

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street - San Francisco, California 94109

ADVISORY COUNCIL
PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE MEETING
1:30 p.m., Monday, February 10, 2003, Room 716

Brian Zamora, Chair, Elinor Blake,
Ignatius Ding, Jane Kelly, J.D., Linda Weiner

AGENDA

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

2. Public Comment Period

The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council Committee meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's purview. Speakers are limited to five minutes each.

3. Approval of Minutes of December 9, 2002

4. Update on Model Woodsmoke Ordinance

Staff will report on the adoption of the Model Woodsmoke Ordinance by Bay Area cities and counties.

5. Understanding Optical Remote Sensing and How It Relates To Fence Line Monitoring

Alton Arnett, Business Manager, TerraAir Services, Houston, Texas, will provide a brief introduction to optical remote sensing and how it is currently being used to monitor ambient air at refineries and chemical plants.

6. Committee Member Comments/Other Business

Committee or staff members on their own initiative, or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on their own activities, provide a reference to staff about factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting

1:30 p.m., Monday, April 14, 2003, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

8. Adjournment

BZ:jc

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109
(415) 771-6000

CLERK OF THE BOARDS OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS
F E B R U A R Y 2 0 0 3

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Advisory Council Technical Committee	Tuesday	4	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conference Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting - CANCELLED -	Wednesday	5	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee	Monday	10	10:00 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Advisory Council Public Health Committee	Monday	10	1:30 p.m.	Room 716
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	13	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Regional Agency Coordinating Committee (RACC)	Friday	21	1:30 – 3:00 p.m.	MTC 101 Eighth Street Oakland, CA 94607
Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee	Tuesday	25	9:30 a.m.	Room 716
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conference Room

MR:mr
1/31/03 (11:48 a.m.)
P/Library/Calendar/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109
(415) 771-6000

CLERK OF THE BOARDS OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS
M A R C H 2 0 0 3

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	5	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Executive Committee	Wednesday	12	9:00 a.m.	Room 716
Advisory Council Regular Meeting	Wednesday	12	10:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	13	9:30 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	4th Floor Conf. Room

MR:mr
1/21/03 (2:12 p.m.)
P/Library/Calendar/Moncal

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109

DRAFT MINUTES

Public Health Committee Meeting
9:30 a.m., Monday, December 9, 2003

1. **Call to Order – Roll Call.** 1:32 p.m. Quorum Present: Brian Zamora, Chairperson, Elinor Blake, Ignatius Ding, Jane Seleznow. Absent: Jane Kelly. Also present: Advisory Council Chairperson-Elect William Hanna, and Linda Weiner, American Lung Association, the new Advisory Council member in the “Public Health Agency” category whose term will begin effective January 1, 2003:
2. **Public Comment Period.** There were no public comments.
3. **Approval of Minutes of October 28, 2002.** Ms. Blake moved approved of the minutes; seconded by Ms. Seleznow; carried unanimously.
4. **Update on Model Woodsmoke Ordinance.** Luna Salaver, Public Information Officer, stated that Marin County has concluded its community meetings on the ordinance, which will be presented to the Board of Supervisors next year. The Santa Clara County Board of Supervisors will vote to accept staff recommendations on the ordinance tomorrow. Last week the City of Sebastopol introduced the ordinance. It included a provision to change-out uncertified woodstoves upon change of home ownership, which realtors opposed. Since the District was not notified of this meeting it was not present to support the ordinance. Staff subsequently contacted the Sebastopol Mayor’s office, offering technical assistance. Staff has also contacted the Mayors of the Cities of Oakland and El Cerrito about the ordinance, and the City of Oakland has expressed an interest in it. To date, the ordinance has been adopted in 22 cities and four counties in the Bay Area. On December 7 the District issued its first *Spare the Air Tonight* wintertime advisory notice in nearly a decade.

Ms. Salaver added that the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District will adopt a wood-smoke rule that contains a mandatory no burn provision based on the federal PM10 standard. The Committee requested that at its next meeting, further information be presented on whether this regulation requires woodstove change-out and/or fireplace removal upon change of home ownership and if the mandatory no burn advisory exempts wood burning in EPA-certified equipment. The manner in which the rule will be enforced also requires further investigation.

5. **Continued Discussion of Particulate Matter (PM).** Ms. Blake reviewed her “Draft resolution concerning PM2.5, for consideration by the Public Health Committee,” dated December 10, 2002, as follows:
 - 1) *the Council applauds the District’s rejuvenation of the “Don’t light tonight” program. We recommend that the 65 mg/m³ trigger (the national 24-hour standard) be phased quickly downward to the PM 2.5 air quality sub index of 40 mg/m³, a level at which the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has determined causes unhealthful effects in sensitive groups.*

Ms. Blake stated this is based on EPA's determination of the level at which PM health effects occur for sensitive groups. Mr. Hess replied that by lowering the threshold to 40 mg/m³, program advisories would be issued on almost every winter day, thus reducing the urgency with which they are perceived. Mr. Ding suggested that advisories could be issued every third day if the forecasted PM levels would generate advisories on consecutive days. Ms. Salaver added that the 65 mg/m³ level is considered unhealthy for all groups and therefore carries greater weight with the media. Mr. Hanna recommended the language indicate that although health benefits would accrue from a lower threshold, less compliance with such advisories might follow. Chairperson Zamora replied that the Committee typically sets forth a recommendation based on a public health perspective and the District staff and the Board of Directors are best positioned to assess its political implications.

2) *evaluate the "Don't light tonight" program with regard to public awareness and actions taken in response to the alerts. (Is this already in Terry's plan??).* In response to questions, Ms. Salaver indicated she would inquire whether a follow-up survey is intended for this program. The Committee agreed to further address this aspect at the January 8, 2003 Advisory Council Retreat.

3) *map PM concentrations in areas of likely concern (e.g., populated inland valleys) during winter days and nights, including weekends, using appropriate portable PM monitoring devices. These efforts should examine temporal PM profiles, not just 24-hour averages. The information will assist in determining control strategies, publicizing the problem, and building public awareness and support for District efforts.* Ms. Blake stated that portable PM monitoring devices are widely available, easy to use and could provide detailed information from the local community level.

4) *for both educational and data-gathering purposes, give grants and support others' grants to school districts to buy portable PM monitoring devices for student use, or loan such devices to school districts to map local emissions. Provide technical support for this effort, and seek coordination with local health and environmental health officials. (Appropriate devices are now relatively inexpensive.) Ms. Blake opined that this type of program is analogous with the current nationwide creek-monitoring program that is associated with school districts as well.*

5) *compare real-time and 24-hour average PM data from regional District monitors to see if they reflect micro-environmental PM concentrations tracked under #(3) and (4) (above).*

6) *consider making the case for fireplace change-out on sale of a home, a provision omitted from the District's model ordinance on wood smoke, which now addresses only new sources of wood smoke, i.e. new home construction.* Ms. Salaver noted that the ordinance has been more successful where proposed without a strong change-out provision due to opposition from realtors at public hearings and community meetings. Sensitive groups have tended to be less vocal. Mr. Hanna opined that a change-out provision will hardly affect the already high prices of homes and therefore should be included as one of the options that a city is free to accept or reject. Mr. Ding suggested that homes also be certified as "smoke free" by real estate boards just as appliances are marked as energy saving, thus earning a "brownie point." Chairperson Zamora called for public comment:

Linda Weiner
American Lung Association (ALA)

stated the ALA could arrange for asthmatics to speak at the community meetings and public hearings on the ordinance. Such advocacy is analogous with the efforts concerning tobacco legislation.

7) *continue to provide dedicated staff support for advocacy of the wood smoke ordinance and its adoption by local jurisdictions.*

8) *support a ban on diesel bus idling near schools. Support bus design changes so that air conditioning and heat do not require idling. Look at other situations where buses congregate and idle where there are large numbers of people (e.g., airports) to see whether a similar ban would be warranted.* Mr. Hess suggested changing “ban” to “regulation” because this week the California Air Resources Board (CARB) will consider adoption of a regulation to reduce diesel bus idling, which the District supports. Chairperson Zamora called for public comment:

Linda Weiner, ALA

stated that for the last three years she has been working with San Francisco MUNI on the conversion of its bus fleet from diesel to alternative fuel. MUNI had previously agreed to retrofit the diesel half of its fleet with particulate traps but has not yet done so, despite having indicated otherwise to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors. Recently, MUNI prepared a two-year particulate trap retrofit plan. The ALA has asked it be reduced to one-year given the practicality of doing so.

No. 9: *reconsider the use of emissions credits for PM reductions.*

No. 10: *(Additions e.g. from the Technical Committee re: particulate trap retrofit program for public transit buses?)*

Ms. Blake proposed the following revisions to the foregoing recommendations:

- No. 1: add after the first sentence: “We strongly urge a several year plan be developed and put in place with milestones towards the PM_{2.5} air quality sub index of 40 mg/m³.” Delete “at” before “which” in line four.
- No. 8: delete “support a ban” and replace with “continue its support for a CARB regulation”

In discussion, Ms. Blake suggested the District make arrangements with health education departments at local colleges for a student project to augment the District’s social marketing for health in the event the District opts to phase-in a lower PM program threshold. The District should also continue to seek funding for targeted change-out programs and other incentive efforts. Mr. Ding suggested the recommendations include suggesting the District work with schools, media and legislative groups in Sacramento. Efforts by Senator Byron Sher to promote the use of recycled computer parts has had little impact until the publication of a three-part series by the *San Jose Mercury News*, after which Hewlett-Packard reversed its recycling-unfriendly policies. Ms. Blake noted the articles were written because of the efforts of the Silicon Valley Toxics Group.

Ms. Blake referred to an e-mail from District staff members David Fairley, Ph.D., and Thomasina Mayfield, which contains an abstract from an unpublished EPA study of woodsmoke in the Bay Area. The abstract sets forth the emission factors for toxic pollutants when burning certain fuels. It would be helpful to be able refer to the contents of this text if it is published by the January Retreat. The Committee expressed its consensus on including this information as an addendum.

Chairperson Zamora stated he would entertain a motion to endorse these changes and allow Ms. Blake to make other conceptual as changes discussed today for inclusion in the agenda packet of the January Retreat. So moved by Mr. Ding; seconded by Ms. Seleznow; carried.

- 6. Committee Member Comments/Other Business.** Chairperson Zamora stated that at the Retreat the Committee would develop its work plan for the year. In the interim, Committee members should think about its contents. Chairperson-Elect Hanna clarified that at the Council Executive Committee meeting that will precede the Retreat, staff will provide further input on the issues for which it is requesting Council advice. The Executive Committee will then assign the study topics to the Standing Committees. During the working lunches the Committees may generate additional topics, give priority to them, and then report out on their final work plans to the full Council.

Chairperson Zamora inquired as to the staff's interest in fence line monitoring. Mr. Hess replied that this issue arose in connection with community outreach meetings for the Clean Air Plan. It concerns the ability of community members near a major facility such as a refinery to access the District's website for on-line, real-time and speciated air quality data concerning emissions crossing the fence line. A guest speaker from Texas will address the Committee on the state-of-the-art for such equipment. Ms. Blake stated that staff from the Contra Costa County Health Department would also be interested in giving a presentation on this matter. This would broaden the Committee's perspective and information base.

Chairperson Zamora added that the Council has been asked to provide its input on the possible development of a greenhouse gases emissions inventory in the region. In reply, Ms. Salaver suggested the District could start a recognition program for those cities that have completed a greenhouse gas inventory and reduce emissions of greenhouse gases in the region.

Mr. Ding suggested that Bay Area TV media routinely broadcast an icon on air quality.

Chairperson Zamora thanked Jane Seleznow for her two years of frank and energetic service on the Council. Ms. Seleznow urged the Committee to work with the full Advisory Council to evaluate and improve the role of the Council at the District.

- 7. Time and Place of Next Meeting.** Chairperson Zamora stated this would be determined at the January 8, 2003 Council Retreat.

- 8. Adjournment.** 2:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

James N. Corazza
Deputy Clerk of the Boards