

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting and Retreat
and
Meeting of the Public Health Committee
Meeting of the Air Quality Planning Committee
Meeting of the Technical Committee
10:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 8, 2003

1. **Call to Order – Roll Call.** 10:15 a.m. Quorum Present: William Hanna, Chairperson, Sam Altshuler, P.E., Elinor Blake, Harold M. Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Ignatius Ding, Fred Glueck, Rob Harley, Ph.D., Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Jane Kelly, Kraig Kurucz, William A. Nack, Robert F. Sawyer, Ph.D., P.E., Kevin Shanahan, Linda Weiner, Brian Zamora. Absent: Patrick Congdon, Norman A. Lopera, Jr., Jill Stoner.
2. **Public Comment Period.** There were no public comments.
3. **Recognition of Outgoing Council and Committee Chairs.** Chairperson Hanna acknowledged the years of service on the Council of four previous Council members Jane Seleznow, Terry Trumbull, Chuck Harvey and Karen Licavoli. On behalf of the Council, he expressed his appreciation to outgoing Standing Committee Chairs Fred Glueck and Sam Altshuler, P.E., and to outgoing Council Chair Robert F. Sawyer, Ph.D., P.E., for their outstanding leadership during 2002.
4. **Approval of Minutes of November 13, 2002.** Mr. Altshuler requested that, in the first sentence of paragraph one on page three, “particle count numbers” replace “PM levels” and that the next sentence end at “less NOx.” The sentence that follows should read “NO2 levels from CNG are not affected by the addition of an oxidation catalyst and are therefore considerably less than a CRT-equipped diesel.” Dr. Sawyer requested that at the top of page two, the reference to NOx be deleted and “about” be inserted before “83%”. Mr. Altshuler moved adoption of the minutes as corrected; seconded by Mr. Glueck; carried; with Messrs. Hayes, Nack and Dawid abstaining.
5. **Staff Presentations:**
 - A. **Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory.** Mike Sandler and Ann Hancock of the Sonoma County Climate Protection Campaign (SCCPC) stated that 137 cities and local jurisdictions in the United States have adopted resolutions endorsing climate protection. Increasing regulation of greenhouse gas emissions is likely, given the multi-nation ratification of the Kyoto Protocol and California’s adoption of AB 1439 addressing greenhouse gas emissions from transportation. Sonoma County and its nine cities are developing a greenhouse gas emissions inventory from government operations and will set targets for reducing the emissions, create an action plan for achieving those targets, implement the plan and monitor its progress. Sonoma County and Santa Rosa have each completed their emission inventories, and within the next six months the remaining eight cities are expected to complete theirs. The Sonoma County Waste Management Agency (SCWMA) provides administration for the project because all the cities and the county are represented on it. To support the program, Sonoma County has contributed \$25,000 and Santa Rosa has provided \$10,000. The other eight cities are each expected to contribute \$4,000.

The SCCPC believes that District technical expertise, public outreach and relations programs and its regional focus combine to create an ideal context for the coordination of regional climate protection efforts. It is therefore seeking \$25,000 from the District as well as its participation in the project. The District in turn will obtain data on how climate protection plans interface with attainment plans. Scientific data indicates that while criteria pollutants have been reduced over the years CO2 levels continue to increase. Some of the funding from the District will also be used to leverage other funding for this project in Sonoma County. At the end of nine months, the SCCPC will provide a written report on these issues as well as make a presentation to the Board of Directors, and if requested, to the Advisory Council as well.

In discussion, Council members made the following suggestions to the SCCPC representatives:

- Re-approach the Northern Sonoma County Air Quality Management District for additional funds for this project. That District lead California in woodsmoke abatement, and much of the Bay Area's woodsmoke abatement action followed its initiative. (Altshuler)
- Precisely delineate the scope of emission inventory work conducted by the California Climate Action Registry and the SCCPC and consider how to coordinate their efforts. (Hayes)
- Set aside part of the \$25,000 to evaluate the methodology used to collect the data and to replicate it in other local jurisdictions. This goes beyond the SCCPC efforts to get the resolution passed elsewhere, and of ICLEI to replicate methodology for data gathering, and includes replicating and tracking the SCCPC program in other local jurisdictions. (Weiner).
- Precisely identify in what other ways the District may participate, such as in providing technical assistance in evaluating the link between the pollutants it regulates and greenhouse gas emissions, and in coordinating with outreach programs in other jurisdictions. (Blake)
- More clearly link the climate protection purpose of the SCCPC with the District's mission to protect public health through attainment of ambient air quality standards. Consider areas of SCCPC program linkage with new state regulation of fuel economy. Address impacts of warmer temperature on air quality from increased gasoline evaporation from vehicles, increased vapor emissions from stationary sources and increased electricity demand. Such linkages would more clearly place the SCCPC within the District's purview. (Harley)

Ms. Kelly opined that District involvement in the field of greenhouse gas emissions is appropriate since it is likely to receive regulatory responsibility for climate protection. Dr. Sawyer added that District staff support should also be provided to assist in ascertaining the nexus between greenhouse gas emissions and ozone photochemistry. Mr. Dawid observed that given the link between air quality and climate change, clean diesel might compare favorably with CNG. Mr. Altshuler replied it is important to consider the role of elemental carbon in effecting global climate change and added that there is considerable debate on the preferred fuel for buses (diesel, CNG, biodiesel, LNG) all of which have implications for emissions of CO2.

Mr. Norton stated the Board would like to receive by the Council's next Regular Meeting its recommendation on whether the District should support this program. Mr. Kurucz stated the Council should first know more about the status of the District's budget in light of the state budget crisis before adopting a position. Chairperson Hanna responded that the Advisory Council's role is to advise the Board as to the worthiness of this proposed project. The Board of Directors and the District staff are best positioned to evaluate its fiscal impacts.

Ms. Blake moved that the Council go on record as indicating it has heard the report and will consider it further, and recommends that the Board of Directors formalize its support for the project through a letter that could be used in fund raising or other SCCPC activities; seconded by Dr. Holtzclaw. The motion FAILED on roll call:

AYES: Blake, Brazil, Ding, Holtzclaw, Kelly, Sawyer, Weiner, Zamora.

NOES: Altshuler, Dawid, Glueck, Hanna, Harley, Hayes, Kurucz, Nack, Shanahan.

Mr. Hayes moved that the Council indicate it has heard the report of the SCCPC and supports in concept the regional approach this proposal represents to greenhouse gas management; that it plans to take it under further consideration and refer it to the Air Quality Planning and Technical Committees; and that it will adopt recommendations at its next Regular Meeting on March 12, 2003; seconded by Dr. Holtzclaw; carried unanimously by acclamation.

B. 2004 Ozone Attainment Plan. Tom Perardi, Planning Division Director, stated that the federal and state law requires that attainment plans be submitted to meet specific air quality standards by a prescribed deadline. The 2004 Ozone Attainment Plan derives from commitments made by the District in the 2001 Plan for a mid-course review. The latter was the region's strategy for attaining the national one-hour ozone standard by 2006 and projected reductions in ozone precursor emissions of 245 tons per day between the base year 2000 and the attainment year 2006. The Attainment Assessment of the 2001 Plan was extensively discussed regarding uncertainties in the emissions reduction target. The mid-course review will use air quality data and analyses from 2003-04 to evaluate the adequacy of the 2001 Plan. The data gathering from routine and intensive studies, its quality assurance, delivery and formatting for use in modeling three different historic episodes, are nearly complete. ENVIRON Corporation has conducted preliminary meteorological and photochemical modeling runs for use in developing emission reduction targets and attainment demonstrations, and these are scheduled for completion by mid-2003. The first community meeting on the Plan is scheduled for this March. New control measures and programs will be considered, followed by environmental review. The final plan will be submitted to the Board in March 2004, to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) in April of 2004 and thereafter to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). Dr. Holtzclaw urged that the Plan contain data on attainment projections contained in previous Plans for criteria pollutants and their sources to ascertain if initial projections squared with the results.

6. Reports of Standing Committees:

A. Public Health Committee Meeting of December 9, 2002. Mr. Zamora reviewed the memorandum entitled "Particulate Matter" (PM), dated December 10, 2002, which presents recommendations on improving PM abatement within the District. He noted that their review by the Technical Committee, particularly the item on diesel PM traps, is desirable. In reply to Council member questions, Ms. Blake stated the following:

- Diesel locomotive idling and heavy-duty diesel truck idling were not addressed. Transit and school buses have been the primary focus over the years and the latter were addressed in a recent CARB rule. The recommendations could be updated to reflect CARB's action.
- Based on data provided to the Committee by District Statistician Dr. David Fairley, woodsmoke PM is a significant PM source year-round throughout the Bay Area.
- The District should re-examine its current policy on the use of PM emission offset credits.

- The basis for recommending the mapping of PM on a temporal resolution of less than 24-hours is aimed at better understanding PM source apportionment.

Mr. Altshuler stated discussion at the Technical Committee level would prove helpful as PM chemistry and size are important relative to toxicity, and diesel PM is more toxic than woodsmoke PM. Back-up generators (BUGs) are additional PM sources of concern. Mr. Shanahan and Ms. Weiner recommended the Committee review a document on BUGs prepared by the Environmental Defense Fund (EDF) and receive a presentation from EDF member Nancy Ryan. The Council reached consensus that the recommendations be referred to the Technical Committee. Dr. Harley indicated the Committee would review them in February.

B. Air Quality Planning Committee (AQPC) Meetings of December 9, 2002 and January 6, 2003. Mr. Kurucz stated that on December 9, 2002 the Committee unanimously endorsed the District staff's proposed policy changes to the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) regarding heavy-duty diesel engines in proposed new Policy No. 27. It also received a presentation from Don Brady from Networkcar on a remote emissions monitoring program for high-use vehicles such as taxicabs and paratransit vehicles in the South Coast AQMD. On January 6, 2003 the Committee unanimously recommended establishing such a program within the District. It also adopted eight preliminary recommendations on vehicle Inspection & Maintenance (I&M) that emphasize the need to deal with gross polluting vehicles (GPVs). The Committee is developing background data to establish a basis for its recommendations.

In discussion, Ms. Weiner observed that the quotation from *The Wall Street Journal* attributed by staff to CARB Chair Dr. Alan Lloyd in support of clean diesel is not entirely in context. She opined that the proposed policy change could undermine the momentum for alternative fuel vehicle programs supported by the TFCA. The American Lung Association (ALA) has written to the District and acknowledges that while retrofitting older vehicles is desirable, a more thorough assessment of the issues is needed. The ALA recommends that 80% all TFCA funds be allocated to offset purchase costs of alternative fuel vehicles and a maximum of 20% for diesel change-outs and retrofits.

B. Technical Committee Meeting of December 3, 2002. Mr. Altshuler stated the Committee discussed biogenic emissions from a eucalyptus grove west of Livermore. It received presentations from Klaus Scott of CARB and Jim Wilkinson of Alpine Geophysics on biogenic emissions, their sources, modeling and quantification. Both speakers estimated two tons per day of isoprene would be emitted from the grove, although the margin of error is an order of magnitude. The Committee is evaluating the use of observation-based measurements to discern any markers of isoprene in the monitoring station data near Livermore.

The Committee was briefed by staff on the proposed policy changes to the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) and after lengthy discussion unanimously support the staff position. Mr. Altshuler opined that the committee did not have the benefit of knowing what other interested parties have said about the proposal and he expressed concern that the Public Health Committee has not reviewed the proposal. He added that the proposed changes could adversely impact TFCA funding for alternative fuel vehicles and that a cap on diesel re-powering funding in the proposed new policy would therefore be appropriate. He also stated that the minutes from the Technical Committee meeting of December 3, 2002 should also have been included in the material that is forwarded to the Board Mobile Source Committee on January 9, 2003. The applicable section of those minutes should be presented to the Mobile Source Committee tomorrow.

Mr. Dawid stated he was impressed with the emission reduction potential of the proposed policy change. He expressed his support for the clean diesel program as well as concern over advocating alternative fuel in existing industry. Mr. Shanahan expressed concern over the notion of a cap on diesel re-powering, noting that the goal of the TFCA is to reduce vehicle emissions in the most cost-effective way possible. The economics of the TFCA projects ought not to be artificially manipulated. For the cost of replacing two diesel-powered refuse trucks with alternative fuel motive power, an entire fleet of older diesel engines could be retrofitted with PM traps. The approach to the TFCA program must be emission-reduction driven. Mr. Altshuler replied that “while emission reductions may be achieved in the early part of the program, the older engines would be run longer and less likely to be replaced in 2007 with a cleaner engine. The long-term impact of the proposed policy change requires further study.”

Chairperson Hanna stated that as there is no specific recommendation from either Committee that this endorsement go before the Board, the Committees should therefore examine this matter further during the working lunch and report out to the full Council when it reconvenes.

- D. Executive Committee Meeting of January 8, 2003.** Chairperson Hanna stated that the Committee discussed several referrals from District staff and the Board. The 2004 Ozone Plan has been assigned to the Technical Committee and intermittent control measures to the Technical and AQPC. The Technical Committee will review CNG and liquid natural gas (LNG) as engine fuels displacing diesel in internal combustion engines. The Public Health and Technical Committees will review fence line monitoring at refineries. The Public Health Committee will review marine shipping and loading as a source of emissions, as well as the District’s role in a catastrophic event. The proposal for a regional greenhouse gas emission inventory has been discussed and referred to the AQPC and Technical Committee.

With regard to Council issues continued from 2002, the Public Health Committee recommendations on PM abatement, and the AQPC recommendations on vehicle I&M have been referred to the Technical Committee. The Technical Committee will evaluate the role of biogenic emissions in ozone formation near Livermore, the air quality impact of the September 11, 2001 airport shutdown and the Port of Oakland shutdown in late September and early October 2002. The Committee Chairs will choose among the Further Study and Stationary Source Control Measures presented by staff in a “Rule Development Action List for 2003.” The proposed policy change to the TFCA was referred back to the Committees today.

- 7. Working Lunch for Meetings and Discussion Sessions of the Public Health Committee, Air Quality Planning Committee and Technical Committee.** The Council broke into Standing Committees at 12:20 p.m. Chairperson Hanna directed the Committees to give priority to their assigned topics and bring up additional topics from the members where desirable. A District staff member will be present at each of the Standing Committee meetings to provide information on the District’s priorities.
- 8. Reconvene to Full Council Format for Follow-up on Committee Discussion Sessions.** The Council reconvened at 1:15 p.m. Chairperson Hanna welcomed new members Irvin Dawid and John Holtzclaw, Ph.D (Conservation Organization) and Linda Weiner (Public Health Agency).

Mr. Kurucz stated the AQPC will review I&M, the regional greenhouse gas emission inventory, intermittent ozone control strategies with parking cash-out as an adjunct subject, and will assign a member to attend Council Committee meetings at which fence line monitoring is discussed.

Mr. Zamora stated the Public Health Committee would meet on February 10, April 14, June 9, August 11, October 20 and December 8. Its first priorities are PM abatement, marine shipping as a source of potential emission reductions, and the TFCA policy change. Other topics in order of priority include review of fence line monitoring, the role of the District in a Bay Area catastrophe, Toxic Compound New Source Review (Regulation 2) and Yeast Manufacturing (New Rule).

Dr. Harley stated the Technical Committee will meet on February 4 and will focus on intermittent control measures and how they relate to Spare the Air days in the summer. A staff presentation on current intermittent controls is requested. It will also address the referrals from the other Standing Committees. Later in the year, the Committee will resume evaluation of biogenic emissions near Livermore. The Committee will also take up the monitoring and control of refinery flares. The yearlong mission of the Committee will be the District's ozone attainment planning efforts.

Chairperson Hanna called for further comments on the TFCA issue discussed earlier. TFCA Supervisor Liz Berdugo reviewed the grant structure of the TFCA and the proposed new policy regarding heavy-duty diesel engines. She noted that questions have been raised as to whether this policy will lead to the diverting of funds from alternate fuel vehicle programs. The District will continue to support these programs and views the policy change as a complement to rather than a replacement of alternate fuel programs. The new policy is another means through which to further reduce mobile source emissions. It is unlikely that re-powering applications will flood the TFCA funding pool as at the present time no diesel engine meets CARB's stringent 2004 optional reduced emission standard. In reply to Ms. Weiner's comments on the longevity of PM filters and the need to review topical studies, Ms. Berdugo noted that the record of discussion of the CARB rule on PM filters contains information on this issue. Chairperson Hanna stated that as there is no specific recommendation from the Committees endorsing the proposed new policy for forwarding to the Board, and as there still exists some controversy within the Council as to various aspects of the policy, it will suffice for the minutes of this meeting to reflect the Council members' statements.

9. **Council Members Comments/Other Business.** Ms. Blake commended District staff for its work on the "Don't Light Tonight" program in recent weeks. Ms. Lee responded that the first winter advisory in many years was issued on December 7, 2002. The PM standard was exceeded on that day, and excellent press coverage was received. Mr. Ding noted that the federal government is holding to a firm position on off-road diesel emissions. Chairperson Hanna noted that the Council does review off-road emissions, although CARB has regulatory jurisdiction over them.
10. **Time and Place of Next Meeting.** 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 12, 2003, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109.
11. **Tour of District Divisions & Facility.** District staff conducted a tour of the District divisions and building facility for interested Council members, starting at 1:47 p.m.
12. **Adjournment.** 3:02 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by

James N. Corazza
Deputy Clerk of the Boards