

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Public Health Committee Meeting
10:00 a.m., Tuesday, February 14, 2006

1. **Call to Order – Roll Call.** Chairperson Bramlett called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Present: Jeffrey Bramlett, Chairperson, Diane Bailey, Steven Kmucha, M.D., Victor Torrealano, Linda Weiner, Brian Zamora. Absent: Cassandra Adams.
2. **Public Comment Period.** There were no public comments.
3. **Approval of Minutes of October 24, 2005.** Chairperson Torrealano moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Mr. Zamora; carried unanimously.
4. **Woodsmoke Abatement Efforts and Results, and Identification of Best Practices.** *Staff provided a presentation on woodsmoke outreach and education at the District, as well as woodsmoke abatement efforts in the San Joaquin Valley and Puget Sound Air Districts.*

Peter Hess, Deputy APCO, introduced the item and stated that this is a two-part presentation. Mr. Hess stated that Jack Colbourn, Senior Policy Advisor, will provide an overview of the current program and the survey results. Janet Glasgow, Air Quality Program Manager, will provide information on woodsmoke abatement efforts in other locations and the current program.

Mr. Colbourn presented his report and reviewed the wood smoke outreach messages. The messages are:

- Stop burning wood! Pollute less by using cleaner fuels to heat your home.
- Switch to a gas fireplace or insert for the health of your family.
- If you must burn wood, burn less.
- Don't use your fireplace on Spare the Air Nights.
- Urge your city or county to adopt the model Wood Smoke Ordinance.

Advertising included the following:

- Radio: 60 second ad aired on KCBS, KFOG, KLLC, and KSAN.
- Television: 30 second ad on Comcast and WB20.
- Print: ¼ page display ads in the *San Francisco Chronicle*.
- Outdoor: 60 foot banner over the Treasure Island tunnel and billboards on highway 101 and Mill Valley.
- Events: Jumbotron and tabling at Cal sports events, Boo at the Zoo, and Jingle Jam.

The Committee listened to a tape of Jack Broadbent's radio message and viewed the KPIX health video on asthma and a segment that ran in both Mandarin and Cantonese that was translated by Air District spokesperson Dr. Steve Soong. Mr. Colbourn noted that plans for the future include a multi-lingual message that would include Spanish, Vietnamese and Tagalog.

Media coverage included spots on numerous radio stations; news stories on KTVU, KPIX, and Univision; and articles about wood smoke prevention published in newspapers throughout the region.

Luna Salaver, Public Information Officer, coordinator of the Spare the Air Program, discussed the wintertime Program. Ms. Salaver stated that in the Bay Area this winter the Federal Particulate Matter (PM) standard of 2.5 was not exceeded. The winter program started on November 14, 2005 and will end on February 17, 2006.

Ralph Borrmann, Public Information Officer, reviewed the woodstove change out program. Mr. Borrmann stated that money for the program comes from the mitigation of two power plants in Santa Clara County and that the Air District administers the Program. The woodstove change-out program is only in Santa Clara County and the rebates run from \$100 to \$300. It is a voluntary program and 1,673 change-outs have been completed to date. The change-out program should run about one more year and at the end of the program, there will be a reduction in emissions of approximately 30,000 tons.

Emily Hopkins, Public Information Officer, reviewed the model woodsmoke ordinance efforts. Ms. Hopkins stated that 40 cities and eight of the nine counties have adopted woodsmoke ordinances.

Mr. Colbourn next reviewed the mid-season wintertime telephone survey and noted that the final survey would be completed by April 1, 2006. The Committee discussed several aspects of the survey and Mr. Colbourn noted that the survey is very detailed and the mid-season results cover only a portion of the survey. In discussions of the woodsmoke ordinance, Mr. Colbourn reiterated that 40 cities have adopted ordinances and that there are 60 cities and one county that have not adopted a woodsmoke ordinance.

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research, stated that the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) documents that are received by the Air District include a component to adopt a resolution on a woodsmoke ordinance if the city does not already have one.

Mr. Zamora recommended that the Air District contact and work with the local health departments on the importance of this issue.

Janet Glasgow, Air Quality Program Manager, presented a report on woodsmoke abatement efforts in other areas. Ms. Glasgow reviewed all air pollution complaints and noted that woodsmoke complains are 1% of the total. Open burning is covered under District Regulation 5, but residential heating and cooking are not included in the District's Regulation.

The greatest complaints for fireplaces and woodsmoke are received from November through February. The Air District is dispatching inspectors when a complaint comes in. A woodsmoke pilot monitoring program was established last year and covers Mill Valley, Concord and Santa Rosa.

Ms. Glasgow reported that the Air District has been reviewing programs set up by other districts to see how this Air District could develop a program of its own. The Puget Sound Clean Air Agency and San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District programs were reviewed. The program for Puget Sound includes a burn ban, complaint process, promotion of local ordinances, prohibition of new uncertified devices, and it promotes public education. The San Joaquin Valley program includes episodic curtailment, restriction as to the type of fuel burned, a complaint process, prohibition of new or used uncertified devices, and a limit on density of devices.

Ms. Glasgow reviewed the District's action plan, which includes continuing the surveys conducted by the Public Outreach Division, continue working on adoption of woodsmoke ordinances, and look at the programs other air districts have. To help educate the public, workshops and community meetings need to be held to help change people's behavior.

Gary Kendall, Director of Technical Services, reviewed the winter pilot sampling program for woodsmoke. Mr. Kendall explained the monitoring process and noted that the program uses hand-held portable monitors in Mill Valley, Concord and Santa Rosa. Teams of inspectors are dispatched and pinpoint the location of the measurements with the use of a GPS device. Graphics are available on the results of the monitoring and staff will make them available to the Advisory Council if they so desire.

In response to questions by the Committee, Ms. Glasgow stated that the Puget Sound Agency does not have density restrictions, but a prohibition of sales of new devices. They have a change-out program and they try to target them to the most problematic areas. The surcharge on new woodburning devices is spent on public education.

Mr. Zamora requested staff provide the Committee with the document regarding model ordinances for woodsmoke. During discussion there was concern about the effect on low income families and using their fireplaces for heating and the resulting health effects.

Mr. Hess noted that some homes have gas, but people choose to use a woodburning stove for heating rather than propane, which costs more. It was noted that the survey covers a variety of questions and when the survey is completed, the list of questions will be provided to the Advisory Council. Ms. Bailey requested cost comparison data to heat with wood, propane, and gas.

Speaker: The following individual came forward to speak on this item:

Jenny Bard
American Lung Association
Redwood Empire Branch
Santa Rosa, CA 95404

Ms. Bard stated that the American Lung Association is working with the Air District to educate people and get woodsmoke ordinances adopted. Ms. Bard noted that the ordinances do not ban wood burning. Ms. Bard discussed calling a Spare the Air Tonight advisory at a lower standard and commented that when smoke impacts a neighborhood, it is a public health issue.

Chair Bramlett thanked Ms. Bard for addressing the Committee.

In response to Mr. Zamora, Mr. Hess stated that the Air District would invite people from the Puget Sound Clean Air Agency and the San Joaquin Valley APCD to speak to the Committee. Mr. Zamora requested that copies of each of the ordinances from the two agencies be provided to the Committee in advance of the April meeting. Mr. Zamora also noted that it would be helpful to hear from those being impacted by the ordinances, such as the real estate community and companies selling devices that are approved now, but may not be in the future. Mr. Hess stated that the Hearth Products Association might also be invited to speak to the Committee.

Mr. Zamora stated that the Committee should also look at the retrofit issue and that this might be an opportunity to look at planning new development with a required change, and what impact a retrofit would have on people that have homes with wood burning fireplaces. Mr. Hess stated that staff would provide the Committee with information regarding average cost for a retrofit for a fireplace.

5. Discussion of Speaker Schedule for Indoor Air Quality and Asthma: *The Committee discussed with District staff potential guest speaker presentations for its 2006 work plan topic concerning indoor air quality and its relationship to asthma.*

Dr. Kmucha stated that he had some contacts that he has used for other presentations and he would contact them. The Committee determined to devote the April meeting to woodsmoke and that the speakers on the issues of asthma and indoor air quality could make their presentations at the June 13th meeting.

6. Committee Member Comments/Other Business. Ms. Weiner stated that the federal government has released a proposal on standards, which according to public health research, are very weak. On March 8, 2006, the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) will hold hearings in San Francisco, one of three cities hosting the hearings. The other two cities are Philadelphia and Chicago. The American Lung Association is working with other environmental and public health groups to get speakers for that day. Ms. Weiner suggested that someone from the Air District be available for the hearings to make comments on the proposal.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting. 10:00 a.m., Tuesday, April 11, 2006, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

8. Adjournment. 11:29 a.m.

Mary Romaidis

Mary Romaidis
Clerk of the Boards