacity and the ability and the education the expertise to host something yourselves and let's help provide the resources for folks to communicate and convene on their own, with our support.

00:17:45.000 --> 00:17:59.000

We met them virtually at this convening where we discussed building electrification we got some feedback we did that kind of train the trainer model session and then continue to have additional conversations engagement from there.

00:17:59.000 --> 00:18:12.000

One of the in this next slide you'll see a kind of pull that we did so at this meeting we asked attendees for input on what their priorities were generally around electrification.

00:18:12.000 --> 00:18:28.000

And as you can see, there's a wide spread distribution of priorities from this community where we're seeing healthier, safer homes housing affordability energy costs, climate changes on there but you can see, it's only at about 17% of the group's priority.

00:18:28.000 --> 00:18:45.000

And in this next slide, this shows a another poll that we did, where we compared this poll we did at the green the church, the more focused outreach versus another community forum we had that was more the traditional route where we invited folks to come

00:18:45.000 --> 00:18:58.000

we did a presentation we kind of have the same group of folks that attend a lot of these types of events come, and you can see the comparison, or more than 70% of the people in attendance at this traditional kind of more open.

00:18:58.000 --> 00:19:15.000

Community Forum, had a high interest in climate change, and there wasn't that widespread distribution or diversity and what long term priorities were around electrification so while it's an important reminder, as to why it's so important to do targeted

00:19:15.000 --> 00:19:31.000

outreach with these front lines marginalized by POC, whatever is going on in your community who are not represented in the larger, larger public forums because as you can see very clearly here we're missing out on hearing things from this community which

00:19:31.000 --> 00:19:46.000

is super important and you can see the limitations of we quoted traditional but you can imagine some of the more traditional routes that may be the city or larger organizations or other organizations tend to get public input from.

00:19:46.000 --> 00:19:56.000

In this next slide, this is another example of kind of our targeted and focused intentional outreach versus the more traditional outreach. We did was put out a community survey.

00:19:56.000 --> 00:20:05.000

So as I'm sure is the case with other jurisdictions when we look at the demographics of who actually responded to our survey compared to the actual demographics of the city.

00:20:05.000 --> 00:20:16.000

It shows a skewing of respondents being generally, as you can see very clearly here, generally being whiter older homeowners than the rest of the community.

00:20:16.000 --> 00:20:31.000

And it was really an eye opener not to say that this feedback from these members is not important, while it very much is, we just have to remember

that when evaluating the results of that survey This is only representing a piece of a community and it

00:20:31.000 --> 00:20:46.000

generally doesn't account as much for the feedback of those who have been again burden excluded disenfranchised the most and who would be most impacted by projects like existing building electrification so they're the ones that stand to bear the highest

00:20:46.000 --> 00:20:58.000

impacts of climate change first and worse and we want to make sure that we are hearing them and we want to make sure that we are setting up platforms and engagement and experiences where they can provide that feedback versus just going the traditional

00:20:58.000 --> 00:21:00.000

sometimes easier route.

00:21:00.000 --> 00:21:04.000

We really need to make the effort to seek them out.

00:21:04.000 --> 00:21:16.000

And so this is again another example of kind of how that work another very interesting graphic next around equity implications. And this is a super powerful graphic I'll try to do my best to explain it's a little.

00:21:16.000 --> 00:21:30.000

It's from actually the technical side of this report, but really aligns with our equity conversation today so while we were doing this targeted outreach, our team was also doing a cost analysis with an equity lens.

00:21:30.000 --> 00:21:42.000

And in this analysis which you can see here in this figure, it was determined that there's like a \$2,000 difference per home, as far as being able to electrify a home in Berkeley.

00:21:42.000 --> 00:21:59.000

So, between about it looks like about 7000, a home for homeowners versus 9000 per home and more diverse neighborhoods. And this was larger result of the fact that we found that electrification was less cost effective for multi family homes in Berkeley

00:21:59.000 --> 00:22:17.000

and saw concerning and similar trends when comparing the cost of electrification to each sentence districts median income. So, in short, it was cheaper it's cheaper for richer residents to electrify their homes, which, again, this is exactly why we're

00:22:17.000 --> 00:22:32.000

having this conversation right so it highlights the need to put the same effort into quantifying the equity impacts of decarbonisation efforts in your city, that we would put into quantifying energy or carbon or costs in packs.

00:22:32.000 --> 00:22:52.000

And that's the only way we can really ensure that solutions, address, and optimize for those impacts, so I wanted to share this graphic and share some of that information from our mi expert Michael, as he explained this to us and again, very eye opening,

00:22:52.000 --> 00:23:00.000

and also just highlights the need and the importance of centering equity and in anything that we do as, as you said earlier Lizzy.

00:23:00.000 --> 00:23:15.000

So getting into what actually happened What did we actually hear several themes emerged during these discussions with community groups, nonprofits, serving these community groups and directly inform the strategy, the strategy at this point.

00:23:15.000 --> 00:23:29.000

Key feedback as you can see from some of these thought bubbles here needing to, we need to continue to work closely with frontline communities to co create solutions that was very intentional with this project team reaching out and partnering with the

00:23:29.000 --> 00:23:39.000

Ecology Center, very early on, this is something that doesn't need to happen at the end, what do you think about this thing that we develop that we're going to do in your community that's going to greatly impact you.

00:23:39.000 --> 00:23:53.000

But from the very beginning when it's the first the first thought that community needs to be engaged from the beginning, and the solutions need to be created with the community not just in mind, but right there alongside co creating the solutions, more

00:23:53.000 --> 00:24:09.000

education, there's always an opportunity to educate, whether it's dispelling myths, or just providing basic understanding of the benefits and opportunities with electrification building trust, again, in working with the government we have to be realistic

00:24:09.000 --> 00:24:26.000

about past harms and an about our historical experiences that impact have impacted communities and still hold true to this day, and continuing to need to build trust to be able to co create solutions to be able to work together into the future and implement

00:24:26.000 --> 00:24:39.000

this when the time is right as well. concerns of displacement especially for renters we heard a lot of that people have other priorities when we talked about electrification people are like, well, what are you going to do about the mold and what are we

00:24:39.000 --> 00:24:52.000

going to do about the electric panel that hasn't been working and so there's other priorities for their buildings that also impact health and that are also health and safety issues and those also need to be addressed when we're talking about making upgrades

00:24:52.000 --> 00:25:12.000

for electrification concern around reliability for electricity, especially with power outages were in California as you know so that was a huge thing cost, of course cost, cost, cost, whether it's \$1 or \$10,000, everything has a cause a call it impacts

00:25:12.000 --> 00:25:24.000

people differently and that needs to be considered especially when we talk timelines. So having accessible financing and funding options are definitely needed, and even adding a couple hundred dollars for installation or a few dollars a month.

00:25:24.000 --> 00:25:33.000

It could be a huge concern and and was very clearly voice so there's a variety This is again a snapshot of some of the feedback we heard.

00:25:33.000 --> 00:25:41.000

Once I get into the next steps you'll see that we're still in this timeline of incorporating all of that feedback so we got some really good feedback from the community.

00:25:41.000 --> 00:25:55.000

And again, when we, when we think back to ensuring that this outreach and engagement is considered to be done equitably it should affect both the decision making process and the policy decision based on what was heard so it was very important.

00:25:55.000 --> 00:26:07.000

Almost every single time we engage the community. One of the first questions we got was how is my feedback going to be used. What are you going to do with it, and when is it going to be incorporated into the strategy, or you just checking off a box and

00:26:07.000 --> 00:26:20.000

and again it comes from that historical experience people have experiences with government and other organizations that want to come into this into their communities and do work that impacts them without really understanding and getting their feedback,

00:26:20.000 --> 00:26:27.000

and without incorporating that into the project design development policy, whatever the case may be.

00:26:27.000 --> 00:26:41.000

Sorry I'm probably running up on time so I'll get through the next few slides, part of that community feedback we based on the cost analysis was showed that there can be some significant cost to electrify right now, the understanding that the cost impacts

00:26:41.000 --> 00:26:57.000

have equity impacts and that the feedback we heard that many cannot afford any additional expenses and so that was something we wanted to make sure was highlighted and again addressed in the development of the strategy from all of that feedback.

00:26:57.000 --> 00:27:14.000

And our next slide, we developed these equity guardrails, we kind of developed these equity guard rails to serve as a foundation of the strategy or a set of minimal requirements that recommended that the recommended proposals must meet in order to advance.

00:27:14.000 --> 00:27:17.000

So you can see our for equity guard rails.

00:27:17.000 --> 00:27:33.000

Here access to health and safety benefits so ensuring equitable access to these front lines marginalized communities and others most impacted by the climate crisis for health safety, comfort benefits from electrification again due to the upfront costs

00:27:33.000 --> 00:27:44.000

of electrification many house households will need to financially support to have access to high quality upgrades so making sure again that was at the bare minimum set of minimal requirements.

00:27:44.000 --> 00:28:00.000

Access to economic benefits so not just ensuring that communities are adversely impacted, but making sure they also have the access to the opportunities and benefits of electrification in these, and to be to have it being done equitably, and then sharing

00:28:00.000 --> 00:28:15.000

all community members, especially those most impacted have access to those benefits, maximize ease of installation we were hearing from specific communities around you know what would this actually take realistically, do I need to leave my home for a

00:28:15.000 --> 00:28:29.000

day or a week or an hour and what that what easy meant to us versus what ease of installation meant to them so hearing that and ensuring that incentive programs for the community provide the support that's needed for a variety of different communities

00:28:29.000 --> 00:28:44.000

for renters versus homeowners that was something that really came up a lot. And then lastly promoting housing affordability and anti displacement of course, the housing crisis continues gentrification continues especially we talk about marginalized and

00:28:44.000 --> 00:28:56.000

frontline communities. So ensuring that upgrades don't displace renters, or overburden homeowners and and making sure there's programs that support that.

00:28:56.000 --> 00:29:06.000

So all of that went into developing the draft strategy these guardrails again kind of served as the foundation to the draft strategy that I'll go over really quickly.

00:29:06.000 --> 00:29:23.000

Next, the draft strategy overview again I'm not the expert on the actual strategy more so just leading outreach and education but this graphic kind of is a visual summary of the proposed electrification strategy, we kind of have these four primary strategies

00:29:23.000 --> 00:29:38.000

being proposed by the team to advance electrification as you can see on the top of this building, they are time of replacement and renovation time of sale building performance standards and neighborhood electrification and natural gas pruning.

00:29:38.000 --> 00:29:56.000

So, again, the full strategy kind of gets into the details of all of these, but you can also see that the proposed strategy or strategies are being upheld by these pillars of education of accessible funding and financing and regulatory changes so education

00:29:56.000 --> 00:30:12.000

on electrification technologies, you know the benefits programs, policies to everyone involved in the community contractors workers labor unions we heard that feedback of folks wanting to, whether it was education on the basics of building electrification

00:30:12.000 --> 00:30:28.000

or it was getting young folks in their community or transitioning fossil fuel workers into this industry getting more training and education so that folks can be a part of the industry of electrification accessible funding and financing, very clear, cost

00:30:28.000 --> 00:30:43.000

between the cost analysis and all of the feedback we got that's always and will remain something that needs to be prioritized in this, and then regulatory changes we also know that there will need to be changes to existing local, state and federal regulations

00:30:43.000 --> 00:30:58.000

and policies to enable these strategies to be scalable so requires again we talked about the the policy development related to the outreach and it all kind of fits in so requiring regional action, and a shift in the status quo.

00:30:58.000 --> 00:31:15.000

It's worth noting that the pillars are things that the city can support and work to advance, but in many cases will require efforts beyond the city so just, again, understanding that this is a community effort and I use community loosely to mean, everybody.

00:31:15.000 --> 00:31:26.000

And then finally at the foundation of the structure again are the equity guard rails that I described earlier they're intended to ensure that each of these strategies is built on just and thoughtful grounding.

00:31:26.000 --> 00:31:41.000

And that means that before any of the strategies. Up at the top of the structure can be implemented they must meet or exceed, preferably the equity guardrails that kind of set the foundation down there at the bottom.

00:31:41.000 --> 00:31:58.000

So that's a lot to put into a graphic, but trying to kind of condense that into where we're at and what we use to develop as a direct result this next slide shows the draft phased in approach and this was again a direct result of the feedback we heard

00:31:58.000 --> 00:32:12.000

from the community with concerns around cost and applying the equity guardrails when determining the timeline of electrification, the team determine that a phased approach is absolutely necessary to the strategy.

00:32:12.000 --> 00:32:20.000

And this approach this kind of phase approach attempts to balance the urgency of the climate crisis as you know we cannot wait.

00:32:20.000 --> 00:32:36.000

We must move quickly to make these changes, big changes and move quickly as possible as we can on things that pass the equity guard rails in the short term, also taking some time to do additional work to ensure that the enormous task of electrifying all

00:32:36.000 --> 00:32:41.000

of our buildings can be done. So equitably at scale.

00:32:41.000 --> 00:32:49.000

So the different phases again because I'm kind of short on time laying the groundwork implementing the core policy levels, and then completing the transition.

00:32:49.000 --> 00:32:57.000

I'll send out the link to our full draft strategy, just so you can get a better idea of the actual strategy and some of those proposed policies.

00:32:57.000 --> 00:33:06.000

But essentially, really wanting to highlight the importance of that community feedback that went directly into development of the strategy.

00:33:06.000 --> 00:33:10.000

So where we're at now kind of next steps.

00:33:10.000 --> 00:33:17.000

In this next slide we are right at the cusp of finalizing the writing report and I say we mean the project team.

00:33:17.000 --> 00:33:33.000

Again, incorporating all of that feedback that a lot of other help bi and other folks that contributed to the development of this report finalizing it now, and then getting the report to council this fall, winter, and then we move into implementation

00:33:33.000 --> 00:33:39.000

plan and in partnership with the community which we hope at the Ecology Center to remain being a part of.

00:33:39.000 --> 00:33:50.000

We are already an existing community partners so we hope to continue to be able to educate provide and lead at equitable outreach. Alongside this effort and initiative in our community.

00:33:50.000 --> 00:34:01.000

Sorry if I went over time. Thank you so much again my name is today I my contact info is here if you all have any other questions after today, I'd be happy to answer, as, as best as possible.

00:34:01.000 --> 00:34:08.000

And again, thank you all so much for sharing the space with me today.

00:34:08.000 --> 00:34:09.000

Thank you so much to now.

00:34:09.000 --> 00:34:20.000

This is such an interesting presentation and thank you for your energy and sharing everything that you've, you've done, and we'll be sending all of this out in a follow up email later.

00:34:20.000 --> 00:34:28.000

So you can reach out to us if you have any questions and so we'll head right into the next presentation.

00:34:28.000 --> 00:34:40.000

Let me introduce a man really quickly. Amanda Leona's is acting environmental programs manager with the City of San Jose's Environmental Services Department sustainability and compliance division.

00:34:40.000 --> 00:34:52.000

She has worked for the city for almost six years on various energy and sustainability programs and helped develop the climate smart plan. She managed the city's Bay Area air quality management districts.

00:34:52.000 --> 00:35:04.000

Climate Protection grants to completion and we'll cover programs, San Jose accomplished through that grant related to building electrification and equity.

00:35:04.000 --> 00:35:20.000

All right. Good afternoon, everyone. I'm Amanda Leona's thank you so much to Lizzie, Jacob in dunia really appreciated your presentation demand hope to learn more about your strategy.

00:35:20.000 --> 00:35:22.000
So go ahead and go to the next slide.

00:35:22.000 --> 00:35:41.000
Alright so today I'm going to be just giving an overview on the grant itself that we received from Bachman talking about our electrify San Jose program, and where within the program we addressed equity and then, as well as how we're pursuing equity in

00:35:41.000 --> 00:35:43.000
the electrification.

00:35:43.000 --> 00:35:46.000
Next slide.

00:35:46.000 --> 00:36:04.000
Alright so, just a quick overview of our climate protection grant provided by Backman our objectives were to first reduce emissions in existing buildings and increase the, the knowledge and education to contractors residents in the community.

00:36:04.000 --> 00:36:18.000
Regarding the benefits of zero net carbon buildings, energy efficiency and electrification. And then of course accelerate the transformation towards electrification and getting away from natural gas.

00:36:18.000 --> 00:36:37.000
Some deliverables that we met, and I'll talk about is to develop an incentive strategy and implement that program to at least 65 homes, create a zero net carbon demonstration project and implement a training program that included outreach and education

00:36:37.000 --> 00:36:45.000
with the focus in low income and underserved communities, and then create a climate smart, smart Leaders Program.

00:36:45.000 --> 00:36:58.000
This is a program that basically helps accelerate our the city's climate change plan known well known as climate smart and then of course monitor outcomes and results.

00:36:58.000 --> 00:37:02.000
So next slide.

00:37:02.000 --> 00:37:18.000
All right so electrify San Jose, this was our incentive program that we were able to fund through the back made Climate Protection grant and offered rebates for San Jose households just switch from a natural gas water heater to an electric heat pump water

00:37:18.000 --> 00:37:27.000

heater on properties did need to have an existing natural gas water heater so no new construction. Under this grant.

00:37:27.000 --> 00:37:36.000

It was for single family and multi family units, located in San Jose and there were some equipment requirements.

00:37:36.000 --> 00:37:59.000

I won't get into that but basically we had up to 274,500 in incentives available, and we ended up distributing 95% of those funds in the grant period, and our program was structured in a way to offer 2000 for the equipment upgrading up to 2500 additional

00:37:59.000 --> 00:38:13.000

for an electrical panel upgrade from 100 amps either 200 or 400, and a big focus on this program what was to offer more incentives to low income customers.

00:38:13.000 --> 00:38:22.000

So for that we offered 3500 for the equipment upgrading up to 6000 if the panel upgrade was needed.

00:38:22.000 --> 00:38:37.000

So the city bedded low income customers through enrollment in the California alternate alternate rates for energy AK the care and family electric great assistance fair of programs with pg&e.

00:38:37.000 --> 00:38:55.000

And when San Jose developed electrify San Jose we of course worked with black men, as well as partners, regionally and our networks as such as Silicon Valley clean energy to structure the program and goals and we really wanted to ensure a minimum of 20%

00:38:55.000 --> 00:39:04.000

was held in distributed to low income so at the end of our grant period we did exceed that goal with 22%.

00:39:04.000 --> 00:39:25.000

With over 56,700 and incentives provided, and to help meet that low income goal, San Jose really targeted mailings to Karen Farah customers and fostered just different relationships with specific community based organizations we were working with at the

00:39:25.000 --> 00:39:26.000

time.

00:39:26.000 --> 00:39:43.000

We really felt that that was really important to understand what their needs were. And I'll touch more on that later, but we work closely with our Community Choice energy program, San Jose clean energy to conduct those targeted mailings, and in total

00:39:43.000 --> 00:39:49.000

we had 77 installs across San Jose.

00:39:49.000 --> 00:39:51.000

Next slide.

00:39:51.000 --> 00:39:57.000

So, how we addressed equity and building electric a vacation in this grand.

00:39:57.000 --> 00:40:12.000

We focused on outreach education and trainings and one pilot program we were able to run on was made possible by Silicon Valley energy watch, as well as the the Backman Climate Protection grant.

00:40:12.000 --> 00:40:27.000

This city identified a disadvantage community within San Jose, as you can see in the map here with East Side Union High School District to implement a pilot in 2019 that was for high schools.

00:40:27.000 --> 00:40:45.000

So, that pilot had two primary goals. The first thing to reduce energy use on campus and then to empower the youth within those schools to improve energy policy and processes to to make lasting change and policy improvements on their campus.

00:40:45.000 --> 00:41:03.000

So, overall, the pilot reached 240 students within that disadvantaged community guided five teachers partnered with over, 24 different organizations and produced over 50 student led campus energy projects.

00:41:03.000 --> 00:41:19.000

So, we with that we were able to really identify the energy issues on those campuses and build an educational opportunity for both the students and teachers involved.

00:41:19.000 --> 00:41:37.000

Another outreach project that we did was hired a consultant to develop a zero net carbon video and this was designed to teach residents in San Jose about Sarah net carbon buildings to build a base understanding and really touch on the features of those

00:41:37.000 --> 00:41:55.000

buildings and how that addresses, lowering the missions and overall like having a healthier building environment, and we made this video with the purpose to allow other cities and organizations to co brand and adopt the video in their marketing to their

00:41:55.000 --> 00:42:15.000

communities to really streamline and create a cohesive messaging around zero net carbon buildings regionally. So we promote it. We, excuse me promoted this video extensively, and specifically partnered with a community based organization mothers out front.

00:42:15.000 --> 00:42:34.000

That is a group of mothers across San Jose and actually across different states to address climate change and work with their communities to help rally against policy changes and really infiltrate the community on climate action.

00:42:34.000 --> 00:42:47.000

So we worked a lot with CEOs to help get our word out and we ensured that our video was translated in Spanish and Vietnamese in order to meet San Jose's diverse community.

00:42:47.000 --> 00:42:51.000

There is a link here, feel free to check that out offline.

00:42:51.000 --> 00:43:04.000

And in order to to further promote the video we had an LED light bulb giveaway that if folks did watch the video and filled out that survey they received LED light bulbs.

00:43:04.000 --> 00:43:25.000

So, in addition, we were able to provide over 32 trainings under this grant with over 1500 attendees, with a focus again in disadvantaged communities and those topics really range from all energy related to electrification zero net carbon buildings, zero

00:43:25.000 --> 00:43:34.000

net carbon in schools and then new code requirements for our contractors and homeowners to understand as well.

00:43:34.000 --> 00:43:37.000

Next slide.

00:43:37.000 --> 00:43:46.000

So another key component of our grant was to develop a climate Leaders Program, otherwise known as the climate smart challenge.

00:43:46.000 --> 00:44:05.000

The city soft launch this grand to add our electrification Expo in December of 2019 and this utilizes a online platform that's free to users called Community climate solutions and this basically allows us to engage and recognize residents in San Jose

00:44:05.000 --> 00:44:27.000

for implementing their own climate savings actions in all topics ranging from energy efficiency electrification to lowering waste and opting for different modes of transportation in this program really intended to stimulate interest aspiration and friendly

00:44:27.000 --> 00:44:45.000

competition amongst our residents and with the the grant, we had a goal to enroll 1500 users and were able to enroll over 650 at the end of the period, and to further incentivize incentivize users.

00:44:45.000 --> 00:44:51.000

We also tied our LED giveaway as I mentioned in the previous slide to this program.

00:44:51.000 --> 00:45:13.000

We did fall short of our goal of our LED giveaway and that was largely due to the coven 19 and affecting affecting in person outreach so we did have a mailing process that did work pretty well but yeah so moving into our partnership, so the city, really

00:45:13.000 --> 00:45:24.000

recognize that we you know we have this existing platform. It was available in English but it was not able to serve and engage with our diverse community.

00:45:24.000 --> 00:45:43.000

So we partnered with CCS to ensure that the platform, and the 70 plus actions and resources were translated in Spanish and being nice but we understood that it wasn't enough to just have these translations, and we really needed to form and foster community

00:45:43.000 --> 00:45:45.000

partnerships.

00:45:45.000 --> 00:46:04.000

In order to best understand where our diverse communities are coming from. So, within our mothers out front partnership, we were able to compensate them to hire part time, Vietnamese and Spanish speaking community engages in order to conduct outreach

00:46:04.000 --> 00:46:19.000

in those communities communities within San Jose, and just to first, you know, meet with them to understand what their concerns are and what their priorities were so that we can really tailor our message and really meet them where they're at and and help

00:46:19.000 --> 00:46:32.000

help them understand that there are climate saving actions that are relevant in terms of cost savings and air quality and things that they might have already been concerned with.

00:46:32.000 --> 00:46:51.000

So through that effort, we were able to have over 30, different meetings in both in Spanish and Vietnamese including facilitating and providing interpretation for online workshops and trainings, and then again the key element here was just to ensure that

00:46:51.000 --> 00:47:06.000

the messaging wasn't, you know, just a bunch of technical jargon and, you know, asking folks to Hey you gotta, you know put down all this money for solar and to help you electrify and just again to meet folks where they're at and understand that there's

00:47:06.000 --> 00:47:15.000

a lot of low hanging fruit innovate in opportunities such as incentives available to help them through this process.

00:47:15.000 --> 00:47:17.000
Next slide.

00:47:17.000 --> 00:47:29.000
So I really just want to emphasize that the city of San Jose has so much to learn as we pursue equity and electrification and in climate, more holistically.

00:47:29.000 --> 00:47:50.000
So, I am you know very happy to say that we have a new office of racial equity formed out of our city manager's office in San Jose to help further vet program and policy design that prioritises equity and program development, as well as implementation

00:47:50.000 --> 00:48:07.000
and to ensure we revisit our city policies and programs and share best practices across our very big city, and then through our work with the city's building electrification roadmap.

00:48:07.000 --> 00:48:27.000
We are testing out different models of community engagement through a co creation process that really does prioritize collaboration with community based organizations and fosters those partnerships and focuses on the disadvantaged communities within San

00:48:27.000 --> 00:48:49.000
Jose, so the city is able to compensate some of these CEOs to conduct outreach on electrification across San Jose again through conducting meaningful meetings, creating videos that are again tailored to our diverse communities, to give one example we

00:48:49.000 --> 00:49:08.000
had a video series on induction cooktop, and we invited folks of the Spanish community to use the induction cooktop and talk about like how their cooking is able to be used in induction in the end and what they liked about it and what they did in and

00:49:08.000 --> 00:49:20.000
have in taking that back to our programs, developing outreach materials and then of course in terms of reinforcing our program development and implementation.

00:49:20.000 --> 00:49:28.000
So again just really co creating solutions and making sure that we're not leaving anyone behind her focusing on.

00:49:28.000 --> 00:49:46.000
You know the typical the middle to higher class folks that have the the capital to do these projects. So, this approach and these purse partnerships are so crucial so that all walks of life in the diverse diverse communities in San Jose are heard.

00:49:46.000 --> 00:49:58.000

I'm included in part of our co creation process to address climate change into pursue equity in the city's electrification efforts in order to meet our goals.

00:49:58.000 --> 00:50:15.000

Again, I'll just reiterate, we have so much to learn and we look forward to diving deeper within this, I'm looking forward to checking out, Berkeley strategy, more and just learning from our cohort of cities as Lizzie mentioned this is something that

00:50:15.000 --> 00:50:29.000

has historically been sort of back burned and we really see the implications of that now that this needs to be part of our planning process from start to finish as a high priority.

00:50:29.000 --> 00:50:31.000

Next slide.

00:50:31.000 --> 00:50:48.000

So I just want to you know thank you all for having me today that's our requirement smart website, my emails here at the bottom if you have any questions, but thank you for the opportunity and I'll pass it back to Lucy.

00:50:48.000 --> 00:51:06.000

Sweet. Thank you, Amanda for a really great and insightful presentation and it's a today it's been really excellent to see what's been going on in two different areas of Bay Area and, again, seeing how different you know these equity, like standpoints

00:51:06.000 --> 00:51:16.000

will manifest based on the community that you're in. So, thank you thank you again and I can't stop thinking you, because I'm very excited about this presentation.

00:51:16.000 --> 00:51:23.000

So if you have any questions, raise your hand or put it in the chat and we do have a question for Amanda.

00:51:23.000 --> 00:51:35.000

And this person is asking you know what were the reasons, low income households wanted to electrify given the different priorities like these households tend to have.

00:51:35.000 --> 00:51:44.000

So what reasons that they that we wanted to. Yeah, I think so. Here, I'll put it again in the chat so everyone.

00:51:44.000 --> 00:51:50.000

Thank you.

00:51:50.000 --> 00:51:54.000

Right.

00:51:54.000 --> 00:52:12.000

So I think, you know, we're still as part of our building electrification roadmap and our co creation process we are still, you know really learning from low income households but one thing that was a concern that we're hearing about is lowering energy

00:52:12.000 --> 00:52:30.000

costs, and where we could provide incentives would really, you know, help with the gap on that and we were able to see with a lot of our low income projects through electrify San Jose that our incentives were able to cover, sometimes more than half and

00:52:30.000 --> 00:52:49.000

sometimes the full cost for those households so again having that incentives what was crucial and then really driving home, the effect on the health in the home, especially given that some of our disadvantaged communities and low income households are

00:52:49.000 --> 00:53:07.000

in areas that are, you know, more susceptible to like bad air quality and things like that so understanding that the education that they needed around air quality was a big one, so making sure that we have that incentive available to them and then the

00:53:07.000 --> 00:53:17.000

proper education around. You know why. This should be considered a priority was key.

00:53:17.000 --> 00:53:25.000

Great, thanks for that Amanda, just looking around to see if anybody has raised their hand, if they have a question I know we're coming up on on time.

00:53:25.000 --> 00:53:35.000

Pretty soon, so if anybody has a question, please raise your hand. Otherwise, maybe I'll take the liberty of jumping in and asking a question.

00:53:35.000 --> 00:53:56.000

So the questions for Renee and I think there was one slide that that had you know what you heard, and there was the the bubbles of the different comments from people, and there was a decent amount about a decent amount of input around, you know, monetary

00:53:56.000 --> 00:54:17.000

costs so upfront costs financing increased rent potential. And so that's you know there's there's this economic burden of of electrifying and so just curious from your perspective in terms of how do you continue to build consensus and to communicate effectively

00:54:17.000 --> 00:54:30.000

and to get the input of of community members where there's this huge burden of cost or perceived burden of costs, and how do you continue communicating and,

00:54:30.000 --> 00:54:39.000

you know, gathering perspectives without really losing your audience so I kind of broad open ended question with regards to this your approach.

00:54:39.000 --> 00:54:56.000

Yeah, those are great questions and as as far as what I'm able to speak to some of this came out in the development of the strategy. So, for example, tariff on bill tariff on bill financing, what would that mean there was feedback of like not putting

00:54:56.000 --> 00:55:11.000

all the eggs in one basket on this issue and you know others feeling like this work would be hard enough, so something like tariff on bill financing as a financing financing solution is meeting something that's accessible like you said to renters and

00:55:11.000 --> 00:55:29.000

residents. For example, with varying credit scores or low credit scores that can be combined with other multiple other funding sources so it again, it varies depending on community person by person renters versus homeowners concerns around displacement

00:55:29.000 --> 00:55:53.000

for renters, and what up as much as I was involved in what I felt like I took away is people wanted to be secure in ensuring that the issues, and the concerns around cost would be addressed in in the strategy so ensuring that implementation you know whether

00:55:53.000 --> 00:56:07.000

that was deciding on the phased approach or the timeline if we're going to do this equitably. We do need to address the climate crisis but it can't be you know mandatory requirements or mandatory policies or anything like that was a big, a big thing and

00:56:07.000 --> 00:56:22.000

something that I felt like from the feedback addressed, you know some of the costs concerns kind of coupling up another thing that kind of was a big topic of discussion with the project team was around really compounding and aligning with other again

00:56:22.000 --> 00:56:39.000

funding financing other incentive programs that could provide the costs implementing or or proposing a budget within the city budget to be able to provide these incentives or financial incentives or just support financial support to be able to financing

00:56:39.000 --> 00:56:54.000

to be able to make these changes for homes, whether it's renters or homeowner so kind of all over the place with addressing the question but

definitely in policy development as well as implementation I think in developing that kind of phased approach

00:56:54.000 --> 00:57:09.000

and what that actually looks like pilot programs or piloting specific projects, and the community to be involved, being involved in that, to address their, their very specific and real concerns.

00:57:09.000 --> 00:57:30.000

Great Great thank you and I'll just note that that one graphic that you had of, you know the the building with the the strategy, and the equity guardrails in essence acting as the foundation I thought that was quite a powerful graphic and that the foundation

00:57:30.000 --> 00:57:34.000

indeed is informed by the voices throughout the community.

00:57:34.000 --> 00:57:43.000

So I thought that was a great summary in a great graphic that that illustrates. You know what, what the city of Berkeley is trying to achieve so thank you for that.

00:57:43.000 --> 00:58:01.000

I know we're a little bit over, over time and I apologize for that we're just going to wrap with this last slide, I think you slide and links to our government so as a link to our government website with with relevant information so I mentioned the at

00:58:01.000 --> 00:58:12.000

at the onset, that this is part of the broader building harmonization webinar series, we had our first webinar a few weeks ago and you can find that at the link on this slide.

00:58:12.000 --> 00:58:28.000

There's also our newsletter that we send out monthly with relevant information and likewise information about forthcoming webinars. And then lastly I mentioned the clean building come this with the building decarbonisation coalition, and there's a link

00:58:28.000 --> 00:58:37.000

here as well, we'll be sure to follow up with an email afterwards with these links and and others that have been mentioned throughout the presentation, but just one more time.

00:58:37.000 --> 00:58:46.000

Thank you to everyone for joining us today. Thank you to our presenters Amanda Neha for presenting that was really insightful and just an exciting area of work.

00:58:46.000 --> 00:58:50.000

And lastly, thanks to Lizzie for organizing this. So with that.

00:58:50.000 --> 00:59:04.000

Thank you and enjoy the rest of your day.

