



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE  
COMMITTEE MEMBERS

YORIKO KISHIMOTO – CHAIR  
SUSAN GARNER  
SCOTT HAGGERTY  
MARK ROSS

TOM BATES – VICE CHAIR  
JOHN GIOIA  
CAROL KLATT  
GAYLE B. UILKEMA

**THURSDAY**  
**October 8, 2009**  
**9:30 A.M.**

**4<sup>th</sup> FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM**  
**DISTRICT OFFICES**

**AGENDA**

**1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

*(Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at District headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA, at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.*

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 10, 2009**

**4. OVERVIEW OF ELECTRIC VEHICLE TECHNOLOGIES**      **Jack Broadbent/5052**

[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*Staff will present an informational overview on electric vehicle technologies and their development. Additionally, the committee will be updated on options to support the deployment of these technologies in the Bay Area.*

**5. GREENHOUSE GAS MEASURES IN THE 2009 CLEAN AIR PLAN**      **Henry Hilken/4642**  
[hhilken@baaqmd.gov](mailto:hhilken@baaqmd.gov)

*The Committee will receive an update on the 2009 Clean Air Plan, with an emphasis on measures to reduce greenhouse gases emissions.*

**6. COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS**

*Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may; ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)*

**7. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING – 9:30 A.M. – THURSDAY, November 12, 2009,**  
**939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109**

**8. ADJOURNMENT**

**CONTACT THE EXECUTIVE OFFICE - 939 ELLIS STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**

**(415) 749-5130  
FAX: (415) 928-8560  
BAAQMD homepage:  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)**

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities (notification to the Executive Office should be given at least three working days prior to the date of the meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly).
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body. Such writing(s) may also be posted on the District's website ([www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)) at that time.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
**939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109**  
**(415) 771-6000**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:**  
**MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**OCTOBER 2009**

<b><u>TYPE OF MEETING</u></b>	<b><u>DAY</u></b>	<b><u>DATE</u></b>	<b><u>TIME</u></b>	<b><u>ROOM</u></b>
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Monday	5	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Personnel Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair) – CANCELLED</i>	Wednesday	7	9:00 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	7	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Legislative Committee</b> <i>(Meets 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Thursday	8	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	8	9:30 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b>	Wednesday	14	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday Quarterly)</i>	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair) - CANCELLED</i>	Wednesday	21	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	21	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Ad Hoc Cme. on Port Emissions</b>	Monday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

## NOVEMBER 2009

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	4	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b>	Tuesday	10	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Legislative Committee</b> <i>(Meets 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	12	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	12	Following Board Legislative Cme. Mtg.	4th Floor Conf. Room
<b>Joint Policy Committee</b>	Friday	13	10:00 a.m.	MTC Auditorium 101 8 <sup>th</sup> Street Oakland, CA 94607
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	18	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	25	1:30 p.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

## DECEMBER 2009

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	2	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	10	9:30 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

HL – 9/30/09 (11:00 a.m.)  
P/Library/Forms/Calendar/Calendar/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kishimoto and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 1, 2009

Re: Climate Protection Committee Draft Meeting Minutes

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of September 10, 2009.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the September 10, 2009 Climate Protection Committee meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 771-6000

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Climate Protection Committee  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room  
Thursday, September 10, 2009, 9:30 a.m.

**Call to Order - Roll Call:** Chairperson Yoriko Kishimoto called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

**Present:** Chairperson Yoriko Kishimoto, Vice Chairperson Tom Bates; Susan Garner, John Gioia, Carol Klatt and Gayle B. Uilkema

**Absent:** Scott Haggerty, Mark Ross and Michael Shimansky

**Also Present:** Chairperson Pamela Torliatt

**Public Comment Period:** None

**Approval of Minutes of May 28, 2009:** Director Klatt made a motion to approve the minutes of May 28, 2009; seconded by Director Uilkema; carried unanimously without objection.

**Climate Protection Best Practices Web Portal** – *Director of Planning and Research, Henry Hilken*

Sigalle Michael, Environmental Planner, provided the Committee with a presentation and update on the development of a climate protection best practices web portal, developed in collaboration with the Institute for Local Governments (ILG). She said the goal is to help local governments find and implement best practices to reduce GHG emissions. The web portal went live on September 1<sup>st</sup> and can be found at [www.ca-ilg.org/SFBayClimate](http://www.ca-ilg.org/SFBayClimate). Ms. Michael presented the landing page, the BAAQMD and Climate Change page, a page that tracks Bay Area climate planning progress, a shared resource page, customized search capabilities, portal search tools and California Climate Action Network (CCAN) Best Practices.

Next steps include outreach to local governments, providing targeted outreach to non-governmental organizations and planning consultants, and staff and ILG will continue to build content, invite submissions and collaborate with regional agencies on updating content and long-term site maintenance.

Public Comments:

Sam Altshuler discussed his work with Tom Richards of Pacific Industries who next spoke of carbon-friendly slab foundation technology.

Tom Richards, Pacific Housing Systems, Inc., provided a company overview and presented hand-outs to the Committee on a Wafflemat system; a carbon-friendly, substitute product for concrete slab foundations.

Committee Comments/Discussion:

Directors congratulated staff on their work in developing the climate action web portal, suggested the posting of additional resource links such as builders associations, technology groups, discussion forums and blogs. Staff discussed a list serve function which enables people to sign up to receive updated information, and information on regional events, and ideas will soon be able to be submitted and linked. Directors discussed possible incentives and/or recognition for those sharing best practices, suggested changing the “SFBayClimate” to something more generic to increase the likelihood of hits on the site, and requested the site show some sort of metric of reductions in emissions per capita.

Committee Action: None; for information only.

**Greenhouse Gas Thresholds in the CEQA Guidelines Update** - *Director of Planning and Research, Henry Hilken*

Planning Manager David Vintze provided the Committee with an update on the revisions to the BAAQMD CEQA Guidelines, particularly the inclusion of thresholds of significance for GHG emissions. He announced the release of the public draft CEQA Guidelines report last Friday and noted that workshops were being held. He provided background of the guidelines, key objectives, and said reasons to update the guidelines are due to significant changes in air quality regulatory activity, changes in analytical methodologies and mitigation strategies, and addressing emerging and growing air quality concerns.

Committee Comments/Discussion:

Directors questioned differences in the District’s CEQA guidelines and the state’s CEQA guidelines, and Mr. Vintze said staff tracks progress made and what is proposed is consistent with the state; however, the state has not adopted thresholds of significance. Ms. Roggenkamp explained that staff had hoped CARB would have developed GHG thresholds, but they have decided not to. If they did, however, the District would conform to those threshold standards. Mr. Bunger noted that under CEQA, each agency that deals with a resource has the authority to create a guidelines document. CEQA has required governing bodies adopt thresholds, and the underlying factor is whether it is supported by substantial evidence.

Directors requested the CEQA guidelines and the summary table of thresholds of significance be made available, and Mr. Hilken agreed to email them to Directors.

Mr. Vintze discussed regular, on-going contact with lead agencies. Mr. Broadbent noted that staff has moved the CEQA guidelines forward, stating that the South Coast Air District and San Joaquin have both adopted thresholds of significance, and he suggested possible future adoption of a resolution that calls on the State to adopt thresholds.

Mr. Vintze continued his presentation and said the District is recommending new or revised thresholds in areas; changing criteria pollutants for ozone precursors from 80 lbs. per day to 54 lbs per day, recommending a new cumulative threshold for local community risks and hazards, and for GHG's, staff will recommend that the Board adopt thresholds at a project level, plan level and construction best management practices.

He said there is a lack of overall guidance from the State and local lead agencies need guidance. The CAPCOA white paper identified a methodology local governments could use in setting GHG thresholds and the District's methodology alluded to that document. Staff is receiving calls for assistance from local governments and methodology developed is based on the AB 32 Scoping Plan.

Mr. Vintze then described GHG's at the Project Level for non-stationary and stationary sources, GHG's at the Plan Level and reasons for arriving at thresholds.

Chairperson Torliatt questioned if there is a way to mandate the level of significance over a local jurisdiction if they have a Climate Action Plan. Mr. Hilken said the District wants to encourage good planning; reductions should be rigorous, and local climate actions plans are as equal to or more stringent. He said the District also wants to ensure cities are promoting consistency with AB 32 in their General Plan and/or Climate Action Plan policies, implementation strategies, and performance. The District outlines ways to measure their progress to see if they are achieving reductions and would recommend a mitigation and monitoring program on an annual basis to confirm emissions reductions.

Mr. Vintze discussed next steps, scheduled workshops, the posting of the draft guidelines, the proposal to bring significance thresholds to the Board of Directors in the fall 2009, continued staff support to lead agencies and staff review/comment on CEQA documents.

Committee Comments/Discussion:

Directors confirmed there was little resistance from the development community. Mr. Hilken indicated that staff has been in contact with the Attorney General's office to discuss efficiency metrics and any differences they may have with how the District is proposing levels.

Director Garner confirmed with Mr. Vintze the locations of workshops held and requested a workshop be held in Santa Clara County. She also asked that guidelines address "mega-mansions", which were not specifically called out in the guidelines.

Directors confirmed with staff that an updated list of mitigation strategies is included in the guidelines; the last list was developed through the CAPCOA white paper and staff confirmed that numbers are hard to meet if transit-oriented development is not proposed. Directors discussed the potential for litigation for projects not able to meet significance thresholds, and Mr. Bunger said



EIR's must evaluate all GHG's and that the lead agency has discretion. Once the District adopts a threshold, it will always raise an evidentiary question. Regarding timing, thresholds apply as soon as they are adopted. The guideline could be enforced and followed until the agency makes a determination up to approval of the Final EIR; however, the lead agency can disregard the District's guidelines, as they are not mandatory.

Mr. Broadbent said there may be instances (approximately 8-10 per year) where the District issues a permit and acts as the lead agency for stationary sources. Directors discussed incentives for developing Climate Actions Plans, and staff noted that 90% of agencies already have emissions inventory analyses which they can utilize in plan development, and also, that some cities are now adopting air quality elements as part of their General Plans.

Directors questioned how CMA's and transportation agencies would incorporate analysis and local GHG emissions reductions, and Ms. Roggenkamp explained that discussions are currently taking place at the Joint Policy Committee level to address this.

Committee Action: None; for information only.

**Committee Members' Comments:** Director Bates noted that MTC is embarking upon further GHG emissions reduction strategies. He requested Directors submit concrete suggestions other than biking and walking strategies, and asked to be able to work with staff on ideas for funding.

**Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 9:30 a.m. – Thursday, October 8, 2009  
939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109

**Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 11:13 a.m.

Lisa Harper  
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kishimoto and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 1, 2009

Re: Overview of Electric Vehicle Technologies

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

None. For information only.

BACKGROUND

The transportation sector accounts for more than 40% of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in the Bay Area. Within the transportation sector, approximately 75% of GHG emissions are generated by on-road vehicles. In order to meet the objectives of the Air District's Climate Protection Initiative, significant reductions from this sector are necessary. Based on recent technological advances, electric vehicles are a promising solution to meeting greenhouse gas emission reduction targets.

DISCUSSION

Staff will present an informational overview on electric vehicle technologies and their development. Additionally, the committee will be updated on options to support the deployment of these technologies in the Bay Area.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT:

None at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Karen M. Schkolnick  
Reviewed by: Jean Roggenkamp

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kishimoto and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 1, 2009

Re: Greenhouse Gas Measures in the Bay Area 2009 Clean Air Plan

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Receive and File.

BACKGROUND

The California Health & Safety Code requires air districts to revise their plans for attaining state ozone standards on a triennial basis. These triennial updates must demonstrate an annual 5% reduction in ozone precursor emissions or contain “all feasible control measures” to attain state ozone standards as expeditiously as practicable and reduce transport to neighboring air basins. To date, all California air districts have pursued the all feasible measures approach.

In response to state and federal requirements and guidelines, air quality planning to date has been performed on a single pollutant basis, with an emphasis on ozone planning. However, in the past several years, there has been growing interest in the concept of multi-pollutant air quality planning. In January 2004, the National Research Council issued recommendations calling for air quality agencies to pursue a multi-pollutant, risk-based, “one atmosphere” approach for air quality planning. US EPA has been moving to gradually embrace the concept of planning on a multi-pollutant basis.

Air District staff agrees with this approach and therefore the 2009 Clean Air Plan (CAP) will provide a multi-pollutant control strategy to reduce emissions of particulate matter, air toxics, and greenhouse gases, in addition to ozone precursors. The plan will propose an integrated control strategy that identifies co-benefits (or disbenefits) of the control measures for each of these pollutants.

DISCUSSION

In preparing the 2009 CAP, staff is developing a multi-pollutant control strategy to address three core goals:

- To improve air quality and attain all applicable standards
- To protect public health
- To protect our climate

Higher temperatures related to global warming are expected to increase emissions and ambient concentrations of criteria pollutants. Therefore, including greenhouse gases in the CAP will help to protect air quality as well as to protect our climate.

Although the CAP is not intended to serve as a regional greenhouse gas reduction (GHG) plan per se, the CAP will address greenhouse gases and climate protection by:

- Including numerical GHG reduction objectives based on targets established in AB 32 and the Governor's 2005 Executive Order.
- Including GHG reductions in the multi-pollutant evaluation method that staff has developed to analyze the benefits of potential control measures on a multi-pollutant basis.
- Seeking to maximize reductions in GHGs from all measures in the CAP control strategy
- Adding a new category of control measures entitled Energy & Climate Measures.

The new Energy & Climate Measures (ECM) category contains four proposed control measures:

- ECM 1 will promote energy efficiency.
- ECM 2 will promote renewable forms of energy.
- ECM 3 will address urban heat island mitigation by promoting cool roofs and cool paving.
- ECM 4 will promote planting of (low biogenic VOC) trees and urban forestry.

The proposed ECMs represent a new direction for the District, and staff is still working to define the best role that the District can play in this area.

In sum, the CAP control strategy will reduce emissions of GHGs, address the need to adapt to climate change via urban heat island mitigation, and support the six-point Regional Agency Joint Climate Action Plan prepared by the Joint Policy Committee.

#### BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

Staff and consultant work on the 2009 CAP was included in the FYE 09 and FYE 10 budgets.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: David Burch  
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken