

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
10:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 14, 2007

**CALL TO ORDER**

Opening Comments: Chairperson Glueck called the meeting to order at 10:06 a.m.

Chair Glueck introduced new Advisory Council member Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D.

Roll Call: Present: Fred Glueck, Chair, Cassandra Adams (10:28 a.m.), Sam Altshuler, P.E., Ken Blonski, Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Emily Drennen, MPH, William Hanna, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., Janice Kim, M.D., Ph.D., Steven Kmucha, M.D., Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, MPH, Ed Proctor, Linda Weiner (10:53 a.m.), Brian Zamora.

Absent: Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Robert Bornstein, Ph.D.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:** There were none.

**CONSENT CALENDAR:**

**1. Approval of Minutes of January 10, 2007:** Dr. Holtzclaw moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Mr. Hanna. Mr. Altshuler requested that “in lieu of” on page 4 be changed to read “to complement.” Ms. Drennen requested Ms. Bedsworth’s first name be corrected on page 2 and on page 5, paragraph 7 the word “promoting” be added before the word “walking.” Mr. Altshuler moved approval of the minutes as corrected; seconded by Mr. Bramlett; carried unanimously without objection.

**COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**2. Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of February 14, 2007:** Mr. Blonski stated that the Committee reviewed its Mission Statement and priorities set at the Retreat. There were two speakers from staff: Ana Sandoval presented information on carbon offsets and Michael Murphy discussed the Air District’s Mobile Source programs. The plan for the April meeting is to discuss, with staff, the work done by Professor Manuel Pastor of UC Santa Cruz. Professor Pastor would be invited to give a presentation at a future meeting.

3. **Public Health Committee Meeting of February 14, 2007:** Mr. Bramlett stated that the Committee discussed the Spare the Air program and indoor air quality (IAQ) and asthma. The Committee is looking at what role the Air District should take regarding IAQ and asthma and how to interface with the public, health officers, and non-governmental organizations. The discussion also looked at several other areas, such as people working with their health care providers if they have asthma, the scientific relationship between indoor/outdoor air and asthma and where the focus should be, and a coordinated message that represents the Air District's position. The next meeting of the Committee will be on April 11<sup>th</sup> and will focus on any responses from the health officers and a recommendation will then be developed to present to the Council.
  
4. **Technical Committee Meeting of February 28, 2007:** Mr. Altshuler stated that the Committee heard from Dr. Jean Ospital on the South Coast AQMD MATES Program. The MATES Program is similar to the Air District's CARE Program. It is anticipated that a table will be produced comparing the two programs and would be presented to the full Council. A second speaker was from staff, Ana Sandoval, who gave a presentation on the climate protection activities at the Board level. The Committee also discussed how the Council, or the Technical Committee, could complement activities going on at the Board level.

The next meeting of the Committee is scheduled for April 16<sup>th</sup> and Bart Ostro from the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) will give a presentation on monitoring issues focusing on measurements at the Port of Oakland. Members of the Public Health Committee are invited to attend this meeting. After discussion, it was determined a joint meeting of the Committees would not be feasible.

### **Presentation**

5. **Presentation on Air District's Spare the Air Program for 2007:** *Air District staff presented an overview of the Air District's Spare the Air Programs.*

Chairperson Glueck stated that the presentation is based on the APCO's discussion with the Council during the Retreat and the changes that are taking place in the Spare the Air program. One aspect is how the Advisory Council can help develop ideas or efforts to assist in outreach with public information and public participation.

Jack Colbourn, Director of Outreach and Incentives, stated that the Spare the Air program started in 1991 and the free rides program is about four years old. This year, the District is making some changes to promote a Clean Air Choice program and that it is really 365 day a year effort. There will still be components, such as the free ride program and wood stove change outs. The idea is to get people to take responsibility on what they can do to clean the air. There will be outreach to the public on ways they can clean the air, such as a "tip card," that will focus on climate issues and diesel.

Mr. Colbourn noted that some changes have been made in the free ride program this year. There are four days of free rides, which will be for morning commutes only on the ferries, trains and BART; the buses will operate on a full day.

Councilmember Cassandra Adams arrived at 10:28 a.m.

Mr. Colbourn stated that the District is doing long-term surveys and measurements to see what kind of behavior changes there are. The three major priorities this year are climate, wood smoke, and port/diesel emissions and the Spare the Air/Clean Air Choices campaign will focus on these priorities.

The Council had a general discussion on the campaign and how the Council members can carry the message back to the organizations they represent. The Council provided comments and suggestions to staff on several aspects of the campaign.

Councilmember Linda Weiner arrived at 10:53 a.m.

Karen Schkolnick, Air Quality Program Manager, stated that the 2006/2007 Spare the Air Tonight season has just been completed and ran from November 20, 2006 to February 16, 2007. There were 30 advisories called this year, which was a result of the more stringent PM 2.5 standard. The US EPA adopted a more stringent PM 2.5 standard in September 2006, which is more protective of public health (from  $65 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  to  $35 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ ). The focus of the Spare the Air Tonight campaign was to reduce particulate matter through reduction of wood burning emissions and reduction of driving.

Ms. Schkolnick reviewed the PM 2.5 exceedances and reported that there were 30 advisories issued by the Air District and the national 24-hour  $35 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  standard was exceeded 27 times. There is no equivalent state 24-hour standard. The outreach strategy included the following:

- Community events;
- Mailings to the employer network and about 100 asthma clinics;
- The Spare the Air website was updated on a regular basis;
- Continuation of the Santa Clara Woodstove Rebate Program, which is coming to a close; and
- Advertising and collateral materials included:
  - Video commercial featuring the Executive Officer
  - Radio and television advertising
  - Bookmark about particulate matter
  - Tip card about wood burning
  - Handbook about wood burning and particulate matter

Each time the Air District issued an advisory, the public was alerted that the air quality was forecast to be unhealthful and that sensitive individuals should take measures to protect their health. Additional messages to the public to encourage them to make clean air choices were “Don’t burn wood,” “switch to natural gas or EPA certified insert,” and “drive less.” Ms. Schkolnick noted that there was extensive media coverage and reviewed the number of print, television and radio stories resulting from the campaign. There have been 1,945 woodstove change-outs through the Santa Clara County woodstove rebate program; this program will conclude soon. Ms. Schkolnick reported that an expanded telephone survey was conducted that had very positive results. Nine hundred eighty-eight surveys were conducted. Ms. Schkolnick summarized program awareness as a result of the survey.

Ms. Schkolnick provided an update on the Spare the Air summertime outreach program for 2007. The summertime program was created in 1991. There were 11 advisories issued in 2006. The 2007 Program elements include: advertising, public outreach, employers, media

outreach, free transit incentives, a youth outreach campaign, and a web page and *AirAlerts*. Program highlights include free transit on four full-days for regional bus systems and partial-days on BART, CalTrain, and the ferries to alleviate operation service and security issues. The focus of the campaign will be towards positive, long-term behavior changes by promoting clean air choices.

There will be expanded public surveys and on-board measurement to start the process of estimating long-term behavior change and assessing attitude changes regarding clean air choices. The Air District will continue its effort to secure private partners and funding for the 2007 Spare the Air program. Ms. Schkolnick provided examples of what some of the private partners will be doing during the campaign.

Discussion on the campaign included the free transit and making sure it was fair and equitable to people in all areas; how air alerts are sent; linking health and wellness to climate change; and parking charges at BART parking lots on the free transit days (there will still be a charge for parking). The Council discussed ideas for the campaign and provided input to Mr. Colbourn and Ms. Schkolnick.

Chair Glueck commented that all of the programs the Air District is running are interrelated. He thanked Ms. Schkolnick and Mr. Colbourn for their presentations.

### **Council Discussions**

#### **6. Consideration and Approval of an Amendment to the Advisory Council's Code of Conduct:** *The Council considered approval of a revision to its Code of Conduct.*

Chair Glueck stated that a request had been made to change Article 2, Section 1 regarding the gender references. The change would add the word "her" to paragraph 1.

**Council Action:** Dr. Holtzclaw moved to accept the change to Article 2, Section 1 of the Code of Conduct as stated above; seconded by Mr. Bramlett.

Ms. Drennen suggested that the District make all documents gender neutral. The motion then carried unanimously without objection.

### **Air District Overview**

#### **7. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO:** Peter Hess, Deputy APCO, reported on the following:

1. There is CARE Program meeting taking place now and Advisory Council members are invited to attend if they wish.
2. The budget has been prepared and will be submitted to the Board of Directors. The revenue from the county funding has increased; a permit fee increase is being proposed; and the hearings on the budget will take place in June 2007.
3. The District will embark on a technology-enforcing strategy on emissions from food preparation. This will address some of the fine particulate emissions from under-fired grills and chain driven grills. The South Coast AQMD promulgated a rule about eight years ago; the Bay Area District rule includes more sources.

4. Amendments to the internal combustion engine rule will come before the Board of Directors for approval within the next few months.
5. The District is moving forward on the transition from the wintertime to the summertime Spare the Air Program.
6. Mr. Hess announced his retirement from the Air District on July 18, 2007.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **8. Report of Advisory Council Chair:**

Chair Glueck reported that the Executive Committee discussed items brought to the full Council today. The other two items brought up were that the May 9<sup>th</sup> meeting will have Dr. Cahill make a presentation on a study he has done on particulate matter in the train yards in Roseville. For the July meeting, Dr. Pastor will give a presentation on his report "*Still Toxic After All These Years.*"

### **9. Council Member Comments/Other Business**

In response to a question from Mr. Dawid, Mr. Hess stated that there is no wireless access in the Board Room.

In response to a question from Mr. Altshuler, Chair Glueck stated that he will discuss with staff Advisory Council attendance at the Air & Waste Management Association annual conference.

Dr. Kmucha noted that a resolution has been submitted to the City of Belmont that would make their non-smoking ordinances some of the strictest in the country. Dr. Kmucha inquired if this is something the Council could consider supporting. Chair Glueck stated that it would be difficult to comment at this time. The Public Health Committee is addressing IAQ, but the Council, at this point, is not prepared to make any comment on the resolution being proposed in the City of Belmont. Ms. Drennen added that several members of the Council that know about this resolution and they could provide updates to the Council. Chair Glueck referred the item to the Public Health Committee.

Mr. Hanna stated that there seems to be a number of people arguing against the human causes of global warming. Mr. Dawid added that the IPCC report states that there is a 90% probability that it is human caused.

Mr. Dawid went to the Bureau of Automotive Repair testing facility with the Sierra Club Air Quality Committee and saw how the visual test is conducted (The Smoking Vehicle Law) and the ARB "pinch test," which deals with evaporative emissions from automobiles. By 2010, the largest cause of emissions is going to be evaporative, not through the tailpipe.

10. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, May 9, 2007, 929 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

11. **Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 11:52 a.m.

*/s/ Mary Romaidis*  
Mary Romaidis  
Clerk of the Boards