

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Retreat
And
Meeting of the Public Health Committee
Meeting of the Air Quality Planning Committee
Meeting of the Technical Committee

9:30 a.m., Wednesday, January 10, 2007

CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comments: Chairperson Glueck called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m. Chair Glueck introduced Camille Tavlian, a new member of the Executive Office staff and recording secretary for the meeting.

Roll Call: Present: Fred Glueck, Chair, Sam Altshuler, P.E., Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Ken Blonski, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Emily Drennen, MPH, William Hanna, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Janice Kim, M.D., Ph.D., Steven Kmucha, M.D., Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, MPH, Ed Proctor, Linda Weiner, Brian Zamora.

Absent: Cassandra Adams

Chairperson Glueck welcomed Board of Directors' Chairperson Mark Ross to the Advisory Council meeting and stated that the Advisory Council looks forward to working together with the Board on joint issues in 2007. Chairperson Ross thanked the Advisory Council for their time and work on the important issues before them.

COMMENDATION/PROCLAMATION

Chairperson Glueck recognized and praised the work and expertise of Kraig Kurucz, outgoing Chairperson of the Advisory Council. Mr. Kurucz stated it was a pleasure to serve the Advisory Council as Chairperson and acknowledged the fine work of the committees and new members.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:

None

CONSENT CALENDAR:

- 1. Approval of Minutes of November 8, 2006.** Dr. Borenstein moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Dr. Holtzclaw; carried unanimously.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

As a preface to the Committee Reports, Chairperson Glueck recognized the new officers of the Advisory Council: Louise Bedsworth (Assistant Chair) and Harold Brazil (Secretary), as well as the committee chairs: Ken Blonski (Air Quality Planning Committee), Sam Altshuler (Technical Committee) and Jeff Bramlett (Public Health Committee). He thanked them for their assistance as well as willingness to serve.

- 2. Public Health Committee Meeting of December 12, 2006.** Mr. Bramlett stated that the Committee continues its work on indoor air quality and asthma. The Committee will be following up with the County and City Health Officers Association asking for their participation and/or their assistance in determining appropriate staff contacts.

Chairperson Glueck requested a moment to recognize District staff for their attendance, wished them a happy New Year, and apologized for not interjecting this comment earlier in the meeting.

- 3. Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of December 14, 2006.** Mr. Blonski stated that the Committee had their last meeting under the direction of Stan Hayes, who was leading the Committee on the path of an understanding of their carbon footprint and the ramifications of a larger application for it. The Committee also received a presentation on "Spare the Air Tonight 2007" given by Karen Schkolnick, spokesperson for the Air District, who gave the Committee a better understanding of some of the changes in the program. Meeting minutes were not available as of the date of the meeting, but would be forthcoming. He stated the Committee looks forward to carrying out the work started by Stan Hayes, as well as exploring other topics.
- 4. Technical Committee Meeting of August 9, 2006.** Mr. Altshuler stated that the Technical Committee did not have a meeting in December. The Committee has a request into Jean Ospital, Public Health Officer from South Coast Air Quality Management District, as an upcoming speaker.

Mr. Dawid asked if the Bay Area Air Quality Management District had a Public Health Officer position. Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, stated the District does not have an individual with that particular title; however, the District does have a toxicologist and other staff trained in public health.

- 5. Round Table Discussion with Air District Management on Key Issues Facing the District and Proposed Assignments to the Council**
Chairperson Glueck recognized Mr. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, who wished the Advisory Council a happy New Year on behalf of the staff. Mr. Broadbent also welcomed Mr. Glueck as the new chairperson of the Advisory Council and stated staff looks forward to supporting the Advisory Council and a productive year ahead. Mr. Broadbent also thanked

Mr. Kurucz (past chair) for his leadership of the Advisory Council and the progress made in the past year.

Mr. Broadbent highlighted the key issues and programs for recommended study by the Advisory Council as follows.

1. Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE Program)

The District began the third phase of this multi-year program. Through this effort, the District is attempting to characterize and determine the health risk in communities in and around the Bay Area from breathing the air in areas that are impacted more than most by stationary and mobile sources. Findings to date presented to the Advisory Council and Board of Directors have identified some areas that experience elevated diesel particulate, as noted in and around the Port of Oakland from a concentration of traffic from ships, trucks and trains. These findings point to areas to which staff needs to expend additional resources, as well as conduct additional regulatory discussion on ways to address the elevated risk levels. Mr. Broadbent stated this area continues to be a very high public health priority for the District and the Advisory Council can assist in continuing the scientific research and identifying mitigation measures.

2. Particulate Matter (PM) Control and Wood Smoke Strategy

Mr. Broadbent stated that the Advisory Council has been extremely helpful in the past year in examining work in this area and advising the District of the direction to be taken in the area of wood smoke, a significant and controversial public health issue. He stated that the District has examined efforts in other areas, such as San Joaquin County and Puget Sound, but is challenged to come up with a strategy that fits the Bay Area.

Mr. Broadbent stated that since November 20, 2006, the District has had approximately 15-16 days in exceedance of the new federal national ambient air quality standard (35 micrograms/cubic meter standard). Wood smoke, particularly in a cold, dry season represents a significant fraction of the elevated PM levels experienced in the Bay Area during the winter time. He commented that the work to date by the Advisory Council has been phenomenal and should continue.

3. “Spare the Air Tonight”

This program represents a mitigation measure for the PM and wood smoke issue, in which residents are encouraged not to burn wood. Mr. Broadbent stated that, unlike the “Spare the Air” program during the summer months where an increase in ridership is visible on BART and other transit operators, it is difficult to assess effectiveness of this program because it involves asking residents not to burn. Complicating this issue is the affordability issue of burning wood versus running electric heaters on cold nights. He asked the Advisory Council for their assistance in identifying potential mitigation measures for this program to increase its effectiveness.

4. Indoor Air Quality

Mr. Broadbent stated the Advisory Council has done significant work in this area to date. He added District staff is particularly interested in linking efforts currently underway (CARE and other programs) to informing the general public of steps they can take to improve air quality in their homes and offices.

5. Climate Protection

Mr. Broadbent stated the District has taken a leadership role in climate protection and plans to continue this forward momentum. He requested the Advisory Council's assistance in determining future steps to implementing AB32. He also suggested it would be worth considering having staff from CARB or California EPA to brief the Advisory Council as efforts are being made to move forward in the implementation of this legislation.

As a result of the District's Climate Summit on November 10, 2006, Mr. Broadbent stated that District staff also requests ideas from the Advisory Council for recommendation to the Board of Directors in the area of climate protection. He commented that the Board has also established a separate standing committee in this area (previously an ad hoc committee), whose first meeting will be on January 18.

Mr. Broadbent stated District staff finds the Advisory Council most effective in exploring options, charting a course and advising the Board of Directors on where the District should be moving forward as an organization. He stated District staff is most effective in addressing the technical and policy details.

Ms. Weiner provided an update on the climate change issue. She stated that the environmental and public health groups were meeting in Sacramento during the week to develop early action measures for a January 22, 2007 meeting of California Air Resources Board (ARB). She stated that implementation of AB32 is progressing rapidly. She also stated that the Clean Cars campaign is working on the 1493 court case coming up in Federal District Court in Fresno on January 30, 2007. This decision will affect AB32.

Ms. Weiner also described an agreement to share research data between staff and the Environmental Health Collaborative. Mr. Broadbent stated he is working with Amy Cohen to establish a meeting date.

Mr. Altshuler commented on "Spare the Earth" mitigation measures to complement "Spare the Air."

Mr. Kurucz asked staff if there was a particular subcommittee recommended to handle the wood smoke strategy and the emission measures. Mr. Peter Hess, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, recommended a split assignment for the Technical Committee in examining the filter data and strategies for attainment and the Public Health Committee, which has devoted much of their work over the last year to strategy.

Dr. Bornstein asked on what basis the District called a "Spare the Air Tonight." Mr. Broadbent stated it is based on a model forecast on staff's prediction of when the standard will be exceeded. Mr. Kendall added further it is a combination of continuous PM readings through 9:00 am in the morning, considering the day's meteorology, and past experience in order to make a forecast.

Mr. Altshuler stated he would be interested in looking at the issues where competition exists between climate control and air quality, for example CO₂ and particulate matter. Mr. Broadbent stated that, as is CARB's perspective, the District places public health first

and in taking the lead in climate control does not want to compromise the gains made in air quality. Therefore, what is needed is to integrate climate control measures into the overall regulatory framework that exists, assuring that limits such as CO₂ are maintained, while addressing energy efficiency standards in order to make progress in the area of stationary sources.

Mr. Broadbent added that the Code of Conduct, which is provided annually, had been supplied to the Advisory Council members for their reference and review.

Ms. Drennen thanked staff for making the Code of Conduct gender neutral and added that under Article II, No. 1, there remained one additional reference to “his” which should be changed to gender neutral as well. This change will be added to the next Advisory Council agenda for discussion.

Chairperson of the Board of Directors, Mark Ross requested to address the Advisory Council. He thanked the Council for their dedication of time to improving air quality. He noted their efforts in the CARE program, the PM and wood smoke program, “Spare the Air” and “Spare the Air Tonight” programs. He praised their assistance to the Board in identifying risks and solutions to important public health issues, as well as getting the public into action. He offered his contact information and accessibility to all Advisory Council members.

Chairperson Glueck thanked Chairperson Ross for his comments to the Advisory Council.

Mr. Dawid asked Chairperson Ross what his views were on behalf of the Board of Directors about a mandatory “no-burn” day. Chairperson Ross acknowledged his support for it in some form, stating the wood smoke issue was a pernicious problem as serious as the health problems posed by refineries. However, he did acknowledge the conflict of addressing health concerns vs. the perception of “stepping into people’s living rooms” to address it. He asked the Advisory Council for their assistance in developing a strategy to take to the Board which the Board could bring to the Bay Area as a whole.

Chairperson Glueck solicited comments from the Advisory Council members regarding additional topics for study by the individual committees in addition to those proposed by Mr. Broadbent.

Ms. Drennen suggested a study of mobile sources and initiatives, with an emphasis on reducing auto usage, promoting walking and possibly land use. She added it would also be helpful hearing from the Mobile Source Committee for guidance.

Mr. Dawid suggested Indirect Source Review and Remote Sensing Data (RSD). He added both are on the forefront for getting the gross polluters off the road and indirectly examining land use patterns.

Mr. Dawid also suggested re-examining free transit on “Spare the Air Days” in that it actually had in effect produced additional transit trips and did not represent the most effective use of the limited funds available for the program.

Mr. Dawid also asked to look further into diesel cars, which are expected to exceed the level of hybrids on the road.

Dr. Bornstein asked if there would be time to look at changes to the way the committees interact, particularly in their recommendations to the Board. Specifically, he wished to look at ways to improve documentation especially where it involved specific recommendations. Chairperson Glueck stated he would pursue this as a procedural item with staff, identify potential options and return to the Advisory Council for discussion.

Dr. Bornstein also suggested more cross membership among the committees.

Chairperson Glueck led a summary discussion among the members on the suggested committee assignments for the study topics presented, including joint committee assignments and joint speakers to address the committees on topics of interest.

1. CARE Program
 Technical Committee
 Public Health Committee

2. PM Control
 Technical Committee
 Air Quality Planning Committee

3. 'Spare the Air'
 Air Quality Planning Committee
 Public Health Committee

4. Indoor Air Quality
 Public Health Committee
 Technical Committee
 Air Quality Planning Committee

Mr. Broadbent clarified the Advisory Council recommendations to the Board in this area should focus on monitoring and not proposals for regulation.

5. Climate Protection
 Technical Committee
 Air Quality Planning Committee

6. Mobile Source Issues
 Air Quality Planning Committee
 Technical Committee

7. Indirect Source Review
 Planning

8. Remote Sensing Devices (RSD)
 Technical

9. Diesel Cars
Technical

Dr. Bornstein asked Mr. Broadbent if staff had any interested at re-examining ozone with respect to the new standard and interbase and transport. Mr. Broadbent stated it remains an important topic and would be an appropriate topic for the Technical Committee, subject to the Committee's time and priorities.

Mr. Altshuler asked if the new NO₂ standard from the Air Resources Board (ARB) and efforts to achieve it should be an appropriate topic for the Advisory Council. Mr. Kendall clarified Mr. Altshuler was referring to the ARB one-hour standard, changed from .25 and .18 to a new annual standard of .03. Mr. Kendall stated that staff had examined monitoring data and the last time either one of the proposed levels was exceeded was 1985. Therefore, while staff supports ARB's efforts to modify the standard based upon the health effects, he did not see an issue for the Bay Area.

Mr. Hanna asked for clarification on participation of Advisory Council members who attend committees to which they are not assigned. District counsel, Brian Bunger, advised of an Attorney General's opinion which states that if a member is not on a committee, that member cannot address the committee in any manner, not even as a member of the public; however, members may attend.

Chairperson Glueck announced the committee preferences for each of the Advisory Council members.

Public Health Committee

Jeff Bramlett (Chair)
Cassandra Adams
Robert Bornstein
Janice Kim
Steven Kmucha
Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf
Linda Weiner
Brian Zamora

Technical Committee

Sam Altshuler (Chair)
Louise Bedsworth
Robert Bornstein
William Hanna
John Holtzclaw
Kraig Kurucz

Air Quality Planning

Ken Blonski (Chair)
Harold Brazil
Irvin Dawid
Emily Drennen

William Hanna
John Holtzclaw
Kraig Kurucz
Ed Proctor

In response to a question from Ms. Drennen regarding the new appointments and possible reappointments to the Advisory Council, Mr. Broadbent stated that that the Personnel Committee will meet on January 12, 2007, and their recommendations will be taken to the Board of Director's meeting on January 17, 2007.

6. Chairperson Glueck announced each of the committees would break into a separate working lunch discussion session to discuss their topics as well as dates for meetings for the upcoming year. The following District staff was assigned to work with the committees: Mr. Kendall (Technical Committee, Mr. Bateman (Public Health), and Mr. Hilken (Air Quality Planning Committee). The Advisory Council participated in a group photo. The Committee Chairs chose their respective locations and began their discussions.

Chairperson Glueck adjourned the meeting at 11:20 a.m.

7. Chairperson Glueck reconvened the meeting at 1:12 p.m. All Advisory Council members were present, with the exception of Mr. Brian Zamora and Mr. Kraig Kurucz. A quorum remained among the members.

Discussion ensued among the Committee Chairs with regard to the committee meeting schedules. It was determined that the Committees would meet as follows:

Technical	2 nd Monday of even months with the exception of 2/28 9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.
Public Health	2 nd Wednesday of even months 1:30 p.m. – 3:00 p.m.
Air Quality Planning	2 nd Wednesday of even months 9:30 a.m. – 11:30 a.m.

No combined committee meeting dates were as yet determined.

The chairs of each of the committees presented their priorities for 2007:

Air Quality Planning Committee

Chairperson Blonski presented the following priorities:

1. Climate Protection
 - a) Regulatory (AB 32) – policies and procedures
 - b) Closure on Carbon Footprint
2. Wood burning/Spare the Air Tonight
3. Mobile Sources/Spare the Air Day
4. Indirect Sources
 - a) Land use patterns related to mobile sources, mitigation measures

- Possible speakers: Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG)
- b) Future predictions for the Bay Area

Public Health Committee

Chairperson Bramlett presented the following priorities:

1. Asthma and Indoor Air Quality
 - a) Collaborative environment between District and Public Health Officers
 - b) Policy and practices
2. Spare the Air Tonight
 - a) Public education and outreach in conjunction with Air Quality Planning Committee
3. CARE Program
 - a) Status report of health effects by staff

Technical Committee

Chairperson Altshuler presented the following priorities:

1. CARE Program
 - a) PM issues
 - b) MATES program update (South Coast Air District)
 - c) Is the District on right track with respect to monitoring, cumulative risks, technical aspects?
 - d) Which PM to address and/or control?
Resources: Jean Ospital, South Coast Air District
Phil Martien
Bart Ostro
Tom Cahill
Karen Magliano (ARB)
CRPAQs
2. Climate Change
 - a) Conflicts and Complements Discussion
 - Diesel car
 - 1) Impacts within the Bay Area – temperature, ozone
 - 2) Staff update from Climate Control Summit of November 2006
 - 3) “Spare the Earth” concept
3. Remote Sensing
(Low Priority, as time permits)

Chairperson Glueck reminded the committees to keep in mind for the year their role of assisting the Board of Directors in informing the public and encouraging public participation. Members and District staff engaged in a discussion of how the public may attend and participate more fully in Advisory Council and committee meetings.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Chairperson Glueck thanked the members and staff for their participation and stated he looked forward to a productive year ahead.

9. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Chairperson Glueck announced a correction to the agenda. The Advisory Council will meet on March 14 at 10:00 a.m., not March 7. The Advisory Council would continue to meet the second Wednesday of the odd months.

10. **Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 1:50 p.m.

/s/ Mary Romaidis, for
Camille M. Tavlian
Executive Secretary