

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
10:00 a.m., Wednesday, July 14, 2004

CALL TO ORDER Chairperson Blake called the meeting to order at 10:09 a.m.

Opening Comments There were none.

Roll Call Present: Elinor Blake, Chairperson, Sam Altshuler, P.E., Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Sanjiv Bhandari, Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Emily Drennen, Fred Glueck, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Norman A. Lapera, Jr., Kevin Shanahan, Victor Torreano, Linda Weiner.

Absent: Diane Bailey, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., William Hanna, Stan Hayes, Brian Zamora.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD There were no public comments.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. **Approval of Minutes of March 10, 2004.** Dr. Holtzclaw requested that in the sixth bullet on page three “to” be added prior to “explicate.” Mr. Altshuler moved approval of the minutes as corrected; seconded by Dr. Holtzclaw; carried unanimously. Mr. Altshuler added that although the speaker on indoor air quality may have referred to a “little smog factory within the home” the statement is incorrect from a technical and scientific point of view and sends the wrong message. Smog, most commonly associated with ozone, is not as significant an indoor air quality pollutant as other pollutants generated within the home such as hydrocarbons, oxides of nitrogen and particulate matter.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

2. **Report of the Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of June 15, 2004.** Mr. Brazil stated the Committee has been reviewing the District’s Ozone Control Strategy development. The Committee has not yet adopted recommendations but will meet on Tuesday, August 3 at 1:30 p.m. to discuss and develop them for subsequent submittal to the Advisory Council on September 8.

3. **Report of the Public Health Committee Meeting of May 12, 2004.** Ms. Weiner stated the Committee discussed the District’s Toxics New Source Review program, for which the final rule-making has been postponed. The Committee also discussed the Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) program and adopted some recommendations that will be presented to the Council today. The next meeting of the Committee is scheduled for Monday, August 9 at 1:30 p.m.

4. **Report of the Technical Committee Meeting of June 3, 2004.** Dr. Bedsworth stated the Committee received staff presentations on nitrogen oxide (NOx) controls and the state’s Emission Factor (EMFAC) 2002 model. The Committee will adopt recommendations on the District’s Ozone Control Strategy on August 4 at 1:30 p.m. Thereafter, it will then address alternate fuels.

5. **Report of the Executive Committee Meeting of July 14, 2004.** Chairperson Blake stated the Committee met this morning and the Committee Chairs have reported on what was discussed. On September 8 the Council will recommendations for staff on the 2004 Ozone Strategy, which will be reviewed by the Governing Board in November. Public meetings on the document will be held throughout the Bay Area in the fall. The full Council will receive a presentation in November on the Smog Check II program on which the council made recommendations last year.

PRESENTATIONS

6. **Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE).** Scott Lutz, Air Quality Engineering Manager, stated that for the next fiscal year the Board recently approved approximately \$500,000 in funding for this program, which includes a new atmospheric modeler position. The District has purchased some additional monitoring and analytical equipment, and will contract with professional services for analysis of filter media. The District will reallocate existing resources as well. The program will establish diesel PM exposure trends, analyze risk from toxic air contaminants on a community basis, derive risk reduction strategies and obtain input from and outreach to the communities.

Reviewing the history of ambient monitoring by the District and the California Air Resources Board (CARB) for toxic air contaminants in the Bay Area since 1985, Mr. Lutz noted that the risk attributable to ambient toxics has dropped from 315 in a million in 1994 to 173 in a million in 2001, excluding diesel particulate matter (PM). CARB has estimated average statewide risk attributable to diesel PM dropped from 900 in a million in 1990 to 540 in a million in 2000. Such risk reductions are attributable to new vehicle emission standards, clean diesel fuel and reformulated gasoline, toxics new source review, and airborne toxic control measures applied to dry cleaning facilities and chrome plating operations.

The technical foundation of the CARE program will focus on the sampling and measurement of PM samples. Carbon 14 dating will be used to analyze the samples, which will be factored for temporal and seasonal variation and speciated for elemental and organic carbon constituents. Mr. Lutz noted estimates are that 75% of the ambient air risk is from diesel PM and, when combined with other mobile source toxics, the ambient air risk from diesel PM is about 90%.

The District is analyzing PM filter media from the 21 toxic air contaminant monitoring stations in the network. Equipment that distinguishes elemental from organic carbon is being installed in the District's chemistry laboratory. Data for all toxics emissions from mobile, point and area sources will be inputted into a one square kilometer gridded map for the entire Bay Area. The state's mobile source emission factor model, as well as a model from Caltrans, will be utilized in conducting air dispersion modeling for purposes of preparing a risk assessment. Based on areas of concern identified in the gridded map, a pilot cumulative risk assessment for stationary sources will be conducted in a selected area. Carbon emission inventory trends will be compared with ambient measurements, incorporating all current and future effective control measures and their impact on current ambient carbon levels. Staff will subsequently develop and implement area specific risk reduction measures for targeted areas, both in incentive-based and regulation-based programs.

Items on the legislative and regulatory horizon include low sulfur diesel fuel, heavy-duty diesel exhaust emission standards, the toxics new source review, and new or modified rules to reduce toxic emissions from area sources such as dry cleaners, gas stations, chrome plating. The District is also seeking authority to regulate heavy-duty diesel fleets as well as trains.

In reply to questions from Council members, the following responses were provided by District staff members Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, Peter Hess, Deputy APCO, Gary Kendall, Technical Division Director, and Mr. Lutz:

- The CARE program will help identify the drivers of air toxic risk and help the District to determine where resources should be applied to obtain the greatest air toxic risk reduction.
- With regard to chemical markers for fuel additives and lube oil, the analysis will include all sources of carbon and allocate them either to the elemental or organic categories.
- In assessing data from other regional or local air toxics studies or programs, the District plans to coordinate with the county and state health departments.
- The CARE program focuses primarily on the risk from breathing ambient air and will not take into account the larger variety of factors deriving from personal lifestyle choices.
- The impact of heavy-duty diesel truck traffic across the California/Mexican border is best dealt with by seeking to cooperate with the federal Environmental Protection Agency and CARB.
- The CARE emissions estimates and analysis will be done broadly on grid for the entire Bay Area based on sampling data and modeling. The more focused risk assessment will be limited to a specific one kilometer region. There will be a Bay Area wide characterization of risk including stationary sources and mobile sources but the specific area cumulative risk analysis will be assessed based on a variety of different factors including the compaction of sources and will account for detailed meteorological data and terrain features on a block-by-block basis.
- The characterization of risk for the public will be in the context of a programmatic tool for best estimates and other risks, which will guide funding, regulation, rule-making.
- Low sulfur diesel fuel, which will further reduce emissions of diesel PM from newer engines and abatement equipment on older engines is becoming increasingly available. As of 2007, all diesel fuel will have to conform with low sulfur requirements. The transition to this type of fuel is comparable with the transition from leaded to unleaded gasoline a number of years ago.

Ms. Weiner stated that the Public Health Committee reviewed the CARE program and recommends that (1) before the data is gathered, in initial planning phase, staff meet with interested stakeholders to help develop data evaluation, criteria for community involvement, definition of disproportionately impacted communities; (2) a member of the Public Health Committee be included on the project steering committee; (3) that a District public outreach staff person with specific qualifications be assigned to this project.

In discussion, the Council members offered the following observations:

- greater attention might be given to the outreach component of the CARE program, comparable, perhaps to the level of preparation for the technical side. (Bedsworth)
- in terms of the emissions inventory, emissions from solvents and paints, and PM emissions from road dust, may be more significant than previously thought. (Bedsworth) Mr. Lutz replied that there is an emission inventory group working on the project and it will be consulted on this.
- the Technical Committee should examine the pros and cons of biodiesel fuel. (Shanahan) Dr. Bedsworth replied that the topic of alternate fuels has been assigned to the Technical Committee and that biodiesel can be included in the review process.

- the CARE project would benefit from greater public outreach right now, while assembling an advisory committee. (Blake) Mr. Broadbent replied that the District will hire a Community Relations Manager who will report to the Executive Officer and handle this task. Mr. Hess noted that Mr. Broadbent has spoken about CARE with Bay Area editorial review boards.
- perhaps the new Community Relations Manager could be entitled “Health Effects Officer” as in the South Coast AQMD. (Altshuler) Mr. Broadbent replied that the functions of the latter position are somewhat different from those envisioned for the Community Relations Manager.

7. Air & Waste Management Association (A&WMA) Annual Exhibition & Meeting. Chairperson Blake deferred this item to the September 8 Advisory Council Regular meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO. Mr. Broadbent stated:

The District’s Spare the Air program is under way. Using federal Congestion Management Air Quality funds there will be free morning commutes in the Bay Area on Spare the Air days. There are also plans to wrap a BART train to advertise the Spare the Air program.

District staff discussed fuel cell technology with a number of stakeholders last Friday and received many excellent suggestions.

The state’s budget has not yet been finalized. Staff will provide recommendations to the Governing Board once the reduction in property tax revenue is known. The District has adopted its budget for FY 04-05 and felt it important to have it in place apart from the state budget situation.

9. Report of Advisory Council Chair. Chairperson Blake stated she met with Mr. Broadbent last week and discussed the issue of indoor air quality.

10. Council Member Comments/Other Business. Mr. Dawid inquired if the District will be included in the Joint Policy Committee (SB 849) with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) and the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG). Mr. Broadbent responded that there are a number of proposals for representation on this Committee, including one that would add the Bay Conservation & Development Commission and the Regional Water Quality Control Board.

In reply to Mr. Shanahan, Mr. Broadbent replied that there are proposals to increase funding for the Carl Moyer program by modifying the Smog Check program and adding a fee of \$1 per tire for disposal purposes.

Ms. Weiner complimented staff on a first-rate Spare the Air media campaign.

11. Time and Place of Next Meeting. 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, September 8, 2004, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

12. Adjournment. The meeting was adjourned at 12:00 noon.

James N. Corazza
Deputy Clerk of the Boards