

**Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5000**

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on Port Emissions
9:30 a.m., Thursday, April 5, 2007

1. Call to Order – Roll Call: Vice-Chair John Gioia called the meeting to order at 9:38 a.m.

Present: Nate Miley, Chairperson (9:46 a.m.); John Gioia, Scott Haggerty (9:50 a.m.), Mark Ross, Tim Smith, Pamela Torliatt (9:42 a.m.), Gayle B. Uilkema.

Absent: Tom Bates, Liz Kniss.

2. Public Comment Period: There were none.

3. Presentation of Emissions from Ports and Marine Activity in the San Francisco Bay Area:
The Committee received information on emissions from ports and maritime activity in the San Francisco Bay Area. This is an informational item.

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, provided background information and stated that this Committee was formed at the January Board Retreat. There are five ports in the Bay Area and they each need to be under a regulatory umbrella to ensure that emission reductions will take place at these ports.

Director Pamela Torliatt arrived at 9:42 a.m.

In response to a question from Director Uilkema, Mr. Broadbent stated that each port has a distinct boundary and within that boundary are ship, truck, and rail operations. These operations run on diesel and the rule-making process will start off very broadly regarding regulation of these operations. The operations would be treated as stationary sources similar to the flare rule and the Flare Minimization Plans (FMP's).

Chairperson Nate Miley arrived at 9:46 a.m.

Michael Murphy, Advanced Projects Advisor, stated that in addition to emissions from the ports in the Bay Area, there are emissions from other maritime activities, such as ferry boats, commercial fishing boats, and tug boats. Mr. Murphy presented the report and provided information on the following:

- The location and description of the ports in the San Francisco Bay Area, of which there are five, and the location of anchorages eight and nine.

Director Scott Haggerty arrived at 9:50 a.m.

- A list of 2005 ocean going vessel movements within San Francisco Bay. The Port of Oakland has the highest percentage of movements, with the anchorages second. Vessels going to the Port of Oakland generally do not go to the anchorages, but go directly to the port.
- The maritime trade is growing with the largest growth in containerized cargo. Liquid cargo requires more vessels per ton.
- Emissions from maritime activities (diesel PM, NO_x and SO_x). The average length of stay for vessels is 21 hours at the Port of Oakland, 31 hours at the anchorages, and 10 hours at the refineries. Mr. Broadbent noted that the Bar Pilots have offered to provide tours to interested Board members.
- The federal and international measures to control emissions. The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has either adopted or proposed new engine emission standards for trains, ships and off-road equipment. The state has also developed measures to control emissions. The \$1 billion state incentive plan is waiting for legislative action and there was discussion on using this funding for shore power for vessels at the ports.
- Overview of current Air District activities. Director Uilkema requested that staff provide follow-up information on the Health Risk Assessment at the Port of Oakland and West Oakland. Director Uilkema also requested more information on the APL Singapore Water Emulsion Fuel Demonstration.

Chair Miley requested that staff provide information on the history and background of the Clean Air Action Plans for the ports at Los Angeles and Long Beach.

In summary, Mr. Murphy stated that the maritime trade is projected to grow significantly, international trade/container volume is the highest growth area, emissions of NO_x, SO_x and diesel PM are projected to increase, and additional action is necessary to ensure that the public's health is protected.

Mr. Broadbent noted that the District has met with several of the stakeholders. Chair Miley requested staff provide a list of all of the stakeholders.

Committee Action: None. This report provided for information only.

4. Discussion of San Francisco Bay Area Green Ports Initiative: *The Committee received information and discussed the new initiative for green ports.*

Brian Bunger, Counsel, presented the report and noted two documents provided to the Committee: 1) San Francisco Bay Area Green Ports Initiative, and 2) San Francisco Bay Green Ports Initiative Regulatory Authority. Mr. Bunger introduced the key staff members who are working on the initiative and rule development: Kathleen Walsh, Bill Guy, and Michael Murphy.

Continuing, Mr. Bunger stated that the port emissions in the Bay Area are significant, with diesel emissions a large contributor at 6 tons a day. This represents 35% of the total emissions and it was noted that diesel emissions are a toxic health risk. The District's current estimates of region-wide port emissions that occurred in 2005 were reviewed. Sources of concern at the ports

include ocean-going vessels, tugs, harbor craft, cargo handling equipment, and refrigerator units on containers to name a few.

The District is proposing to engage in rule making to reduce air pollution and health risks from marine port activities. The District has met with the ports and discussed goals for reduction of emissions at existing and new or expanded marine ports. The ports will develop action plans similar to the Flare Minimization Plans required of the refineries. There was a brief discussion on container fees. Components of the action plans were reviewed.

Mr. Bungler reported that the process has started and there are a number of groups the District has, or will be, meeting with. A Ports Working Group will be established, language for the rule will be developed by the end of 2007, and at the end of the first quarter of 2008 there should be a proposed regulation for the Board's consideration.

Speakers: The following individuals spoke on this agenda item:

Teri Shore
Friends of the Earth
San Francisco, CA 94104

Jay Ach
Port of San Francisco
San Francisco, CA 94111

Committee Action: None. This report provided for information only.

5. **Committee Member Comments/Other Business:** There were none.
6. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the Call of the Chair, with the recommendation that the next meeting be held in approximately six weeks.
7. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:44 a.m.

/s/ Mary Romaidis
Mary Romaidis
Clerk of the Boards