

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5000

## APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors  
Mobile Source Committee Meeting  
Thursday, January 27, 2011  
9:30 a.m.

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairperson Scott Haggerty called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Roll Call: Scott Haggerty, Chairperson; Directors Jennifer Hosterman, David E. Hudson, Carol Klatt, Nate Miley, Mark Ross and Gayle B. Uilkema; Tom Bates, Board Chairperson

Absent: Vice Chairperson Carole Groom; Directors Brad Wagenknecht and Shirlee Zane

**Public Comments:** There were no public comments.

### 3. **Approval of Minutes:** Mobile Source Committee Meeting of November 18, 2010

**Committee Action:** Director Klatt made a motion to approve the November 18, 2010 Mobile Source Committee minutes; seconded by Director Ross, carried unanimously without objection.

### 4. **Consideration of Projects with Proposed Grant Awards over \$100,000**

Anthony Fournier, Grants Manager gave the staff presentation and provided background on this item which included:

- Carl Moyer Program (CMP)
  - Created in 1998 to reduce emissions from heavy-duty engines
  - Voluntary program that funds surplus emission reductions
- Mobile Source Incentive Fund (MSIF)
  - AB 923 allowed for additional \$2 motor vehicle registration fee surcharge (12/04)
  - CMP projects eligible for MSIF funding

Mr. Fournier continued with the following:

- On 3/17/10 District Board of Directors:
  - Approved participation in CMP Year 12
  - Authorized Executive Officer/APCO to execute contracts and amendments with grant awards up to \$100,000

- CMP Year 12 Project Recommendation (over \$100k)
  - 5 Projects to replace:
    - Three pieces of off-road equipment
    - Four marine engines
  - \$782,727 in total awards
  - Emission reductions: Over 7.87 Tons Per Year (TPY) of criteria pollutants

Mr. Fournier continued with the presentation showing all projects that will receive CMP funding as of January 7, 2011 by equipment category and by county.

Staff recommended that the Committee request the Board of Directors approve the five Carl Moyer Program projects with proposed grant awards over \$100,000; and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended Carl Moyer projects.

Committee Comments/Questions:

Chairperson Haggerty asked about workshops held in the Tri-Valley area and if they were well attended. Mr. Breen agreed to follow up with the Committee to provide a definitive response. In addition, Chairperson Haggerty requested an update of participation at the workshops in all nine counties.

Director Ross asked about outreach efforts and Mr. Breen responded that outreach is an ongoing effort. The focus of the program this year is to continue with agriculture equipment and marine vessels, and then shift to on-road trucking.

Public Comments: None.

**Committee Action:** Director Ross made a motion to recommend Board of Directors' approval of Carl Moyer projects with proposed grant awards over \$100,000; and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended Carl Moyer projects; Director Klatt seconded the motion, carried unanimously without objection.

**5. Consideration of \$5 Million in Mobile Source Incentive Funds (MSIF) Funding for Shore-Power Projects**

Damian Breen, Director of Strategic Incentives, gave the staff presentation and Mr. Breen provided background of this item which included:

- Mobile Source Incentive Fund (MSIF)
  - AB 923 allowed for additional \$2 motor vehicle registration fee surcharge (12/04)
  - CMP projects eligible for MSIF funding
  - On 6/16/10, District Board of Directors reserved up to \$5 million in MSIF funding in support of shore-power projects at Bay Area ports

Staff contacted Bay Area terminals, ports and ship owners, to notify them of the solicitation that the District opened on October 27, 2010, and closed on November 19, 2010.

Although there was a lot of interest, the only application received was from the Port of Oakland. The Port of Oakland's application included:

- 3 berths
- \$18 million total cost
- Among the busiest terminals

Mr. Breen continued stating the emissions reductions are substantial: approximately one-half ton of diesel particulate annually and approximately five tons in project life emission reductions.

Mr. Breen continued with the presentation stating that the cost effectiveness of the projects range from \$12,000 to \$16,000 per ton of emissions reduced.

Staff recommended that the Committee request the Board of Directors approve the MSIF shore power project recommendations for the allocation of \$5 million to three berths at the Port of Oakland; and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended MSIF projects.

Committee Comments/Questions:

Director Hosterman asked about the remaining sources of funds. Mr. Breen stated that the port will use a combination of four funds, including a grant from the federal government. Director Hosterman asked about the timeline for retrofitting the three berths. Mr. Breen responded retrofitting will begin Summer 2012.

Public Comments:

Richard Sinkoff, Director of Environmental Programs and Planning, Port of Oakland, thanked the District for working with the Port. Mr. Sinkoff indicated that the Port of Oakland applied for and was awarded a TIGER grant in the amount of \$8 million.

The Committee thanked Mr. Sinkoff for providing additional details.

**Committee Action:** Director Miley made a motion to recommend Board of Directors' approval of the MSIF shore power project recommendations for the allocation of \$5 million in MSIF to three berths at the Port of Oakland; and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended MSIF projects; Director Hosterman seconded the motion, carried unanimously without objection.

## **6. Consideration of Air District Participation in Year 13 of the Carl Moyer Program**

Anthony Fournier, Grants Manager gave the staff report, and provided the Committee with the following:

- CARB allocation
  - \$58.6 million statewide
  - Up to \$10.6 million for the Bay Area
  - 5% allocation for administrative costs
- Proposed \$5 million MSIF allocation
  - \$1.7 million required District match
  - \$3.3 million for additional CMP projects
- 2008 CARB CMP Guidelines
- Impacted Communities
  - Priority given to projects reducing emissions in highly impacted communities
  - At least 50% of funds for projects in most impacted areas

- Projects over \$100k brought to the Board for approval
- Schedule
  - First-come, first served process
  - Call for project applications ~ April/ May 2011
  - Funds must be obligated by June 2012, and invoices paid by June 2013

Staff recommended that the Committee request the Board of Directors' adopt a resolution authorizing the Executive Officer/APCO to execute all necessary agreements with the California Air Resources Board (CARB) relating to the Air District's receipt of Carl Moyer Program funds for fiscal year 2010-2011 (Program Year 13); and allocate \$5 million in Mobile Source Incentive Funding for projects eligible for funding under the Carl Moyer Program.

Committee Comments/Questions:

Director Hosterman asked if the allocation was a fair amount for the Bay Area. Mr. Breen replied stating the dollar amount requested on an annual basis is for an amount based on the population, which is roughly 20% for the state of California.

Public Comments: None.

**Committee Action:** Director Hudson made a motion to recommend the Board of Directors' adopt a resolution authorizing the Executive Officer/APCO to execute all necessary agreements with the California Air Resources Board (CARB) relating to the Air District's receipt of Carl Moyer Program funds for fiscal year 2010-2011 (Program Year 13); and allocate \$5 million in Mobile Source Incentive Funding for projects eligible for funding under the Carl Moyer Program; Director Hosterman seconded the motion, carried unanimously without objection.

**7. Consideration of Contract Award(s) for the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) Electric Vehicle Supply Equipment (EVSE) Deployment Program**

Damian Breen, Director of Strategic Incentives, informed the Committee that this item represents the first phase of the electric vehicle infrastructure deployment program. Mr. Breen introduced Karen Schkolnick, Air Quality Program Manager who provided the staff presentation.

Ms. Schkolnick provided the following background:

- August 4, 2010, Air District's Board of Directors allocated \$5 million to support electric vehicle (EV) infrastructure projects
- December 9, 2010, Air District issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) seeking contractors to implement three (3) program components:
  - EVSE Home Chargers
  - DC Fast Charger Deployment
  - Program Coordination
- Responses to the RFP were due January 5, 2011

The Home Charger Program RPF requirements include:

- Deploy up to 3,000 Level 2 residential chargers by December 30, 2012
- Residents provided a rebate, or discount, of at least \$700

- Multiple contractors allow residents to choose broader range of EVs and charger technologies at varying price points
- Contractors to collect and report usage data through GPS, electronic or surveys

Based on the results of the RFP, staff recommended awards to the four top scoring applicants.

- ECOtality
- Coulomb Technology
- AeroVironment
- Clipper Creek

This recommendation maximizes Bay Area residents options, by allowing them to select among various contractors that provide different charger technologies at various price points.

Staff recommended the largest portion of the project be awarded to ECOtality, based on their proposal to provide charging equipment and its installation at no cost to Bay Area residents in most cases.

In addition, ECOtality's proposal includes an invitation to join the United States Department of Energy's The EV Project:

- 1,500 DC fast charge inlets on EVs at no cost
- \$4,992,500 DOE cost share (for all 3 components)

The EV Project consists of the following:

- \$230 Million project
  - Currently being implemented in 16 communities in the United States
  - Plan public EV infrastructure deployment
  - Provide residential and public EVSE
  - Collect data and study behavior and EVSE utilization

Ms. Schkolnick continued stating that by contracting with ECOtality and joining The EV Project, the Air District would have access to the data and could utilize it to support future strategic investments in the Bay Area.

Additional program components that were a part of the RFP are as follows:

- Deploy 25-50 DC fast chargers by June 30, 2012
- Air District provides discount of at least \$15k per charger installed at ~10-mile intervals along major roadways to support:
  - Extended travel within Bay Area and interstate corridors
  - EV drivers that lack home chargers
- Contractor to collect and report usage data electronically

Based on the results of the RFP, staff proposed awards for deployment of the DC Fast Charger component to the two top ranking bidders.

- ECOtality
- AeroVironment

Both are highly experienced in deployment of DC fast charging equipment and will offer competitive rates to the end users.

In addition, the ECOtality proposal included:

- Matched with significant funding from DOE
- Provide detailed usage data about DOE project vehicles that will help to inform future fast charging deployments
- Supports West Coast EV Corridor (between Washington/Oregon and Southern California)

The Program Coordination component of the RFP provides up to \$50k for:

- Regional home and public charger permitting coordination
- Evaluation of sustainable business models
- Coordination with local stakeholders to share best practices

Staff recommended an award of \$50,000 to top ranking ECOtality. ECOtality scored highest based on extensive public coordination and planning experience and cost share match from DOE.

Next steps include the following:

- Complete Regional EV Strategic Plan led by JPC in partnership with BAAQMD, MTC and ABAG. The plan is anticipated to be completed in Spring 2011. The strategy will:
  - Assess Bay Area's readiness to support electric vehicles and the necessity to deploy additional public chargers
  - Develop criteria to inform funding priorities
- Use the results of the Regional EV Strategic Plan, along with the results of the work performed through the contracts, to develop a recommendation for the second phase of EV deployment.
- By December 2011, based on results of Strategic Plan and Program Coordination, as needed:
  - Issue new RFP for Level 2 Public Charging program element
  - Expand current program elements

Ms. Schkolnick concluded the presentation, recommending that the Committee request the Board of Directors' award ECOtality, Coulomb Technology, AeroVironment and Clipper Creek contracts for the EVSE Home Charger Rebate project (\$3,087,500); award ECOtality and AeroVironment contracts for the Direct Current (DC) Fast Charger Deployment project (\$764,800); award ECOtality contract for Program Coordination (\$50,000); and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute contracts with each of these contractors.

Committee Comments/Questions:

Director Ross asked who will be the lead with regard to public outreach to attract applicants. Mr. Breen stated that public outreach will be led by the contractors, as this is part of the RFP. Mr. Breen continued that the contractors have existing relationships with various auto manufacturers.

Director Bates asked if an individual was to purchase an electrical vehicle, would that individual be eligible to receive a free home charger. Mr. Breen stated that when an individual goes to the dealer, the dealer will make the buyer aware of the various options available during the time of purchase.

Director Bates also asked about the cost associated with the charger. Mr. Breen responded the equipment ranges from \$1,000 to \$2,000 for installation. In addition, Mr. Breen stated that ECOtality will provide the District with financial models to show who is paying for electricity, how it supports the maintenance of the equipment.

Director Ross asked who would be responsible for selecting the contractor. Mr. Breen responded that it will be the responsibility of the homeowner to select a contractor.

Director Miley asked how much of an increase will an individual see on their electric bill. Mr. Breen responded that it will vary based on the size of the vehicle's battery.

Chairperson Haggerty asked who was responsible for ranking the proposals. Mr. Breen responded that District staff was responsible for ranking the proposals. Chairperson Haggerty suggested utilizing groups from outside of the District. In addition, Chairperson Haggerty asked where the companies are located.

Ms. Schkolnick stated that ECOtality is located in San Francisco. Coulomb Technology is based in Cupertino. AeroVironment is located in Southern California and Clipper Creek has offices in Sacramento and Georgia.

Public Comments:

Jonathan Read from ECOtality expressed his appreciation for receiving the award. Mr. Read also stated that his company is working with various utility companies on rates. Mr. Read informed the Committee that the actual cost of electricity versus actual consumption of gas is about one fourth of the cost of gasoline (if charging at night), with an average monthly gas bill of about \$144 per month compared with a night time energy bill of about \$35. Staff will provide the Committee with an update on the costs for charging electric vehicles at a future meeting.

**Committee Action:** Director Hudson made a motion to recommend Board of Directors' award ECOtality, Coulomb Technology, AeroVironment and Clipper Creek contracts for the EVSE Home Charger Rebate project (\$3,087,500); award ECOtality and AeroVironment contracts for the Direct Current (DC) Fast Charger Deployment project (\$764,800); award ECOtality contract for Program Coordination (\$50,000); and authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute contracts with each of these contractors; Director Hosterman seconded the motion, carried unanimously without objection.

**Committee Member Comments:** None.

**Next Meeting:** At the call of the chair.

**Adjournment:** Meeting adjourned at 10:30 a.m.

*VS/ Vanessa Johnson*

Vanessa Johnson  
Executive Secretary II