

**Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 771-6000**

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee
9:30 A.M., Thursday, June 12, 2008

1. Call to Order - Roll Call: Chair Pamela Torliatt called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Pamela Torliatt, Chair, Tom Bates, Chris Daly (9:50 a.m.), John Gioia, Jake McGoldrick (9:40 a.m.), Mark Ross, Gayle B. Uilkema (9:40 a.m.).

Absent: Scott Haggerty, Yoriko Kishimoto, Mark Ross.

Also Present: Tim Smith.

4. Discussion of Status and Direction of Climate Protection Program: *The Committee received a report from staff regarding the status of the Air District's climate protection activities and discussed future direction of the program.*

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO introduced the item stating that it would be appropriate as staff to seek input and direction of where the Committee would like to be. Mr. Broadbent stated that Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Research to provide the Committee with the status of the program.

Mr. Hilken noted that he would provide the Committee with a list of its recent accomplishments, which include:

- **Stationary Source GHG Fee Approved**
 - Cost recovery for stationary source climate protection activities
 - Permitted operations to pay 4.4 cents per metric ton of GHG emissions
- **GHG Technology Study Phase II Completed**
 - Report on landfills, boilers, process heaters, and steam generators
 - Appropriate consideration in District rules
- **\$3M in Climate Protection Grants Awarded**
 - 52 contracts underway for innovative and self-sustaining concepts
- **4th and 5th Grade Curriculum Implemented**
 - Completed successful pilot year
 - Expanding to 40 classrooms next year
- **Local Governments Assistance Underway**
 - Local government workshops
 - Web portal for best practices with Institute for Local Government

Continuing and upcoming activities include:

- CEQA and General Plan guidance for GHG reductions
- Regional GHG Inventory Update
- Spare the Air Climate integration
- Internal Climate Protection Effort
- JPC and regional agency collaboration
- AB 32 collaboration with ARB, CAPCOA

Mr. Hilken stated that at present there are several different workgroups that Air Resources Board (ARB) and California Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) are convening, with the main focus is the scoping plan, as there are a number of key milestones that are outlined in AB 32. Mr. Hilken also stated that the draft scoping plan will be due the end of June 2008. ARB anticipates adoption of this in November 2008.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation stating that the majority of the work that the Air District has done. Stating that half of the emissions in the bay area come from transportation, one third comes from various industrial and power generating sources with the remainder coming in the form of domestics, which include natural gas combustion, furnaces, hot water heaters, stoves, etc. as this is an attempt to link the programs, such as the grants program, curriculum, outreach and it gets to the various parts of the inventory.

Future direction of the program includes:

- Given wide range of uncertainty and opportunity, how do we direct efforts to maximize benefit in the long run?
- Solution: Develop strategic work plan to serve as guiding framework for upcoming activity.
- How do we develop a strategic work plan?
 - Determine objectives and desired outcomes
 - Consider multi-year timeline
 - Survey landscape of climate protection activity
 - Assess opportunities and District strengths
 - Identify appropriate District focus

The strategic work plan will include:

- Draft document ready in Fall 2008
- Will contain:
 - ✓ Desired outcomes and objectives for BAAQMD Climate Program
 - ✓ Identification of Key Focus Areas
 - ✓ Identification of specific projects for each focus area. For example:
 - Events, Collaborations, etc.
 - CEQA, Grants, Local Gov't. Assistance, etc.
 - AB 32 Roles, JPC roles
 - ✓ Qualitative estimate of GHG impact of each action

- ✓ Multi-year timeline with benchmarks and milestones
- ✓ Multi-year resource allocation plan

Mr. Hilken concluded his presentation. Chair Torliatt asked the Committee if they had questions. Chair Torliatt stated that a program was brought to the City of Petaluma called Cancel a Car Program, which provides coupons for riding transit and receives carbon reduction for doing so. In addition, they change their light bulbs, clean their refrigerator coils and then all the carbon offsets are added and calculated for the schools. Chair Torliatt asked if the Air District is moving towards this direction.

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer responded to Chair Torliatt stating that the Air District has spoken to the individuals from Cancel a Car Program and are working with them to see how it can be expanded to other schools, as it is primarily an after school program where the curriculum is a part of the science curriculum in the classroom in its standard space.

Henry Hilken continued stating that part of the curriculum does look at the transportation sector, as part of the program does educate the students and what they can do to reduce their transportation emissions as well.

Chair Torliatt suggested that the Air District should always make sure to identify that this is being linked back to improving air quality, as this is the overall goal.

Mr. Broadbent informed the Committee the overall Climate Protection program is best characterized as it has a variety of activities and that there is a need to take a step back to see what the Air District would like to accomplish, as well as what the Committee would like to accomplish. Mr. Broadbent continued that the plan should complement AB 32.

Director Gioia recommended that the Air District consider as an agency of how does the resources, technical expertise and regulatory authority; how does this help with achieving this goal on a regional level in transportation planning with MTC and land use planning. Director Gioia continued that the Air District would be the biggest bang for its buck in this area and that the Air District needs to focus on the transportation land use end and how we can look at a regulatory structure to help push other agencies, whether it be cities, counties, and MTC towards policies that result in land use and transportation choices that reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

Director Uilkema stated that members of the Business Council known as the Costa Council has a new taskforce that that was established called the AB 32 Implementation Committee. Director Uilkema continued stating that the target for this Committee would focus on land use. In addition, Director Uilkema stated that what the Air District is doing is great but was not sure if it will be cost effective, but stated that it does not bring in the people and that little things mean a lot, and that people need to think differently. In addition, Director Uilkema stated that the Air District is doing well with the 4th and 5th grade curriculum, and that the Air District should also consider the development of a kindergarten program in conjunction with a poster contest, in addition, to have the colleges look back on the community projects they may have been involved with, as this opportunity should be made available during the 10th and 11th grade. These projects

would be visible within a community starting at that level, as it would accomplish a number of things as it would help with the goal of the Air District as well as spark interest for students.

Chair Torliatt commented further on the public health aspect and questioned the future health impacts will necessarily be, due to climate change and that if information was provided and have it linked to improving air quality as a public health message that it would be helpful.

Director Daly suggested that the Committee consider carbon tax, proposals and model ordinances to merit the press and that if the Air District continues to be aggressive about its stance, that this would be the best way for the Air District to get its message across.

Chair Torliatt thanked the Committee for the lively discussion.

2. **Public Comment Period:** There were none.
3. **Approval of Minutes of March 13, 2008:** Director Gioia moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Director Daly; carried unanimously without objection.
5. **Status Report on CEQA Guidelines and Greenhouse Gases:** *The Committee received an status report on the update of the Air District's CEQA Guidelines, which included the discussion of greenhouse gas impacts and mitigation.*

Mr. Broadbent provided the Committee with an introduction on this item and stated there is a great need to establish significant criteria as it will generate interest. Mr. Broadbent continued that Mr. Hilken would provide the Committee with the timeline and the expectations.

Mr. Hilken noted that the Air District CEQA guidelines would include:

- Guidance to local lead agencies
- Address impacts from construction, project operations, and plans
- Last updated in 1999
- Includes
 - Air quality data, health effects, background information
 - Early consultation procedures
 - Thresholds of significance
 - Analytical methodologies
 - Mitigation measures

Additional guideline updates include:

- Review significance thresholds for criteria pollutants
- Develop thresholds for greenhouse gases and toxic air contaminants
- Review and update analytical methodologies and mitigation measures, including greenhouse gases
- Incorporate land use compatibility guidance

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation stating that the significance criteria will include:

- Review significance thresholds for criteria pollutants
- Develop thresholds for greenhouse gases and toxic air contaminants
- Review and update analytical methodologies and mitigation measures, including greenhouse gases
- Incorporate land use compatibility guidance

Guidelines update schedule is as follows:

- Summer 2008 – Release consultant RFP
- Fall 2008 – Public review draft
- Fall, Winter 2008/09 – Public workshop(s)
- Spring 2009 – Final

Mr. Hilken noted that it would be beneficial that a consultant assist the Air District, as this is considered to be a large effort.

Mr. Hilken concluded his presentation and offered to answer any questions.

Director Gioia asked how this in conjunction with CARB and what is their timing on this issue. Mr. Broadbent responds to Director Gioia stating that CARB is now indicating that by the end of this year. Mr. Broadbent continued that there would be a need for statewide guidelines and that South Coast is currently conducting workshops on guidelines for Southern California.

Director Daly stated that every cycle there are at least two to four bills regarding CEQA reform with good intentions and that the Air District should make an effort to stay on top of the bills and consider sponsoring a bill with the attempt to draw out the issue and make it state law.

Chair Torliatt stated that the Air District has the ability to move quicker and should as the higher the Air District sets the bar the more the District can lead to do the right thing statewide and work with CARB to push the envelope. In addition Chair Torliatt suggested recommendations to potentially in the EIR through the CEQA guidelines of recommending that cities and counties adopt a greenhouse gas mitigation fee. If they are unable to offset their footprint, then a fee would be implemented such as a traffic mitigation fee, open space, parks fee, as this is where an analysis could be conducted in order to do projects on a local level that can move things forward.

As the Committee concluded its discussion on this item, Chair Torliatt asked if any of the members had any questions.

6. Update on Regional Agency Climate Protection Activities: *Staff provided the Committee with a report on regional agency climate protection activities.*

Mr. Broadbent stated that the Air District has additional activities underway by regional agencies in the Bay Area and that Mr. David Burch, Principal Environmental Planner would provide the Committee with the presentation.

Mr. Burch provided the Committee with an overview of the activities in the region related to climate protection. Mr. Burch stated that the Joint Policy Committee (JPC) adopted a regional agency climate protection program.

Agency collaboration of JPC Climate Program includes:

- Focus Initiatives (PDAs)
- Local Government Assistance
- ABAG Power
- CEQA Guidance
- Adaptation Planning
- Outreach (Spare the Air)
- RTP Climate Protection Goals

Mr. Burch continued stating that MTC is required to update its Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) every four years. The transportation 2035 background includes:

- MTC updating RTP: T2035
- Defined “vision” expressed as performance targets
- Performance targets include reducing CO2 & PM
- \$220 B: \$190 B “committed” / \$30 B “discretionary”
- MTC defining investment packages for the \$30 B
- ~ \$100 B requested; many competing priorities
- Key investment decisions will be made in July

Mr. Burch continued the presentation and the efforts of the Air District and its proposal to work with the regional agency partners to develop a Transportation Climate Action Campaign. The information for this proposal included:

- \$184 M - multi-faceted 5-year effort to reduce GHGs
- Collaborative proposal on behalf of all 4 agencies
- Targeting GHG emissions from on-road vehicles
- Major step toward implementing JPC Climate Plan
- Supports T2035 performance targets
 - *(The District has made add'l \$40 million request to MTC for truck retrofits & replacements)*

The five year climate campaign proposed activities will include:

- 1) **Outreach Campaign: \$25 million**
 - integrate Spare the Air messaging
 - target smart driving and smart traveling
- 2) **Climate Grant Program: \$25 million**
 - smart driving, alternative fuels

- VMT reduction: car-sharing, transit, pricing
- 3) **Regional Safe Routes to School: \$50 million**
- expand Marin/Alameda program to additional counties
- 4) **Regional Safe Routes to Transit: \$25 million**
- encourage 100% car-free commuting/travel
- 5) **Transit Priority Program: \$50 million**
- improve speed, reliability of bus transit
- bus lanes, signal priority, improved transit shelters
- 6) **Regional Telework Pilot Project: \$2 million**
- public/private partnership for telework, teleconferencing
- 7) **Consumer Incentive Program: \$5 million**
- supplemented with private funding
- incentives for purchasing “smart” driving technologies
- 8) **Plug-in Hybrid Electric Vehicles: \$2 million**
- outreach and promotion of use of PHEVs

Key milestones include:

- July 11 Planning Committee**
→ *Approval of Draft Investment Plan and referral to Commission*
- July 23 Commission**
→ *Approval of Draft Investment Plan*
- March ‘09 Commission**
→ *Approval of Final T2035 Plan*

Mr. Burch concluded his presentation. Chair Torliatt thanked Mr. Burch for the presentation.

- 7. **Committee Members’ Comments:** Chair Torliatt asked if there are additional requirements that can be placed on vehicles that will reduce CO₂, or is it linked if less gas is used. Brian Bunger, Legal Counsel responds to Chair Torliatt stating that CO₂ equivalent emissions under the Pavley Bill, CARB has a set of regulations that include things such as changing to different refrigerants as those have an even higher global warming potential, but EPA declined to grant the waiver and will not go into effect.
- 8. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the Call of the Chair.
- 9. **Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 11:05 a.m.

/S/ Vanessa Johnson
Executive Secretary